

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
October 11, 2023 1:00 PM
MINUTES

October 11, 2023 Historic District Board of Review

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM in the Mendonsa Hearing Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Ellie Isaacs, Chair

Robert Becker Michael Higgins Karen Guinn Melissa Rowan Nan Taylor

Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: David Altschiller

Stan Houle

MPC Staff Present: Pamela Everett, Executive Director

Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation

Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant Hind Patel, Information Technology

- I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME
- **II. SIGN POSTING**
- **III. CONSENT AGENDA**
 - 1. Petition of Hansen Architects | 23-004290-COA | 226 West Broughton Street | Alterations
 - Staff Report 23-004290-COA 226 W Broughton St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 226 W Broughton St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve alterations to the property located at 226 West Broughton Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

2. Petition of Array Design | 23-004345-COA | 412 East Gwinnett Street | After-the-Fact Fence

- Submittal Packet 412 E Gwinnett St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve a fence at the rear of the property located at 412 East Gwinnett Street with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. The wood fence must be painted or stained.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

3. Petition of Metalcrafts | 23-004010-COA | 574 Indian Street | Roof Recovering

- Staff Report 23-004010-COA 574 Indian St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 574 Indian Street.pdf
- Staff Photos 574 Indian Street.pdf
- Staff Photos 201 Rommel Drive (for 574 Indian Street).pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to cover the existing roof for a property located at 574 Indian Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

4. Petition of William H. Triplett | 23-004855-COA | 428 Price Street | Rehabilitation

- Submittal Packet 428 Price St..pdf
- Staff Report 23-004855-COA 428 Price St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the proposed rehabilitation work and in-kind material replacements for the property located at 428 Price Street as requested because the project is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

5. Petition of Principals of Design | 23-004376-COA | 124 East Bay Street | Rehabilitation and Alterations

- Submittal Packet 124 East Bay Street.pdf
- Staff Report 23-004376-COA 124 E Bay St.pdf

Staff research 124 E. Bay St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request to make alterations to various non-historic exterior features on the River Street side of the property located at 124 East Bay Street with the following conditions, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1.Ensure that the historic brick is not affected by the sandblasting of the non-historic metal finishes.
- 2.Omit the applied trellis treatment on the lower-level window.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

6. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 23-004867-COA | 112 West Taylor Street | Rehabilitation and Alterations

Submittal Packet - 112 W Taylor St.pdf

Staff Report - 23-004867-COA 112 W Taylor St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for rehabilitation and alterations for the property located at 112 West Taylor Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye
Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

- Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

7. Petition of Architecture 101 | 23-004856-COA | 431 Habersham Street | Amendment to Porch Addition

- Staff Report 23-004856-COA 431 Habersham St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 431 Habersham St.pdf
- Previous Submittal Packet 431 Habersham Street.pdf
- Staff Research.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to amend a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear porch addition for the property located at 431 Habersham Street [File No. 23-003219-COA] with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed change is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. The distance between balusters shall not exceed four (4) inches on center and the height of the railing shall not exceed 36 inches for single- and two-family dwelling units.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

8. Petition of Eli Lurie | 23-004870-COA | 24 West Taylor Street | Alterations

- Submittal Packet 24 West Taylor St.pdf
- Staff Report 23-004870-COA 24 W Taylor St.pdf

Motion

Approve the proposal to replace the two non-historic cast iron columns on the portico with two square wood columns as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

9. Petition of Principals of Design | 23-004038-COA | 115 East River Street | Sign

- Submittal Packet 115 East River St..pdf
- Previous Submittal Packet 115 East River Street.pdf
- Staff Report 23-004038-COA 115 E River St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for the installation of one non-illuminated projecting sign and one incidental sign, for the property located at 115 East River Street with the following condition because the proposed projecting sign and incidental sign are otherwise visually compatible and meet the standards.

