

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
August 9, 2023 1:00 PM
MINUTES

August 9, 2023 Historic District Board of Review Meeting

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM in the Mendonsa Hearing Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Ellie Isaacs, Chair

David Altschiller Robert Becker Michael Higgins Stan Houle Melissa Rowan Nan Taylor

Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: Karen Guinn

MPC Staff Present: Melanie Wilson, Executive Director

Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation

Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant Hind Patel, Information Technology

- I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME
- **II. SIGN POSTING**
- **III. CONSENT AGENDA**
 - 1. Petition of GM Shay Architects | 23-003669-COA | 225 East President Street | Amendment
 - Submittal Packet 225 E President St.pdf
 - Staff Report 23-003669-COA 225 East President St.pdf

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the proposed amendments to the new construction and the existing historic structure located at 225 East President Street with the following conditions to be

submitted for staff review and approval prior to starting the work, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

Ensure that door frames shall are inset not less than three (3) inches from the exterior surface of the façade of the building.

Ensure that storefront glazing in subdivided sashes is inset a minimum of four (4) inches from the face of the building.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

2. Petition of Architecture 101 | 23-003672-COA | 17 East Perry Street | Amendment

- Staff Report 23-003672-COA 17 East Perry St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 17 E Perry St.pdf
- Previous Submittal Packet 17 E Perry Street.pdf

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned for approval for amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the property located at 17 East Perry Street [File No. 23-001952-COA] with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

The storefront base must be 18-24 inches high.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye

MINUTES

Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Not Present
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

- 3. Petition of Hansen Architects | 23-003671-COA | 425 East St. Julian Street | Amendment
 - Staff Report 23-003671-COA 425 E St Julian St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 425 E St Julian St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 425 E Saint Julian St 1963 Drawings.pdf
 - Previous Submittal Packet 425 E St Julian St.pdf
 - ***Mr. Higgins motioned to move this item to the Regular Agenda, seconded by Ms. Rowan. All approved to move the petition to the Regular Agenda because of concerns with the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request for approval to amend a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation of the property located at 425 East Saint Julian Street. The amendment consists of adding a new door opening with transom above on the rear façade where a window opening was formerly located. The former window opening was located between two existing window openings and was infilled during a Mills B. Lane rehabilitation project in 1963. Drawings from this rehabilitation project show the former window opening in both plan and elevation.

Staff recommended to approve to amend a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation of the property located at 425 East Saint Julian Street <u>as requested</u> because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Erik Puljung, Hansen Architects, used 1963 documents of the Mills Lane renovation to bring the historic opening and functionality to the structure.

Mr. Houle asked is there a need for so many doors. **Mr. Puljung** stated the historical opening in the drawings provides opportunity to utilize original openings; the current openings will remain. The building was painted to cover prior openings.

Mr. Higgins asked is there a hardship for the requested opening. **Ms. Dean Donnegan** stated that the lower level will accommodate older persons and those with disabilities, which was the primary interest.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones stated he supported the petition, as the wide brick aesthetic would be enhanced by the opening.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Taylor stated she can see the hardship situation. **Mr. Higgins** stated he agrees with the hardship issues. **Mr. Houle** asked about saving the brick.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to amend a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation of the property located at 425 East Saint Julian Street with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Salvage the removed brick.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

4. Adopt the August 9, 2023 Agenda

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to adopt the August 9, 2023 HDBR agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Robert Becker

5. Approve July 12, 2023 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

Ø 07.12.23 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

- Aye

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the July 12, 2023 Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson Second: David Altschiller

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Aye

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

6. Petition of Homeline Architecture | 23-002540-COA | 433 Tattnall Street | Additions and Alterations

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to continue the petition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

7. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 23-003661-COA | 224 West Bay Street | Illuminated Sign

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to continue the petition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

8. Petition of Rose Architects | 23-002530-COA | 301 Alice Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to continue the petition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

9. Petition of A Taco Affair | 23-003629-COA | 401 West Hall Street | Illuminated Sign

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to continue the petition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye

