

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street September 13, 2023 1:00 PM MINUTES

September 13, 2023 Historic District Board of Review Meeting

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM in the Mendonsa Hearing Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Ellie Isaacs, Chair

Robert Becker Michael Higgins Stan Houle Melissa Rowan Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: David Altschiller

Karen Guinn Nan Taylor

MPC Staff Present: Melanie Wilson, Executive Director

Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation

Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant Hind Patel, Information Technology

- I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME
- **II. SIGN POSTING**
- **III. CONSENT AGENDA**
 - 1. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 23-003661-COA | 224 West Bay Street | Sign
 - Submittal Packet (Revised) 224 W. Bay St..pdf
 - @ Staff Report 23-003661-COA 224 W Bay St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request to install an externally illuminated sign at 224 West Bay Street with the following condition because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1.Ensure that the sign is mounted through the mortar joints rather than the historic brick.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

2. Petition of Hallett & Co. | 23-004234-COA | 114 Bull Street | Alterations

- Submittal Packet 114 Bull St.pdf
- Staff Report 23-004234-COA 114 Bull St.pdf
- Staff Research 114 Bull St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the proposed addition of two windows and the infill of non-historic stucco for the property located at 114 Bull Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

3. Petition of Felder & Associates | 23-004237-COA | 255 Montgomery Street | Alterations

- Staff Report 23-004237-COA 255 Montgomery St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 23-004237 COA 255 Montgomery St.pdf
- Previous Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve alterations to the property located at 255 Montgomery Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

4. Petition of Stephanie Harris | 23-004220-COA | 120 West Taylor Street | Alterations

- Staff Report 23-004220-COA 120 W Taylor St.pdf
- Staff Research 120 W. Taylor St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 23-004220-COA 120 W. Taylor St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve removal of the non-original wood railing on the stairs to the covered front entrance stoop with a cast iron railing, of the contributing building located at 120 West Taylor Street with the following condition, for staff review and approval prior to starting the work, because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1.Revise drawings to include a detail showing that the space between the balusters is no more than 4" on center.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

5. Petition of SHAH Architecture & Interiors | 23-004239-COA | 147 Bull Street | Alterations

- @ Staff Report 23-004239-COA 147 Bull St.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings 23-004239-COA 147 Bull St.pdf
- Submittal Packet Images 23-004239-COA 147 Bull St.pdf
- Staff Research 147 Bull St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve alterations to a storefront for the property located at 147 Bull Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Provide a stucco mixture that indicates an appropriate mix to cover the historic bricks.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

6. Adopt the September 13, 2023 Agenda

Motion

The HDBR motioned to adopt the September 13, 2023 Meeting Agenda.

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

Motion

The HDBR motioned to adopt the September 13, 2023 Agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Michael Higgins	
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Not Present
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Robert Becker

7. Approve August 9, 2023 Historic District Board of Review Meeting Minutes as presented.

Ø 08.09.23 MEETING MINIUTES.pdf

Motion

The HDBR motioned to approve the August 9, 2023 Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

8. Petition of SHEDDarchitecture | 23-003202-COA | 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard | Non-Contributing Demolition

Motion			
Continue.			

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

9. Petition of Principals of Design | 23-004038-COA | 115 East River Street | Sign

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

10. Petition of A Taco Affair | 23-003629-COA | 401 West Hall Street | Sign

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye

Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Not Present
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

11. Petition of JDH Decks & Fences, Inc. | 23-003664-COA | 20 East Broad Street | Fence

Motion	
Continue.	
Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Thomas L. Thomson	
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Not Present
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

- Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

Robert Becker

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

- 12. Petition of Rose Architects | 23-002530-COA | 301 Alice Street | New Construction, Part II: Design Details
 - Staff Report 23-002530-COA 301 Alice St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 301 Alice Street.pdf
 - Part I Submittal Packet 301 Alice Street.pdf
 - Petitioner Presentation 1.pdf
 - Petitioner Presentation 2.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a single-family residence with a four-car carriage house for the property located at 301 Alice Street. Since the Part I, Height and Mass approval, the fenestration pattern and solid-to-void ratio has changed on the rear façade of the carriage house.