1.Ensure that signs are installed through mortar joints rather than the historic brick.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

10. Adopt the October 11, 2023 Agenda

Ø09.13.23 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Motion

Adopt the October 11, 2023 HDBR Agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson Second: Karen Guinn David Altschiller

Not Present

- Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Robert Becker

11. September 13, 2023 Historic District Board of Review Meeting Minutes

Ø 09.13.23 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Motion

Approve

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Nan Taylor

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

12. Petition of A Taco Affair | 23-003629-COA | 401 West Hall Street | Sign

Motion

Continue

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Robert Becker

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

13. Petition of JDH Decks & Fences, Inc. | 23-003664-COA | 20 East Broad Street | Fence

Motion

Continue

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: Robert Becker

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

14. Petition of Lominack Kolman Smith Architects | 23-004075-COA | 541 East Congress Street | Alterations

Motion

Continue

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: Robert Becker

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Aye

15. Petition of Lominack Kolman Smith Architects | 23-004230-COA | 208 East Liberty Street | New Construction, Accessory Building (Part I: Height and Mass)

Motion		
Continue		
Vote Results (Approved)		
Motion: Karen Guinn		
Second: Robert Becker		
David Altschiller	- Not Present	
Nan Taylor	- Aye	
Stan Houle	- Not Present	
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain	
Karen Guinn	- Aye	
Michael Higgins	- Aye	
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye	
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye	
Robert Becker	- Aye	

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

- 16. Petition of SHEDDarchitecture | 23-003202-COA | 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard | Non-Contributing Demolition
 - Submittal Packet- 412-414 MLK BLVD.pdf
 - Staff Report 23-003202-COA 412-414 MLK.pdf
 - Staff Research 412-414 MLK Blvd.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request of approval to demolish the non-contributing buildings at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard. The dates of construction of 412 and 414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard are unknown, but it is believed that 412 was built in the early 1900s, and 414 as it exists today was originally four wood-framed town houses seen first on the 1898 Sanborn Map. Both buildings are listed as non-contributing resources within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. The Sanborn Fire Insurance Map from 1888 shows two attached one-story wood frame dwellings at the site of 414 and a two-story wood frame dwelling at the approximate site of 412. By 1898, 412 West Broad Street is still a two-story wood frame dwelling but with some alterations at the rear. 414 West Broad Street is not shown as an address but there are four attached two-story wood frame dwellings on Tattnall Street and heading towards the corner of West Broad Street. Photographs from the 1940s

show what looks like this configuration was still there but adapted into a commercial building on the street level.

The Savannah Ward Notebook for the Berrien Ward has a note to omit both 412 and 414 West Broad Street, but a reason is not given. Neither page includes much detail except to note that they have a vague construction date of '20th Century.' Based on photographs starting in the 1930s, it appears that the structure at 414 today is an alteration of the original structure. The storefront seen in historic photographs and the frieze above the storefront with the shop name appear to be the only surviving features still visible. 412 has undergone major renovations where it is nearly unrecognizable from the earlier photos. At some point between the 1953 and 1973 Sanborn Maps, the two buildings were adjoined. It may have been around that time that the exterior of 414 was stuccoed and the bay windows removed from the former wood frame houses, which may still exist underneath. The 1953 Sanborn Map lists 414 as a paint store on the main level, with rooms on the second floor. There was a rear portion of the building listed as a dwelling, but it is no longer given a separate listing as a dwelling by 1973, indicating that if it had been functioning separately in 1953, it no longer was twenty years later. The metal windows that were installed on the Tattnall Street side of the building have since been removed. The 1898 Sanborn Map shows the 412 West Broad Street address still as a two-story wood frame dwelling, but by 1916, there is instead a three-story masonry store building, which may have been an expansion of the older structure. The Sanborn Maps from 1953 and 1973 show the same building, so in this case, the same building that is there currently, was built within the period of significance, but it has undergone many changes on the front façade that occurred beyond 1960, rendering them unrecognizable from their earlier facades.

This request was first heard at the July 12, 2023, HDBR Meeting, where the Board had concerns over the lack of a structural assessment which was not provided by the applicant, as well as expressing a desire to see more information about 412 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. Members felt that there was not enough information presented to be able to make a decision. It was stated that in the interior photographs, the fact that old knob and tube wiring can still be seen inside shows that the building dates to the late nineteenth or early twentieth century. There was also mention of the need to further explore the rich Civil Rights era history and African American history associated with what little remains of the West Broad Street corridor, that had not been destroyed by the I-16 flyover project. The Board stated that 412 could potentially still be saved and may be more intact under the stucco. Board members felt that not having criteria or guidelines for deconstruction made it difficult to approve that as a condition.