MINUTES

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

10. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 23-003215-COA | 603 Whitaker Street | Amendment / Rehabilitation

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to continue the petition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Abstain Karen Guinn - Not Present Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye Robert Becker - Aye

11. Petition of JDH Decks & Fences, Inc. | 23-003664-COA | 20 East Broad Street | Fence

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to continue the petition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

- 12. Petition of Signs by James, LLC, James Burnsed | 23-003037-COA | 107 West Congress Street | Illuminated Sign
 - Staff Report 23-003037-COA 107 W Congress St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 107 West Congress St..pdf
 - Public Comment 7.7.2023.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request of approval to install a new illuminated sign for the business located at 107 West Congress Street.

Staff recommended to approve the request to install an illuminated sign at 107 West Congress Street with the following conditions to be submitted for staff review and approval prior to starting the work, because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Revise the color of the lettering to be more aligned with the surrounding buildings and signs in the vicinity.
- 2. Provide the interior detail of the sign to show how only the letters will be illuminated.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Asha Pakarni, stated the color scheme is subjective. The *Sorry Charlie's* sign has many colors. They are not sure of what colors need to be changed. The former *Smoke Life* sign was very similar to what is being proposed, just a little less color. *Flock to the Wok* has a sign that has complete illumination.

Mr. Becker asked if reverse silhouette option can be provided and that there are 5 signs on the windows. **Mr. Parkani** stated they are decorative signs hanging from the inside. He stated the contractor informed that the letters are to be raised with lights behind them.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones stated signs are a problem now; many are using windows as well for additional signage.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board stated they see no movement on petitioners' part to comply with staff recommendations. **Mr. Altschiller** stated the existing five signs are still an issue. **Mr. Thomson** stated the window signs are a code enforcement issue.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny the request to install an illuminated sign at 107 West Congress Street because it does not meet the visual compatibility standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Robert Becker

David Altschiller - Aye

MINUTES

Nan Taylor	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Nay
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Not Present
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

- 13. Petition of Glenn Keyes Architect | 23-003204-COA | 14-18 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Rehabilitation & Alterations

 - Submittal Packet 14-18 E. Oglethorpe Ave.pdf
 - Staff Research 14-18 E. Oglethorpe Ave.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request of approval to rehabilitate the exterior of 14 East Oglethorpe Avenue and 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue, and the installation of a new metal stair and elevator tower with new mechanical equipment on the roof. The rehabilitation work includes repair of all wood elements, restoration of windows and doors, repair and recoating of roof, replacement of non-historic windows, and removal of elastomeric coating from historic stucco and repainting.

Staff recommended to approve the request for rehabilitation of historic features at 14 East Oglethorpe Avenue and 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue, and the construction of an unattached elevator tower at the rear of the property of 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue, with the following conditions for staff review and approval prior to starting the project, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Provide construction plans showing that the rear stairs and landings on 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue are attached in a way that would not cause major damage to the building if removed.
- 2. Provide information about the modern paint removal testing and proposed removal method based on the results. Ensure that the gentlest means possible is utilized.
- 3. Provide a window and door schedule, and specific product information, including how existing openings may be altered.
- 4. Provide information about any exterior lighting.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Glenn Keyes, petitioner, stated the goal was to minimize the visibility from Drayton Street by embedding the stair between the elevator, by gently adding to the historic structure.

Mr. Thomson asked about the attachment. Mr. Keyes stated it will be a bolt going through the wall on floor level attachment only; completely reversible.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones stated the roof is higher than rear portion of the building, it should be

lowered and sloped to align with the adjoining building.