On February 8, 2023, the Historic District Board of Review recommended approval to City Council to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing structure in the National Historic Landmark District; staff's recommendation was for denial.

Then on March 9, 2023, City Council approved the change. 301 Alice Street is now a non-contributing building on the Historic Building Map for the National Historic Landmark District [File No. 22-005388-COA].

On June 14, 2023, the HDBR:

Approved to demolish the building with the following conditions:

- 1. The building shall be deconstructed, rather than demolished, and the historic materials salvaged.
- 2. A Certificate of Appropriateness must first be issued for the new construction of the replacement building prior to approval of the demolition.

Continued New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass to further examine the context and to address the following:

- 1. Door frames and window sashes shall not be inset less than 3 inches from the exterior surface of the façade of the building.
- 2. Eaves on the primary building shall extend no less than 12 inches beyond supporting walls
- 3. Eaves and rakes on accessory buildings and dormers shall overhang at least eight (8) inches.
- 4. The driveway apron shall not be erected on the public right-of-way.
- 5. Curb cuts shall not exceed 20 feet in width.
- 6. The footprint of the accessory dwelling unit shall be a maximum of 40% of the habitable floor area of the principal dwelling. Provide the calculation and ensure the standard is met.

At the July 12, 2023, meeting, the HDBR approved Part I, Height and Mass with the following conditions:

- 1. Door frames shall be inset not less than three (3) inches.
- 2. Driveway aprons shall not be erected on the public right-of-way.

Staff recommended to continue the petition for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a single-family residence with a four-car carriage house for the property located at 301 Alice Street with the following conditions to be submitted to the Board for review within a maximum of 90 days:

- 1. Redesign the exterior color scheme to be visually compatible with contributing buildings to which this building is visually related.
- 2. Revise the zinc standing seam wall paneling on the rear façade of the carriage house to a permitted material.
- 3. Revise the sliding glass doors on the south façade of the main house; sliding glass doors are not permitted where visible from a street.
- 4. Revise the windows surrounding the front entrance to an operable type permitted by the ordinance.
- 5. Provide information regarding rear porch materials.
- 6. Provide light fixture specifications.
- 7. Provide information regarding the trellis material and design.
- 8. The garage doors must resemble carriage house doors.
- 9. Driveway aprons shall not be erected on the public right-of-way.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Kevin Rose stated the project is not a historic replication, it is a building is of its time. They are making a piece of architecture that will last into the future. Many of the conditions have already been addressed. The color proposed has been used in the district previously. Zinc has been used in the district and will use the same standing seam, for them to line up; it will be not the same pattern. The sliding glass doors have been revised to be operable. The windows around the doors are sidelights and transoms, which are fixed - felt that made the most sense. The steel column is only visible at the top. The ceiling and floor will be wood or composite materials. There is a supply chain issue with the lights; will present what can be found. There is not a trellis is not visible from the street. The garage doors are not described in the Ordinance and found the garaged doors on Wayne and Jefferson Streets are flat panels. They would like to mimic what is currently had. The driveway aprons is not being done, it will be a depressed sidewalk and acceptable.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, Oglethorpe Coalition, expressed concerns with project, stating the petitioner has not provided sightline views. He believes the actual information needed is not had to make a decision. He requested the Board continue to provide and meet all requirements.

Mr. Harley Krinski, requested approval from the Board.

Mr. Rose responded to Mr. Jones stated there are photos that show sightlines; they are in compliance.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board was complimentary of the petitioner's presentation.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a single-family residence with a four-car carriage house for the property located at 301 Alice Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Provide light fixture specifications.
- 2.Driveway aprons shall not be erected on the public right-of-way. Resolve with Traffic Engineering.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Nay
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Nay

13. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 23-003215-COA | 603 Whitaker Street | Rehabilitation

- Staff Report 23-003215-COA 603 Whitaker St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 603 Whitaker St.pdf
- Staff Research.pdf
- Petitioner Presentation.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request of approval for rehabilitation for the property located at 603 Whitaker Street.