The HDBR Decision was as follows:

The Downtown Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby <u>continue</u> the application for the request for demolition of the non-contributing buildings located at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, for no more than ninety (90) days, to allow time for the applicant to provide information such as structural reports and photographs, and for staff to reevaluate whether these buildings qualify for contributing status.

For the following meeting, on August 9, 2023, the applicant provided the requested information including structural reports for 414 MLK Blvd. and interior images of 412 MLK Blvd. A letter from a descendant of the family who owned the buildings stated that the property was not involved in the Civil Rights movement.

Staff research included further archival searches through the Georgia Historical Society, City of Savannah Municipal Archives, Library of Congress, Digital Library of Georgia, and the Ralph Mark Gilbert Civil Rights Museum. Further information was provided by the applicant

including interior photos of 412. The petitioner presentation also included a presentation by Repurpose Savannah, detailing their work in general but also the specific plan for deconstructing the two buildings. After much Board discussion, and two failed motions the HDBR decision was as follows:

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby <u>continue</u> the request for demolition of the non-contributing buildings located at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. to the September 13, 2023 HDBR Meeting.

The applicant reached out to MPC staff with a request to continue their application until October 11, 2023. On August 21, 2023, a structural analysis of 412 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard was undertaken by F. Michael Sikes, a structural engineer. The report is now included in the submittal packet and has been incorporated into the staff report. The findings by Mr. Sikes indicated that "the lack of capacity the existing building framing systems have, it is my professional opinion that this building should be demolished and rebuilt."

Staff recommended to approve the request for demolition of the non-contributing buildings located at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard with the following conditions because the criteria for non-contributing demolition have otherwise been met.

- 1. The buildings must be documented per the MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings.
- 2. Rather than traditional demolition, the building be deconstructed, and the materials salvaged for reuse.

3.

Ms. Taylor asked when the alterations occurred. Ms. Chamberlain stated about 1916. Ms. Taylor asked if anything could be done as it previously was. Ms. Chamberlain responded most of the historic components are gone.

Mr. Higgins asked what criteria supports that integrity is lost, what historic fabric can be found under stucco/canopy. Ms. Chamberlain responded none have not found, thus deconstruction rather than demolition is recommended.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Shedrick Coleman, petitioner, stated he agreed with Staff and had nothing to add. The Board asked about the immediate concern with the structures. Mr. Coleman stated 412 is not an immediate concern now but will be in the future. The Board stated It is structurally sound in that it will not fall but will need to be updated for any use.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated they maintain their stance, and understands the need for demo in this instance. They agree with Staff in that the historic integrity is gone.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Guinn stated the structural report indicates it will be difficult to save, and nothing really to save. There is comfort that they plan to salvage what is salvageable.

Mr. Higgins believes the 412 building can be saved and that it is an error to think it is all gone. It would be criminal to lose the buildings.

Mr. Thomson supports Staff recommendation.

Ms. Taylor agrees with Mr. Higgins and that demo is not to be taken lighten, especially with the Landmark District being threatened. She expressed regret they cannot be separated as 412 can be saved. The cultural significance still there. Some of the architectural integrity

can be restored. The fact that there is no immediate concern is a great factor - not currently a threat to the community.

Motion

Approve the request for demolition of the non-contributing buildings located at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard with the following conditions because the criteria for non-contributing demolition have otherwise been met.

The buildings must be documented per the MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings.

Rather than traditional demolition, the building be deconstructed, and the materials salvaged for reuse.