Mr. Keyes stated the purpose of the higher roof is to provide water protection. If it were dropped, it would make reversibility difficult. He stands by his presentation.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Taylor thinks it is sensitively done. **Ms. Rowan** expressed appreciation for the petitioner taking Board comments into consideration.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for rehabilitation of historic features at 14 East Oglethorpe Avenue and 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue, and the construction of an unattached elevator tower at the rear of the property of 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue, with the following conditions for staff review and approval prior to starting the project, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Provide construction plans showing that the rear stairs and landings on 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue are attached in a way that would not cause major damage to the building if removed.
- 2.Provide information about the modern paint removal testing and proposed removal method based on the results. Ensure that the gentlest means possible is utilized.
- 3. Provide a window and door schedule, and specific product information, including how existing openings may be altered.
- 4. Provide information about any exterior lighting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Aye

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

- 14. Petition of SHEDDarchitecture | 23-003202-COA | 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard | Non-Contributing Demolition
 - Submittal Packet- 412-414 MLK BLVD.pdf
 - Staff Report 23-003202-COA 412-414 MLK.pdf
 - Staff Research 412-414 MLK Blvd.pdf
 - **Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain** presented the petitioners request of approval to demolish the non-contributing buildings at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard. This request was first heard at the July 12, 2023, HDBR Meeting, where the Board had concerns over the lack of a

structural assessment which was not provided by the applicant, as well as expressing a TES desire to see more information about 412 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. Members felt that there was not enough information presented to be able to make a decision. It was stated that in the interior photographs, the fact that old knob and tube wiring can still be seen inside shows that the building dates to the late nineteenth or early twentieth century. There was also mention of the need to further explore the rich Civil Rights era history and African American history associated with what little remains of the West Broad Street corridor, that had not been destroyed by the I-16 flyover project. The Board stated that 412 could potentially still be saved and may be more intact under the stucco. Board members felt that not having criteria or guidelines for deconstruction made it difficult to approve that as a condition.

The HDBR Decision was as follows:

The Downtown Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby <u>continue</u> the application for the request for demolition of the non-contributing buildings located at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, for no more than ninety (90) days, to allow time for the applicant to provide information such as structural reports and photographs, and for staff to reevaluate whether these buildings qualify for contributing status.

Since that meeting, the applicant provided the requested information including structural reports for 414 MLK Blvd. and interior images of 412 MLK Blvd. A letter from a descendant of the family who owned the buildings states that the property was not involved in the Civil Rights movement. Staff research included further archival searches through the Georgia Historical Society, City of Savannah Municipal Archives, Library of Congress, Digital Library of Georgia, as well as a visit to the Ralph Mark Gilbert Civil Rights Museum.

Staff recommended to approve the request for demolition of the non-contributing buildings located at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard with the following conditions because the criteria for non-contributing demolition have otherwise been met.

- 1. The buildings must be documented per the MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings.
- 2. Rather than traditional demolition, the building be deconstructed, and the materials salvaged for reuse.

Ms. Taylor asked if there has been a structural report on 412. **Ms. Chamberlain** responded not to the knowledge of staff.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Shedrick Coleman stated the structures have been under review for 57 years regarding contributing historic status. They have been irreparably changed, and the materials are not unique, but valued as historic, thus repurposing. No structural assessment on 412 because the structure has not been questioned; it did not warrant as 414 did.

Ms. Mae Bowley, Repurpose Savannah, highlighted her agency. She stated anything that could be saved and repurposed, will be. Both properties will be thoroughly researched and documented.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated they understand the request; it is a loss regarding the exterior features. Commended the petitioner for preservation actions.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Houle stated he sees no reason to destroy 414. The Board stated save what IS a consequence, but not salvage everything simply because it is historic. There is still has question on 412. The present state of the structure needs to be considered.

Mr. Josh Yellin, legal representation for the petitioner, stated the Board has to remain within its purview and review the application as presented, with the facts as they are.

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to deny the petition due to questions regarding contributing status. Also, to allow petitioner opportunity to separate seperate the building applications.

- 1. The buildings must be documented per the MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings.
- 2. Rather than traditional demolition, the building be deconstructed, and the materials salvaged for reuse.

Vote Results (Rejected)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Nan Taylor

David Altschiller - Nay
Nan Taylor - Aye
Stan Houle - Nay
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Nay
Melissa H. Rowan - Nay
Thomas L. Thomson - Nay
Robert Becker - Aye

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the request for demolition of the non-contributing buildings located at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard with the following conditions because the criteria for non-contributing demolition have otherwise been met.