Per the applicant:

This application is an amendment to 23-001249-COA which covered repair in kind of siding, soffits, facia, windows, sills, and the roof, which was approved on April 12, 2023. This application consists of four main parts: the restoration of the façade, the removal of minimally visible additions, the alteration of a rear porch to become interior space, and the construction of a brick wall across the rear yard (west) of the house. Other work not covered by the previous application includes the repair of all wood siding and exterior trim with minimal replacement in kind if necessary and color changes described in the sections below. The house is undergoing a full interior rehabilitation, and all work will be completed following the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Staff recommended approval of the rehabilitation request for the property located at 603 Whitaker Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. A minimum of five (5) feet shall be provided between the new rear yard wall and the building to the north.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Kim Campbell asked for approval of the petition.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board supported the petition.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve rehabilitation for the property located at 603 Whitaker Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye

Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Not Present
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

14. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 23-004235-COA | 309 Lorch Street | Rehabilitation and New Construction, Small: Parts I and II

- Staff Report 23-004235-COA 309 Lorch St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 23-004235-COA 309 Lorch St.pdf
- Petitioner's Presentation.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for rehabilitation of the main building, an addition to the main building, and new construction of a two-story carriage house for the property located at 309 Lorch Street.

Per the applicant:

Rehabilitation work on the main house includes in kind replacement of the existing architectural shingle roof, wood siding and trim repair, minor window and front door repair, front porch repair, repointing the brick chimney and historic brick foundation, and color changes. The new colors are: siding — Sherwin-Williams Needlepoint Navy (SW 0032), windows and trim — Sherwin-Williams Classic Light Buff (SW 0050), and front doors — Sherwin-Williams Rookwood Red (SW 2802). The addition built in 2000 will be extended east and will be minimally visible due to the adjacent structure and the new carriage house. The addition will be sided in matching wood siding and includes a new window on the south side that will not be visible due to the new carriage house, a reused window on the east side of the top level, and a new custom-built single pane true divided lite two-over-two wood window on the east side of the parlor level. These windows are minimally visible due to the adjacent structure. The existing rear deck will be removed, and a new rear deck and stair will be constructed, which will not be visible due to the near carriage house.

Historically, there were two-story dwelling units behind 309 Lorch Street fronting the lane, and a new two story carriage house with an accessory dwelling unit will be constructed in this location. See the 1898 and 1916 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in the enclosed history for the historic context of this block. Currently, the buildings on West Hall Street extend through their lots to this lane and creating a two-story context directly across the lane from the new carriage house. The new carriage house will be clad in hardie plank lapped siding with wood trim and painted to match the main house. Windows in the carriage house will be Marvin Ultimate clad windows. The proposed plans include 1,437 square feet of lot coverage, which is 60%. The ADU is 401 square feet, which is 38.7% of the main house's 1,036 square feet. The ADU is 401 square feet total, meeting the minimum 400 square feet requirement. Like the main house, the carriage house has a side-gabled roof, and the new building is clearly subordinate to the main house at less than 24'2" tall.

Staff recommended approval for the rehabilitation of the main building, an addition to the main building, and new construction of a two-story carriage house for the property located at 309 Lorch Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the

standards:

- 1. Provide information regarding the mortar type, color, texture and other qualities to repoint the historic brick chimney and foundation.
- 2. The fiber cement siding must have a smooth finish.
- 3. Provie the pitch for the shed roof for the new addition; it must be a minimum of 2:12.
- 4. Provide the eave depth for the addition; it must be a minimum of 12 inches.
- 5. Reconfigure the existing fence and the new gate to provide a minimum of 5 feet between the fence and carriage house where they are parallel.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Kim Campbell stated they plan to use a lime based mortar. They are also planning to use smooth finished hardieboard. They are proposing to match the existing pitch of the year 2000 addition, which is approximately 1 over 12. Eave depth was added to match what is present. The fence is an existing fence on adjacent property: it does not apply.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There were no Board comments.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve rehabilitation of the main building, an addition to the main building, and new construction of a two-story carriage house for the property located at 309 Lorch Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Provide information regarding the mortar type, color, texture and other qualities to repoint the historic brick chimney and foundation.
- 2. The fiber cement siding must have a smooth finish.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