Vote Results (Rejected)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Karen Guinn

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Nay

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Nay

Melissa H. Rowan - Abstain

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Nay

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny the request for demolition of the non-contributing buildings located at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard because the criteria for non-contributing demolition have not been met: the buildings are structurally sound, 412 has not been shown to be structurally unsound, and 414 has not been shown to meet the criteria for non-contributing buildings.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Nan Taylor

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Nay
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan	- Abstain
Thomas L. Thomson	- Nay
Robert Becker	- Aye

17. Petition of Wakely Properties, LLC | 23-004866-COA | 520 East Oglethorpe Avenue | New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass

- Staff Report 23-004866-COA 520 East Oglethorpe Ave.pdf
- Staff Research 520 E. Oglethorpe Ave..pdf
- Submittal Packet, Pt 1 520 E. Oglethorpe Ave.pdf
- Submittal Packet, Pt 2 520 E. Oglethorpe Ave.pdf
- Public Comment Amy Brock.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicants request of approval for New Construction, Part I- Height and Mass, for the property located at 520 East Oglethorpe Avenue. The plan is to construct a two-story commercial restaurant building. The current building on the site is a non-contributing resource approved for demolition, with a current address of 143 Houston Street. 520 East Oglethorpe Avenue is the new address of the current 143 Houston Street.

143 Houston Street was built in 1976 and is a non-contributing building within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. There are a mix of contributing residential and commercial resources in the vicinity of the property along with several non-contributing buildings as well. 143 Houston Street is currently a vacant building due to the fact that it was deemed structurally unsound. The applicant has stated that the CMU blocks, wood frame members, ceiling joists and rafters will be salvaged and reused. The non-contributing demolition of this property was approved by the Historic District Board of Review on June 14, 2023 [23-002527-COA].

Staff recommended to approve the request for New Construction, Part I- Height and Mass, for the property located at 520 Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted to the Board for review with Part II: Design Details, because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards for height and mass.

- 1. Provide details showing that the door frames window sashes will be inset not less than three (3) inches from the exterior surface of the façade of the building.
- 2. Provide details showing that the storefront glazing is inset at least four (4) inches from the face of the building.
- 3. Provide information regarding the percentage of storefront glazing on the Houston Street façade. Ensure it covers a minimum of 55% surface area.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Christina Swinson had no presentation but addressed the public comments. She stated waste management will be addressed in Part Two. She stated pavers will be installed for drainage.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ms. Ardis Wood asked about tree lawn (staying as is trees and sidewalk).

Mr. Steve Lieberman, area resident, stated he welcomes new neighbors, asked about waste management. Enclosure and drainage will cause problems, dumpsters will need

exhaust to minimize smell. He expressed concern about paving the lane for delivery trucks.

Mr. George Mack, area resident, stated the drainage goes toward his house, but welcomes the restaurant.

Ms. Michalak stated there are many issues covered with the city's site plan process.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board agreed with Staff recommendation and suggested the petitioner speak with the neighbors.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve New Construction, Part I-Height and Mass, for the property located at 520 Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted to the Board for review with Part II: Design Details, because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards for height and mass.

- 1.Provide details showing that the door frames and window sashes will be inset not less than three (3) inches from the exterior surface of the façade of the building.
- 2.Provide details showing that the storefront glazing is inset at least four (4) inches from the face of the building.
- 3. Provide information regarding the percentage of storefront glazing on the Houston Street façade. Ensure it covers a minimum of 55% surface area.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Abstain

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

- 18. Petition of Bethany Ralph | 23-004871-COA | 424 Habersham Street | After-the-Fact Fence and Gate
 - Staff Report 23-004871-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 424 Habersham St.pdf
 - Staff Research 424 Habersham St.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request for approval of an after-the-fact fence installation and also construction of two brick columns to support a set of antique wooden gates for the property located at 424 Habersham Street. The structure was built in 1896 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. It is a two-story wood-framed house on a trust lot, facing Whitefield Square. There is a very similar house directly next door on the trust lot,

426 Habersham Street. There are several other wood-framed structures in the vicinity.

The applicant made an in-kind fence replacement without a COA. Based on Google Street View photos between 2012-2022, this can be verified that the new fence was placed in the same location as the old one. In the older photos, there is a small storage shed built in the same plane as the fence. It is highly overgrown with vines but there is concrete block beneath the foliage. Where there had been a shingle roof, it looks like the applicant added some height using the same material as the fence and added a corrugated metal roof. The applicant has a variety of elements proposed to be added to this project, including brick columns and two antique wooden gates. Included with the work is the addition of two stone griffons to be placed atop the brick columns. This decorative element is something not typically reviewed, but in order to provide the full project scope, it is mentioned here.

