



Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
March 13, 2024 1:00 PM
MINUTES

March 13, 2024 Historic District Board of Review Meeting

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Karen Guinn, Chair
Melissa Rowan, Vice Chair
Robert Becker
Michael Higgins
Stan Houle
Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: David Altschiller

MPC Staff Present: Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director (virtually)
Jonathan Mellon, Director of Historic Preservation
Caitlin Chamberlain, Principal Planner
Kelli Mitchell, Senior Planner
Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant
Hind Patel, Information Technology

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[1. Approve the February 14, 2024 Historic District Board of Review Meeting Minutes as presented.](#)

📎 [02.14.24 MEETING MINUTES.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned to approve the February 14, 2024 Historic District Board of Review Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Melissa H. Rowan	
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

[2. Petition of Wubbena Architects | 23-005347-COA | 409 West Taylor Street | Noncontributing Demolition | New Construction, Small: Part I](#)

[📎 Submittal Packet - 409 West Taylor Street.pdf](#)

Motion

Continue

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

[3. Petition of lululemon Athletica | 24-000896-COA | 113-115 West Broughton Street | Alterations](#)

[📎 2024-02-15_Broughton_Historic Submission_Final.pdf](#)

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain

Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

[4. Petition of Bay Waves, Inc. | 24-000053-COA | 1 Bull Street | Illuminated Signs](#)

[📎 Submittal Packet - 1 Bull St..pdf](#)

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins
Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

[5. Petition of J Elder Studio | 24-000902-COA | 3 Martin Luther King Jr., Boulevard & 512 Indian Street | Demolition, New Construction & Addition](#)

[📎 3 MLK Hotel- Cover Letter_ 2-15-24.pdf](#)

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins
Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

[6. Petition of Pantheon Architecture | 24-000885-COA | 106 West Gwinnett Street | Rehabilitation & Alterations](#)

- 🔗 [Submittal Packet Pt 1 - 106 W. Gwinnett St.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Submittal Packet Pt 2 - 106 W. Gwinnett St.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Staff Report - 24-000885-COA 106 W Gwinnett.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Staff Research - 106 W. Gwinnett St.pdf](#)

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request of approval to make repairs to the historic apartment building located at 106 West Gwinnett Street. Proposed work is primarily to address water infiltration issues and includes:

- Repair/repointing brick on building and chimney
- New roof membrane
- New emergency roof drains and downspouts
- Remove damaged stucco on parapet, new metal coping
- Repair/replace damaged windows
- Repair/replace damaged exterior doors on ground floor
- New decorative fence

106 West Gwinnett Street (also known as 715 Whitaker Street) was built circa 1920 and is a contributing resource [within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District](#). It first opened as the Forsyth Apartment Hotel and the first Savannah City Directory which the building appears in is 1921, supporting the 1920 construction date.

A brochure from circa 1920 states that the Forsyth Apartment Hotel “offers all the housekeeping joys without the cares.” The six-story structure was built by the G.A. Mercer Company. The rooms initially came fully furnished and the brochure even details the building materials and the companies who furnished them. Specific to the purposes of this report are the John G. Butler Builders Supply Company of Savannah (doors and hardware), A.S. Bacon and Sons of Savannah⁶ (window frames and interior trim), and the Alpha Portland Cement Company (Portland cement).