- 1. The buildings must be documented per the MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings.
- 2. Rather than traditional demolition, the building be deconstructed, and the materials salvaged for reuse.

Vote Results (Rejected)

Motion: David Altschiller

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Nay

Stan Houle - Nay

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

١٨/	IN	IIТ	EC.
W	IIVI	UII	-5

	1711110	
Michael Higgins	- Nay	
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye	
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye	
Robert Becker	- Nay	

Motion

The Historic District Board of Review motioned to continue the petition to the September 13, 2023 HDBR meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Stan Houle

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Nay

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

15. Petition of LS3P | 23-003676-COA | 7 East Congress Street | Additions and Alterations

- Staff Report 23-003676-COA 7 E Congress St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 7 E Congress St.pdf
- Petitioner Presentation.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain, presented the applicant's request of approval for rehabilitation and additions to the property located at 7 East Congress Street (32 Bull Street), also known as the Manger Building. This includes adding a two-story addition and enclosed walkway along the Congress Street elevation; demolishing the existing elevator shaft to install a new, taller elevator shaft on the Congress Lane elevation; the rehabilitation and alterations of several original exterior features; a rooftop bar and pool deck addition.

Staff recommended to continue the request for additions, rehabilitation and alterations for the property located at 7 East Congress Street, for a period not to exceed ninety (90) days, to allow the applicant time to address the following:

- Consideration of options that would not include such a high volume of historic brick removal and damage to the historic building, for the event space and elevator shaft additions.
- 2. Provide photographs showing the deteriorated conditions of the terracotta parapet blocks; metal coping; cornice; windows.
- 3. Ensure that the height of the event space addition is visually compatible in relation to the historic building.
- 4. Include more renderings of other perspectives showing that the rooftop bar structure

would not be visible from a public right-of-way.

- 5. Provide information on the drawings to show that door frames shall be inset not less than three (3) inches from the exterior surface of the façade; and information showing that the storefront glazing in subdivided sashes will be inset a minimum of four (4) inches from the face of the building.
- 6. Provide brand and product specifications for the proposed replacement windows.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Neil Dawson, petitioner, addressed the Staff conditions. He stated the amount of brick to be removed is minimal - 367 square feet. Some of the lentils have corroded; there will have to be some bricks above the windows removed/repaired.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated the historic tax credit consultant's concerns were diminished. He stated he agrees with and supports the project.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Taylor stated there are concerns about amount of historic brick removal, but it is a good project. **Mr. Altschiller** still has concerns with event space height. **Mr. Higgins** and **Ms. Rowan** would like to see the event space taller.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for additions, rehabilitation, and alterations for the property located at 7 East Congress Street, with the following conditions because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Provide photographs showing the deteriorated conditions of the terracotta parapet blocks; metal coping; cornice; windows.
- 2.Ensure that the height of the event space addition is visually compatible in relation to the historic building. 3.Include more renderings of other perspectives showing that the rooftop bar structure would not be visible from a public right-of-way.
- 4.Provide information on the drawings to show that door frames shall be inset not less than three (3) inches from the exterior surface of the façade; and information showing that the storefront glazing in subdivided sashes will be inset a minimum of four (4) inches from the face of the building.
- 5. Provide brand and product specifications for the proposed replacement windows.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Aye

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

16. Petition of Hansen Architects | 23-002535-COA | 127 East Gordon Street | Additions and Alterations

- Staff Report 23-002535-COA 127 E Gordon St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 127 E Gordon St Supplemental.pdf
- Submittal Packet 127 E Gordon St Drawings.pdf
- Previous Submittal Packet 127 East Gordon Street.pdf
- DNA Comment.pdf
- Public Support Letter.pdf
- HDBR Meeting 8-9-23 Petitioner Presentation.pdf
- Structural Assessment 8-7-23.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request of approval for alterations and additions to the property located at 127 East Gordon Street.