Staff recommended to approve the after-the-fact fence installation and the proposed installation of brick columns and antique wood gates with the following conditions because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Provides a scaled, dimensioned drawing to clarify the height of each element.
- 2. Provide a brick sample that shows it will closely match the brick pier foundation of the house.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Bethany Ralph, petitioner, the height is seven inches shorter - the existing was 6 feet but not installed properly. She is asking for the inappropriate driveway gates to be pardoned. The Price Street side did not align with the Taylor Street side. To level it, it was made shorter. The shed is same height - the top of it was asphalt, and used metal covering for the porch. The height of the gate was to compliment the sidewalk and the piers below the dog ears, there is a two-inch discrepancy. The bricks are the same as the foundation bricks - which are painted. She stated she will do what the Board requests, though she believes architectural drawings to be a major expense for minor work.

Mr. Becker asked when was shed installed and permitted. **Ms. Ralph** stated it was there when the property was purchased, on cement block and covered by vines.

Mr. Higgins asked was there discussion about obtaining a COA with contractor. **Ms. Ralph** responded, no, thought it could be replaced in-kind without one.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones stated the materials were problematic for Victorian - the gates imported from India and that it is semi painted. Cement or cast gryphons are not appropriate. The actual gryphons need to be shown and need to be stone.

Ms. Ralph stated dog-eared fences are all over the historic areas. She stated there are gryphons across the street and cement pineapples. The gryphons are same as what she presented in pictures.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Becker has issues with shed if not shielded which should have been on the interior. Shed should be considered as well and recommended to continue because the fence is only a portion of the issue.

Ms. Guinn stated she does not like to review after-the-fact projects. She suggested more details provided on the gryphons, not just scale and dimensions, the doors also.

Mr. Higgins stated it should be continued because there is an incomplete picture provided. Need to see what finished project is to be by scale, particularly the height.

Mr. Thomson stated it should be continued and should be put together in a visually compatible way.

Ms. Taylor stated the whole picture needs to be seen, with scaled drawings. The misrepresentation is concerning, as well as about the bricks.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request for an after-the-fact fence installation and the proposed installation of brick columns and antique wood gates for the property located at 424 Habersham Street to the November 8, 2023, Historic District Board of Review meeting to provide the applicant time to address the following:

- 1.Provide a scaled, dimensioned drawing to clarify the height of each element.
- 2. Provide a brick sample that shows it will closely match the brick pier foundation of the house.
- 3. Provide other material samples and photographs.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Nan Taylor

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Abstain

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

- 19. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 23-004869-COA | 503 East Bay Street | Factors Walk Addition/Alteration

 - Submittal Packet 503 E Bay St.pdf
 - @RIVER STREET VISION AND GATEWAY PLAN September 2010.pdf
 - @H-20110623-4463-2.pdf
 - Public Comment Andrew Jones 503 E. Bay.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request for approval to add a platform to Upper Factors Walk near the property located at 503 East Bay Street. The work also includes modifications to the handrail of the existing bridge to which the platform will be connected in order to create gates onto the platform in two locations.

Per the applicant:

The property owner is proposing to convert the existing building into an event space and would like to create an outdoor terrace seating area at the front of the building. The project proposal expands the bridge area to the west of the current concrete connector to allow for a limited terrace seating area that will serve the building. The seating area will be constructed at the level of the existing bridge, allowing for a flush transition. The structure is planned to be constructed of painted steel beams/handrails and the finish surface of the terrace area will be 6" T&G stained IPE wood decking.

The bridge was most recently reconstructed in early 2023 due to damage from a vehicle that struck the supporting column in 2022. The addition is proposed to be compatible with the renovation materials and will be similar to other bridge/terrace conditions found along the Bay Street/Factors Walk corridor. Most similar to this proposal are the terraces at Vic's on the River and the Cotton Sail Inn. Both projects have a steel framed structure and a wood terrace surface. In both projects the steel handrails are also notably different from the historic handrails, which is also part of this current proposal.

The applicant provided an extensive history of the building and bridges that connect the building back to the top of the bluff. The bridges have, generally, always been in the same configuration that they are now; the area proposed to be covered has never been covered historically. This is unlike the area outside Vic's on the River which was covered historically and a portion of which is now covered again per a COA issued in 2011 [File No. H-110623-4463-2].