- 15. Petition of Lominack Kolman Smith Architects | 23-004075-COA | 541 East Congress Street | Alterations
 - Staff Report 23-004075-COA 541 E Congress St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 23-004075-COA 541 E Congress St.pdf

Staff Research.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request of approval for alterations to the front elevation of the building located at 541 East Congress Street. The site consists of what were originally two (2) buildings with the addresses of 541 and 543 East Congress Street that were combined.

The proposed scope of work would consist of the following:

- -Restoration of the two front entrance doors and transoms; the transoms are presently covered with wood panels;
- -Restoration of the front windows double hung, wood, six-over-six;
- -Repointing of the brick façade where needed;
- -Removal of the non-original shutters that are not operable and attached directly to the masonry (brick) face and their replacement with wood operable louvered shutters and related hardware:
- -Repainting of the front elevation, including the brick, doors, windows, shutters, and trim work:
- -Installation of one (1) painted steel canopy with steel rod tiebacks over the eastern most front entrance door (originally 543 East Congress Street);
- -Removal of the non-original front stoop railings at both front entrances and their replacement with painted steel posts and tubes railings;
- -Removal of the steps at the western most front entrance door (originally 541 East Congress Street).

Staff recommended approval for alterations to the front elevation of the building located at 541 East Congress Street. with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Add a horizontal rail to the shutters and ensure that it corresponds to the location of the meeting rail of the window.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Jerry Lominack, petitioner, stated client agreed to the horizontal bar. He expressed the intent of preservation.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, representative of the Oglethorpe Coalition, stated there is no reason to apply modern metal awning to a 1860's building. The railings are too modern; can be differentiated in other ways.

Mr. Lominack agreed with Staff that the addition allows for the request while respecting and differentiating the original structure.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Becker expressed concern about the use of non-historical materials; Ms. Rowan agreed. Mr. Higgins finds the changes jarring; and stated it can be done differently. Mr. Houle expressed concern with the changes. Mr. Thomson stated he agrees with Staff recommendation.

Motion

Deny petitioner's request because it is not visually compatible nor are compatible materials proposed for use.

Vote Results (Rejected)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Robert Becker

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue alterations to the front elevation of the building located at 541 East Congress Street in order for the petitioner to address the following:

- 1.Reconsider the addition of the awning.
- 2. Redesign the railings.
- 3.Add a horizontal rail to the shutters and ensure that it corresponds to the location of the meeting rail of the window.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Nay

- 16. Petition of Lominack Kolman Smith Architects | 23-004230-COA | 208 East Liberty Street | New Construction, Accessory Building (Part I: Height and Mass)
 - Staff Report 23-004230-COA 208 E Liberty.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 23-004230-COA 208 E Liberty St.pdf
 - Staff Research Sanborn Maps.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request of approval for New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass for a two-story carriage house at the rear of the property located at 208 East Liberty Street. The rear of the property is currently an open parking area. Per the applicant:

"It and its supporting walls will now screen the parking areas as well as the adjacent covered parking area to the east. The proposed 600 square foot carriage house apartment is proposed to be constructed of concrete masonry at the first level and wood frame construction above. Both will be finished with 2-coat true stucco. The proposed windows and

exterior doors are Andersen A-Series with a white finish. The drawings further describe the proposed structure.

The two 21" tall outside HVAC units will be behind the parapet wall. The refuse containers will be located within the courtyard space and not visible from a public way. The new electric meter will be located adjacent to the existing meters in the alleyway between 208 E Liberty and the house to the west.