Per the applicant:

127 East Gordon Street was originally constructed in the hall-parlor configuration, with a wooden side porch added sometime before 1916. Since that time, alterations to the building, including replacing the side porch with a masonry addition and adding an additional stair to the front stoop, have created a different building form and presence on the square and the building currently reads more like an "I" house with a central hallway. In fact, it was described as such on the historic resource card. The vision and goal of this project is to restore the building as a single-family residence, with the hall-parlor configuration legible, and restore the balance of the building with a wooden porch in the same footprint as the historic wooden porch.

To achieve this, we are proposing the following: a comprehensive rehabilitation for the main house, removal of a brick addition, an addition with massing and design aesthetic as an enclosed side porch, and a masonry element. A previously existing garage location is being re-established as a garage with a terrace space above. We will use Abercorn Street for garage and driveway access -- new wood double gates are proposed. The entry stoop will be modified to have a single stair toward Abercorn and also to have a masonry construction aesthetic vs that of a formed and poured concrete stoop and stair.

Through the review of the sanborn maps and zoning requirements, we have established that the existing three story brick addition is not a contributing element to the original side hall townhouse. Please review our contributing status documentation prepared by Ethos.

In the process of reviewing the history of the home, we learned that there was a wood side porch in the location of the masonry addition we are proposing for removal. Our plans for the addition of a mostly enclosed side porch are based on the same footprint of this porch noted in the sanborn maps. We are proposing this porch have an open porch bay toward the square and the balance will be enclosed with glass from the rail height up. The expression of the porch rail is maintained for the enclosed areas.

We are requesting in kind repairs for the historic main house including the stucco, stucco detail, wood trim, wood details, wood windows, and rear balcony reconstruction based on historic images.

The primary materials of the new addition are stucco over masonry (8" CMU) walls and

wood framing and wood detailing on the enclosed porch. New Marvin brand windows are proposed for the new addition; cut sheets are provided.

The side yard facing Gordon Street will be restored as a garden. Upon approval of the rehabilitation and design work currently being presented, we intend to engage the services of a local Landscape Architect. We will return with this phase for review as appropriate as it relates to gates, garden walls, hardscape etc. In this application we are only asking for the removal of the concrete within the yard space.

At the June 14, 2023, HDBR meeting, the Board <u>continued</u> the request in order for the petitioner to address the following:

- 1. Redesign in order to retain the historic addition.
- 2. Reduce the scale of the remainder of the new addition.
- 3. Provide door specifications and inset door frames 3 inches from the exterior façade.
- 4. Inset window sashes 3 inches from the exterior façade.
- 5. Revise the design of the front stoop columns to be more in keeping with the historic building's design. Change the composite material to wood for front stoop elements. Provide a newel post at the bottom of the stoop railing.
- 6. Provide the depth of the reconstructed balcony; ensure it does not exceed 3 feet in depth.
- 7. Remove the curb cut and the vehicular gates from the east-west street.

The applicant has responded to each condition within their submittal packet. However, they have not redesigned in order to retain the historic addition; their submittal packet indicates that:

- The addition does not meet the standards for contributing status per NewZO Section 3.16.4.b., support information included
- · The integrity of the addition is compromised beyond consideration for rehabilitation

Staff recommended to Approve the request for the rehabilitation of the main historic building for the property located at 127 East Gordon Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

AND

Deny the request to demolish the historic addition for the property located at 127 East Gordon Street because the historic addition has acquired historic significance.

AND

Deny the request for an addition for the property located at 127 East Gordon Street because the addition is not visually compatible.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Erik Puljung stated they modified per staff concerns. They will use a brick with frame wall behind. The structural report on addition was done because it was built in an inferior manner.

Ms. Ellen Harris, Ethos Preservation, stated the structure did not originally have a porch or addition on the side. The building on the south was never a carriage house; it has always been an individual structure with its own address. To quality for historic tax credit, it would include removal of the current addition.

Mr. Puljung presented the new proposed footprint. The garage area will be a one-story

space with a terrace over it; it has been minimized. The lot coverage has been reduced, but in keeping with the neighboring properties.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones stated he supported the petition.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, expressed appreciation that the petitioner is using the Historic Tax credit program.

Ms. Christiana Turner, area resident, supports the petition.