Staff recommended to approve the request for the proposed repairs and proposed fence at 106 West Gwinnett Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to starting the work, because the proposed project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Once the mortar match is determined, provide the product specifications and a small physical mortar sample to staff.
2. Provide a brick sample for the proposed replacement brick and the fence base.
3. Provide information about how the Prosoco Siloxane PD waterproofing sealer performs on historic brick to ensure it will not cause damage.
4. Include material and product specifications on replacement doors.
5. Select a historically appropriate wood window for replacements.
6. Include photographic detail as well as information on the drawings to show which windows and doors will be replaced.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Caitlin Corliss, petitioner, thanked staff for recommendations and stated they will comply with all conditions. The sealer is meant to be permeable to water to allow breathing.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ms. Ellie Isaacs, Historic Savannah Foundation, expressed concerns with design materials of fencing.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board supports Staff recommendation. **Ms. Rowan** agreed with HSF's stand on the fence and stated the material of aluminum will not look appropriate with the metal ones in the area.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for the proposed repairs and proposed fence at 106 West Gwinnett Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to starting the work, because the proposed project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Once the mortar match is determined, provide the product specifications and a small physical mortar sample to staff.
2. Provide a brick sample for the proposed replacement brick and the fence base.
3. Provide information about how the Prosoco Siloxane PD waterproofing sealer performs on historic brick to ensure it will not cause damage.
4. Include material and product specifications on replacement doors.
5. Select a historically appropriate wood window for replacements.
6. Include photographic detail as well as information on the drawings to show which windows and doors will be replaced.
7. Change the fence material to iron instead of extruded aluminum.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

[7. Petition of Eli Lurie | 24-0000892-COA | 201 West Jones Street | Addition](#)

[📎 Submittal Packet - 201 W Jones St..pdf](#)

[📎 201 W Jones - Staff Research.pdf](#)

[📎 Staff Report - 24-000892 201 W Jones.pdf](#)

[📎 Public Comment - Oglethorpe Plan Coalition Inc. - 201 W. Jones St.pdf](#)

Ms. Kelli Mitchell presented the petitioner's request to remove the exterior brick on the upper story of the two-story rear section of the home facing Barnard Street, construct a rear addition, change the railing on the front stairs, replace the front door and the door in the

privacy wall, and change the garage door on the outbuilding at the property located at 201 West Jones Street. The work on the basement level as well as any work on elevation facing the neighboring property will not be reviewed by staff as the work is not visible from the public right of way. For clarity, the basement level is the ground floor, the first floor is the middle floor (for the primary building and upper level of the rear portion), and the second floor is the upper story of the main structure.

There was question visual compatibility of the addition and hiding a view that has been in existence for 200 years. Mr. Mellon stated there is precedent, however, the Board would make the decision.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Eli Lurie, petitioner, stated they are amenable to staff conditions. No framing or historic fabric is to be removed and believes it fits the fabric of Savannah. The western window will remain, excepting the sill which will be lowered.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ms. Ellie Isaacs, Historic Foundation of Savannah, stated it presents a false sense of history. It is not submissive to the main house, and there will be loss of historical fabric. Nor is it visually compatible, and recommended denial for redesign of height and masonry.

Ms. Sabrina Nagel, area resident, stated the project will be highly visible and does not support the encapsulation of the three windows. The addition is too large and not visually compatible, including materials.

Mr. Steve Edwards, Downtown Neighborhood Association, commended staff research. He stated the project is inconsistent with the style of the existing house; it is too large and not visually compatible. The rear is prominent. The lot coverage is already exceeded; this is encroachment and crowding. He recommended denial.

Mr. Andrew Jones, Oglethorpe Plan Coalition, supported staff recommendation and expressed concern with loss of the three windows, which are character defining features. Highlighted details and stated it will further contribute to Savannah's delisting status.

Mr. Lurie stated the railing was recently added, it is aluminum, thus the replacement of it will be the same. The historic rear is already gone.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Rowan supports the petition, does not suggest denial, possibly continue. **Mr. Thomson** stated the scale of the addition outweighs the main house. **Mr. Higgins** dislikes the project, inappropriate and recommended denial. **Mr. Becker** supported the public comments. **Mr. Houle** agrees that the mass and design of 3rd floor is visually incompatible.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby Deny the application to remove the exterior brick on the upper story of the two-story section of the home facing Barnard Street, construct a rear addition, change the railing on the front stairs, and change the garage door on the outbuilding at the property located at 201 West Jones Street because the project does not meet the Visual Compatibility Standards, is not appropriate in scale or massing, and due to the proposed removal of historic fabric.