Staff recommended to continue the request for New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass for a two-story carriage house at the rear of the property located at 208 East Liberty Street for a maximum of 90 days in order for the petitioner to address the following:

- 1. Redesign the ground floor garage opening(s) to meet the 12 foot maximum width standard and add garage doors.
- 2. Redesign the frame construction of the second level to be masonry to meet the definition of 'true stucco' in the ordinance.
- 3. The principal structure must be separated from the accessory dwelling unit by a minimum of 10 feet; provide a dimension and ensure that the standard is met.
- 4. The building footprint of the accessory dwelling unit must be a maximum of 40% of the building footprint of the principal dwelling; provide a calculation and ensure that the standard is met.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Jerry Lominack, petitioner, provided updated drawings of the measurements and addressed the concerns of Staff.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, of the Oglethorpe Coalition, has issues with visual compatibly of the project. The project is horizontal, most structures in the area read vertical. It faces an 18th century cemetery posing as an odd backdrop.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board expressed concern with the garage door exceeding 40% and stated it could be modified with two appropriately sized doors. The 40/60 ratio is troublesome; supports the continuance for Staff to work with petitioner.

Motion

BOARD DECISION:

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request for New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass for a two-story carriage house at the rear of the property located at 208 East Liberty Street for a maximum of 90 days in order for the petitioner to address the following:

- 1.Redesign the ground floor garage opening(s) to meet the 12 foot maximum width standard and add garage doors.
- 2.Redesign the frame construction of the second level to be masonry to meet the definition of 'true stucco' in the ordinance.
- 3. The principal structure must be separated from the accessory dwelling unit by a minimum of 10 feet; provide a dimension and ensure that the standard is met.
- 4. The building footprint of the accessory dwelling unit must be a maximum of 40% of the building footprint of the principal dwelling; provide a calculation and ensure that the standard is met.
- 5. Redesign the windows on the north façade to be more visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle Second: Robert Becker

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Nay
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

17. Petition of Architecture 101 | 23-004229-COA | 546 East Taylor Street | New Construction (Accessory Building, Parts I and II)

- Staff Report 23-004229-COA 546 E Taylor St.pdf
- Staff Research 546 E. Taylor St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 546 E. Taylor St..pdf
- Public Comment Richard J. Kenyon.pdf
- Petitioner Presentation.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request of approval to add a second story to an existing one-story garage at the rear of the property located at 546 East Taylor Street. It was built in 1893 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. The scope of the project is limited to a non-contributing garage structure at the rear of the property, facing the lane. Along the lane there are other rear accessory structures ranging from one-story garages to accessory dwelling units.

According to the Historic Savannah Ward Inventory Notebook for Davis Ward, the brick tenements at 544-552 East Taylor Street were built by H.F. Luderman in 1893. But it appears that he had financial difficulties, as the tax records show that by 1894 the properties were owned by the Title Guarantee and Loan Company. The Sanborn Maps between 1898 and 1973 all show a row of one-story wood frame dwellings at the rear of the property facing East Jones Lane. These dwellings had their own separate addresses which suggests that there was more to them than the one-story garages that exist in that location at present. Further, the current garage structures are all listed as non-contributing resources.

Staff recommended to approve the request to add a second story to an existing accessory garage structure for the property located at 546 East Taylor Street with the following conditions for staff review and approval prior to starting the project, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Revise the design to be more compatible where there appears to be excess height in the space between the top of the windows and the top of the parapet wall.
- 2. Submit a window type that is more visually compatible than the proposed casement

window.