Ms. Catherine Twigg stated this will be primary residence. **Mr.** Gary Twigg stated they inherited a blight levy with the property and will have to get a certificate of occupancy.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Taylor stated she appreciated the scaling back of the mass. She supports the porch, which provides more green space.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve alterations and additions to the property located at 127 East Gordon Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan

Second: Nan Taylor

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Aye

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

17. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 23-003674-COA | 308 East Liberty Street | Fence - Special Exception

- Staff Report 23-003674-COA 308 E Liberty St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 308 E Liberty St.pdf
- Staff Research.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request of approval for an after-the-fact Special Exception for a wall for the property located at 308 East Liberty Street. The wall was approved to be installed at 11'-0" high with the original Certificate of Appropriateness; however, it was installed at 11'-8" high.

The Special Exception request is from the standard that reads:

Fences, trellises or walls shall not exceed 11 feet in height; ...

In order to allow the wall to remain at 11'-8" high.

The wall initially received a Certificate of Appropriateness on June 10, 2021, to replace the existing fence with the metal wall (with gates) [File No. 21-002966-COA]. The approval included the following conditions:

- 1. Reduce the height of the installation so that it does not exceed 11-feet.
- 2. Ensure that the gates are aligned with the existing rear fence / privacy wall and form a continuous wall of enclosure along Perry Lane.
- 3. If any existing dimensions, or the current privacy wall, are proposed to be altered, ensure that plans are submitted to Staff for review.

However, in November 2021, while the wall was being installed, staff was contacted regarding the installation and verified that Condition #1 had not been met and that the wall was taller than the maximum permitted by the ordinance (11'-0").

Staff recommended to approve the after-the-fact Special Exception for a wall for the property located at 308 East Liberty Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Paint the wall a color to match or blend in with the historic building on either side.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Jerome Elder, petitioner, stated the utilities have already been installed; would like to retain.

Ms. Kelli Merrill, resident, this was an oversight by former contractor. She received a letter of violation. The prior approval included a condition to lower height. She would like to keep as is.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Higgins stated he is not in favor of special exceptions for lack of following instructions.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve an after-the-fact Special Exception for a wall for the property located at 308 East Liberty Street as requested the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Nay
Stan Houle - Aye

MINUTES

Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Not Present
Michael Higgins	- Nay
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Nay
Robert Becker	- Aye

- 18. Petition of Studio H Architects | 23-003320-COA | 114 West Bay Street | Rehabilitation/Alterations
 - Staff Report 23-003320-COA 114 W Bay St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 114 W Bay St Drawings.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 114 W Bay St Specs.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request of approval for rehabilitation of the property located at 114 West Bay Street. Per the applicant:

The project is an expansion to the existing Cotton Sail Hotel in Historic Downtown Savannah. The scope of the work will include the top 3 levels and rooftop space of the existing building at 114 West Bay Street. The proposed expansion will consist of guest rooms, a coffee bar retail space, and a rooftop amenity deck with bar & lounge and fitness center.

Exterior improvements include the restoration and refinishing of the existing stucco walls, replacing existing window openings with new windows and extending cornices. All new materials and finishes are to match the existing Cotton Sail Hotel to achieve a cohesive façade.

FINDINGS:

The historic building was constructed in 1852 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District.

Staff recommended to approve the rehabilitation of the property located at 114 West Bay Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Identify the stucco type (lime, Portland cement, etc.) and provide the information.
- 2. Provide a paint color selection for the stucco.
- 3. Clarify whether any stucco cleaning is proposed.
- 4. Revise the windows to be wood, single-paned, true-divided lite; submit the specification.
- 5. Provide additional information regarding the storefront; the storefront elevation drawing appears to be incomplete and does not match the rendering on the first and last pages of the submittal packet.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Jessica Higgie stated they are proposing an expansion. Will implement required revisions and addressed Staff conditions.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Jim Hundsrucker expressed the brick is under the stucco. Ms. Higgie stated it was

^{***}Ms. Melissa Rowan left at this petition.