Redesign the addition to retain the first-floor masonry wall facing Barnard Street and the window opening and to inset the second-story portion of the addition.

Redesign the window configuration on the first floor rear windows on the addition to have a more traditional configuration.

Select a material that meets the standards for the fiber cement paneling under the windows.

Provide height and distance between banisters for front porch railing.

Provide the final color for the lattice work.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Robert Becker

David Altschiller	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Nay
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

[8. Acknowledgement and approval of Staff-approved petitions.](#)

Motion

Approve

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

[9. Petition of Glenn Keyes | 234-000651-*COA | 18 E Oglethorpe | Amend rear elevator design railings](#)

[📎 SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000651-COA 18 E Oglethorpe.pdf](#)

[10. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 24-000852-COA | 301 East Charlton St | Install brick pavers, addition of stucco porch pillars, and painting of front of property.](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000852-COA 301 E Charlton St.pdf](#)

[11. Petition of Your Exterior Pros | 24-000884-COA | 511 E Hall Street | Selective wood replacement](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000884-COA 511 E Hall St.pdf](#)

[12. Petition of John & Amelia Harper | 24-000875-COA | 421 E Charlton St | Window replacement](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision 24-000875-COA 421 E Charlton St.pdf](#)

[13. Petition of Tran Capital Management | 24-00187-COA | 116 Whitaker Street | Color change](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision 24-00187-COA 116 Whitaker St.pdf](#)

[14. Petition of Seaport Roofing | 24-001097-COA | 530 E Broughton | Roof replacement](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision 530 E Broughton St 24-001097-COA.pdf](#)

[15. Petition of Your Exterior Pros | 254-0008867-COA | 708 - 714 Price Street | Selective in-kind siding and trim repairs; paint](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000886-COA 708-714 Price Street.pdf](#)

[16. Petition of Felder Associates | 24-000856-COA | 27 Barnard Street | Amend previous Board approval and color change](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000856-COA 27 Barnard St.pdf](#)

[17. Petition of Doyle Consulting | 24-000720-COA | 321 West Bay Street | Modify existing telecommunications equipment](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000720-COA 321 W Bay.pdf](#)

[18. Petition of Doyle Consulting | 24-000657-COA | 102 E Liberty Street | Modify existing telecommunications equipment](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000657-COA 102 E Liberty St.pdf](#)

[19. Petition of Ted Edens | 24-000195-COA | 219 East York Street | Color change](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000195-COA 219 E York St.pdf](#)

[20. Petition of GM Shay Architects | 23-006242-COA | 600 East Bay Street](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 23-006242-COA 600 E Bay St.pdf](#)

[21. Petition of Elizabeth Jones | 547 East Macon Street | 24-000819-COA | Door color change](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000819-COA 547 E Macon St.pdf](#)

[22. Petition of SpeediSign | 24-000709-COA | 509 Barnard Street | Vinyl signage on glass doors](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000709-COA 509 Barnard St.pdf](#)

[23. Petition of Lynch Architects | 24-000675-COA | 504 East Bay Street | Handrail replacement and rooftop addition](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000675-COA 504 E Bay St.pdf](#)

[24. Petition of Lynch Architects | 24-000633-COA | 23 W Broughton Street | Amend previous COA to reduce signage height](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 24-000633-COA 23 W BroughtonSt.pdf](#)

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

[25. March 2024 Violations Report](#)

📎 [March 2024 Violations Report.pdf](#)

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

[26. Inspections Completed by Staff - March Report](#)

📎 [Inspections Completed by Staff - March Report.pdf](#)

[27. Stamped Drawings Report- March 2024](#)

📎 [March 2024 Report.pdf](#)

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

[28. Adjourn the March 13, 2024 Historic District Board of Review Meeting](#)

There being no further business to present before the Board, the March 13, 2024 Historic District Board of Review adjourned at 2:04 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jonathan B. Mellon
Director of Historic Preservation and Urban Design

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.