3. Ensure that shutters are operable.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Adam Drummond, petitioner, stated the shutters have been addressed. The window selection has been changed to make it more visually compatible, along with height of window.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, of the Oglethorpe Coalition, supported Staff recommendations. He suggested making windows higher and closer together.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There were no Board comments.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request to add a second story to an existing accessory garage structure for the property located at 546 East Taylor Street with the following conditions for staff review and approval prior to starting the project, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1.Revise the design to be more compatible where there appears to be excess height in the space between the top of the windows and the top of the parapet wall.
- 2.Submit a window type that is more visually compatible than the proposed casement window.
- 3. Ensure that shutters are operable.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

- 18. Petition of SHAH Architecture & Interiors | 23-004238-COA | 124 East McDonough Street | Rehabilitation and Alterations
 - Submittal Packet 124 E. McDonough St..pdf
 - Staff Report 23-004238-COA 124 E. McDonough St.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request of approval for rehabilitation and alterations, including reopening partially infilled windows, for the property located at 124

East McDonough Street. The scope of work includes:

- -Mortar repair
- -Gutter repair and replacement
- -Wood soffit and fascia repair
- Wood bracket repair/replacement
- -Cast stone sill repair
- -Metalwork repair
- -Dormer repair
- -Remove infill of rear arched windows and return to full arched windows.

124 East McDonough Street was built in 1861 for Alfred Haywood, and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. The applicant provided a detailed history of the building completed by Ethos Preservation. The property originally served as the home of Haywood, and appears to have served as a residential use until 1950, when some of the building was converted to offices. The building footprint has not changed and appears much the same as it has in photographs seen in the 1960s and 1970s. The rear elevation has a series of arched windows that have since been infilled with smaller windows. It is not clear exactly when this was done, but of the maps, drawings, and photographs uncovered in the research process, there is nothing showing the rear elevation.

Staff recommended to approve the proposed rehabilitation and alterations for the property located at 124 East McDonough Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to starting the project, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Submit mortar lab test results and sample.
- 2. Redesign the center arched windows on rear elevation to be more visually compatible with the surrounding arched windows.
- 3. Utilize wood instead of steel for the arched windows.
- 4. Submit proposed paint color for windows, wood trim at dormers, and dormer louvers.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Michael Johnson, petitioner, accepted all Staff conditions. They are currently working on mortar testing and paint schemes.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, Oglethorpe Coalition, supports the recommendation that the windows be the same.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board stated the windows be the same, and it's a good project overall.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the proposed rehabilitation and alterations for the property located at 124 East McDonough Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to starting the project, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Submit mortar lab test results and sample.

- 2.Redesign the center arched windows on rear elevation to be more visually compatible with the surrounding arched windows.
- 3. Utilize wood instead of steel for the arched windows.
- 4.Submit proposed paint color for windows, wood trim at dormers, and dormer louvers.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

- 19. Petition of Meredith Stevens | 23-004217-COA | 619 East Broad Street | After-the-Fact Rehabilitation
 - Submittal Packet 23-004217 COA 619 E Broad St.pdf
 - Public Comment Michael Higgins.pdf
 - Staff Research 619 East Broad Street.pdf
 - Staff Report 23-004217-COA 619 East Broad Street.pdf
 - ** Mr. Michael Higgins recused himself from this petition.
 - **Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain** presented the applicant's request of approval for an after-the-fact roof installation performed for the property located at 619 East Broad Street, completed prior to the applicant's purchase of the house. Staff also observed other work completed without a COA including front doors, porch railings, balusters and newel posts, as well as inoperable shutters, permanently installed window boxes, and a rear deck with a vinyl fence.
 - 619 East Broad Street was constructed in 1898 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. It was built around the same time as several other houses, in a nearly identical style. These other houses include 625 East Broad Street and 549-551 Nicoll Street. The building first appears on the 1916 Sanborn Map, surrounded by several other wooden one-story duplexes with wood porches. The 1953 and 1973 Sanborn Maps show no major changes to the building. The images on Google Street View show that the following aspects of this work was done sometime between 2019 and 2022:
 - -Material change from shingle roof to metal roof
 - -Front doors were changed
 - -Change from solid attached shutters to wood attached shutters
 - -Change of porch railing style to turned wood balusters
 - -Addition of new railings and newel posts on both sets of stairs
 - -Addition of attached wooden window boxes

-Exterior porch light fixtures

Staff was unable to determine the date of the installation of the following items:

- -Unscreened HVAC unit on roof (seen in Google Street View photos dating back to 2007)
- -Rear deck and interior vinyl fence (vinyl fence appears to be newer)

Staff recommended to continue the application for after-the-fact alterations for the property located at 619-621 East Broad Street for a time period not to exceed ninety (90) days in order for the applicant to work with MPC Staff to address the following:

- 1. Replace the existing front doors with a historically appropriate style.
- 2. Remove window boxes.
- 3. Replace newel post with a more visually compatible type and place on the stair instead of the ground.
- 4. Change the shutters to become hinged and operable.
- 5. Remove interior rear vinyl fence.
- 6. Explore options for screening the roof mounted HVAC unit.
- 7. Select an exterior light fixture that is more aligned with the era of the historic house, with a white light source.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Meredith Stevens, petitioner, stated she bought the property as it is. The previous owners made the changes; however, she was cited by Code Compliance.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, expressed discomfort with reviewing because of the state that the property is in. He stated HSF will offer assistance.

Mr. Steve Edwards, of the Downtown Neighborhood Association, stated inherited violations should not be laid upon the new owners. The violations should be cited to the previous owners before selling.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board suggested possibly making the needed changes periodically with maintenance of the structure.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the application for after-the-fact roof installation for the property located at 619 East Broad Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present
Nan Taylor - Not Present

Stan Houle - Nay
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

Karen Guinn	- Not Present
Michael Higgins	- Abstain
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Nay

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

20. Acknowledgement and approval of Staff-approved petitions.

Motion

The HDBR acknowledged the Staff-approved petitions.

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

- 21. Petition of Austin Zeigler | 233-004335-COA | 207 W York Street | Repair work to the building envelope
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004335-COA 207 W York St.pdf
- 22. Petition of Benjamin Coffey | 23-004224-COA | 334 West Jones Street | Replacement of seven window
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004224-COA 334 W Jones St.pdf
- 23. Petition of Kelly Kisor | 23-004232-COA | 326 W Jones St | Replacement of two windows
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004232-COA 326 W Jones St.pdf
- 24. Petition of Jeff Jerkins | 23-004223-COA | 300, 400 W River Street | Installation of six retractable awnings.
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004223-COA 300 400 W River St.pdf
- 25. Petition of Steven Smith | 23-004233-COA | 207 E Gordon Street | Color change of front door.
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004233-COA 207 E Gordon St.pdf
- 26. Petition of Harley Krinsky | 23-004094-COA | 552 554 E McDonough Street | After-the-Fact new construction amendment stair addition
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004094-COA 552-554 E McDonough St.pdf
- 27. Petition of Rachel Clements | 23-003821-COA | 408 E Huntingdon St | Window replacement and color change.
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-003821-COA 408 E Huntingdon St.pdf
- 28. Petition of Peter Thompson | 23-004034-COA | 529 E Harris Street | Roof replacement.
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004034-COA 529 E Harris St.pdf
- 29. Petition of Walt Freeman | 23-004074-COA | 548 E State Street | Exterior color change
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004074-COA 548 E State St.pdf
- 30. Petition of Steve Leiberman | 23-004378-COA | 115 E River St | New awning, valance and light fixture.
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004378-COA 115 E River St.pdf

- 31. Petition of SCAD, Tony Hensley | 23-004330-COA | 641 Indian Street | Two non-illuminated signs
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004330-COA 641 Indian St.pdf

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 32. Violations Report September 2023 (5 items)
 - Violations Report September 2023.pdf

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

33. Report on Items Deferred to Staff (None)

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 34. Inspections Report September 2023 (2 items)
 - Inspections Report September 2023.pdf
- 35. Stamped Drawings Report September 2023 (5 items)
 - Stamped Drawings Report September 2023.pdf

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

- 36. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting Wednesday October 11, 2023 at 12pm 112 East State Street
- 37. Next HDBR Regular Meeting Wednesday October 11, 2023 at 1pm 112 East State Street

38. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the September 13, 2023 Historic District Board of Review meeting adjourned at 3:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah G. Michalak Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.