covered in 1949 and what was exposed was greatly deteriorated. It was determined it was better to repair the stucco; allow details to remain visible. It will remain as it is now with relief patterns showing.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There were no Board comments.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the rehabilitation of the property located at 114 West Bay Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Identify the stucco type (lime, Portland cement, etc.) and provide the information.
- 2. Provide a paint color selection for the stucco.
- 3. Clarify whether any stucco cleaning is proposed.
- 4. Revise the windows to be wood, single-paned, true-divided lite; submit the specification.
- 5. Provide additional information regarding the storefront; the storefront elevation drawing appears to be incomplete and does not match the rendering on the first and last pages of the submittal packet.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Aye

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye
Robert Becker - Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

19. Acknowledgement and approval of Staff-approved petitions.

Motion

Acknowledge Staff-approved petitions.

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

- 20. Petition of Southeast Roofing | 23-003665-COA | 516 Abercorn Street | Roofing project
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-003665-COA 516 Abercorn St.pdf
- 21. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 23-003722-COA | 201 W Broughton St | Vents on lane facade.

- SIGNED Staff Decision 23-003722-COA 201 W Broughton St.pdf
- 22. Petition of Hall of Sneakz | 23-003022-COA | 30 W York St | After-the-Fact Sign
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-003022-COA 30 W York St.pdf
- 23. Petition of Landmark Preservation | 23-003330-COA | 341 Bull Street | Rehabilitation work: windows, doors, bricks, mortar
 - SIGNED Staff_Decision_-_23-003330-COA_341_Bull_St.pdf
- 24. Petition of the Pinyan Company | 23-003329-COA | 24 Habersham Street | In-kind window repairs and shutters
 - SIGNED Staff_Decision_-_23-003329-COA__24_Habersham_St.pdf
- 25. Petition of Sign D'Sign | 23-003323-COA | 120 W Broughton Street | Reface exterior illuminated signs
 - SIGNED Staff_Decision_-_23-003323-COA__120_W_Broughton_St.pdf
- 26. Petition of Homestead Architecture | 23-002190-COA | 224 W Bay St | Replace non-historic sliding glass doors with new wood doors on third and fourth north elevations
 - SIGNED Staff_Decision_-_23-002190-COA__224_W_Bay.pdf
- 27. Petition of Your Exterior Pros | 23-003317-COA | 518, 520 E Gwinnett St | Roof replacement
 - SIGNED Staff_Decision_-_23-003317-COA__518__Gwinnett_St.pdf
- 28. Petition of MetalCrafts | 23-003209-COA | 4 E. Jones St | Roof replacement
 - SIGNED Staff_Decision_-_23-003209-COA__4_E_Jones_St.pdf
- 29. Petition of Littles on Liberty | 23-003186-COA | 129 E. Liberty St | Door & courtyard gate color change
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-003186-COA 129 E Liberty.pdf
- 30. Petition of MetalCrafts | 23-003031-COA | 118 W Hall St | Roof repair and replacement
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-003031-COA 118 W Hall St.pdf

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 31. Report on Work Inconsistent with COAs (1 Item) August Report
 - Report on Work Inconsistent with COA August Report.pdf
- 32. Report on Work that Exceeds Scope of Issued COA (1 Item) August Report
 - Report of Exceeds Scope of Issued COA August Report.pdf
- 33. Report on Work Performed Without a COA (2 Items) August Report
 - Violation 202 East Gwinnett Street.pdf
 - Violation 619-621 East Broad Street.pdf

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

- 34. Report on Items Deferred to Staff (2 Items) August Report
 - Items Deferred to Staff August Report.pdf

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 35. Stamped Drawings Report (5 Items) August Report
 - Stamped Drawings August Report.pdf
- 36. Inspections Report (5 Items) August Report
 - Inspections Report August Report.pdf

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

- 37. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting Wednesday September 13, 2023 at 12pm 112 East State Street
- 38. Next HDBR Regular Meeting Wednesday September 13, 2023 at 1pm 112 East State Street

39. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the August 9, 2023 Historic District Board of Review meeting adjourned at 5:02 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah G. Michalak
Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.