In 2010, the River Street Vision and Gateway Plan was drafted. Although never formally adopted by the Mayor and Aldermen, it provides valuable information regarding Factors Walk. The document states that "... pedestrian bridges allowing public access to Upper and Mid-Level Factors Walk should be encouraged yet meet ADA requirements. Smaller bridges provide natural light, better visibility and safer pedestrian experience. Additionally, air is able to filter down to Lower Factors Walk creating a more inviting atmosphere. Any new bridges should be constructed of iron or steel, be well-crafted and in a design that reflects the historic utilitarian use of Factors Walk.

Newly constructed infrastructure along Factors Walk should also respect historic structures in design and materials. Any fencing should be of iron or use compatible contemporary material that is pedestrian-scale but clearly a bridge of the 21st century, well-designed and light in appearance. The historic ballast block walls should be retained and preserved. Attachments to these walls should be minimal and carefully considered by a licensed engineer. No parts of the historic walls should be removed, covered or obscured. Structural support for a walk system should be from the mainland and the adjacent buildings as much as possible."

Staff finds that the document supports the proposal.

Staff recommended to approve the request to add a platform to Upper Factors Walk near the property located at 503 East Bay Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the preservation standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Becky Lynch, petitioner, stated the bridge is not obscuring an active point of Factors Walk and it is reversible. There is definition between the old and new. She stated they have presented the best design option, as it is least invasive.

Ms. Taylor asked about the size. Ms. Lynch replied it is close in size to the bridge in front of *Vic's on the River.*

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Steven Woods, DNA, opposes because the precedent area has always been covered by a platform, but this area is not. The River Street Gateway plan does not apply. This sets a bad precedent, soon Factor's Walk will lose itis distinct features.

Mr. Andrew Jones, of the Oglethorpe Coalition, expressed opposition to the project because it alters the character of area. It covers the lower level, unlike the *Vic's on the River* bridge. He stated it does not fit the visual element. It changes the fundamental character and is not in compliance with ordinance.

Mr. Charles Roberts, of the Old Harbor Inn, supported the project and believed it to be in line with current development.

Ms. Sabrina Nagel stated it takes away from the natural light. Artificial light will not replace natural light and opposed the project.

Ms. Lynch stated it is a very small footprint and there is a clear delineation of the new versus the old.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

Mr. Becker highlighted the 2010 gateway document. He stated the original character should be maintained. This project contributes to changing the open space and look.

Ms. Guinn stated she does not have an issue with the design; has concern with the vacant space. Factor's Walk is an unappreciated area and a great place to see the city. She stated she found it hard to support the petition.

Mr. Higgins stated he had no problem with the design, but concerns with infill and the precedent it will set.

Mr. Thomson stated he disagreed with staff recommendation to approve the petition.

Additionally, the Board expressed concern that the platform would change the character of the Factors Walk bridges. Also that the examples used by both staff and the applicant of other similar decks are not visually related.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny to add a platform to Upper Factors Walk near the property located at 503 East Bay Street because the work is not visually compatible or visually related to historic structures and is inconsistent with the rhythm of structures on the street.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robert Becker Second: Karen Guinn

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Abstain

Thomas L. Thomson - Nay

Robert Becker - Aye

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny to add a platform to Upper Factors Walk near the property located at 503 East Bay Street because the work is not visually compatible or visually related to historic structures and is inconsistent with the rhythm of structures on the street.

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

20. Petition of Studio Mc+G Architecture | 23-004875-COA | 2-14 East Bryan Street | Rehabilitation, Alterations, and Additions

- Staff Report 23-004875-COA 2-14 E Bryan St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 1 2-14 E Bryan St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 2 2-14 E Bryan St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 3 2-14 E Bryan St.pdf
- Staff Research Sanborn Maps.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for rehabilitation, alterations, and rooftop additions for the buildings located at 2-14 East Bryan Street; they will become a Ritz Carlton hotel and residences.

- 2 East Bryan Street, which is a contributing building, will be preserved and restored. The scope of work includes:
 - -Replace the front door with a new door to match the original.
 - -Install new awnings along Bull and Bryan Streets that are inspired by a historic photo.
 - -The stone façade will be restored and repaired as needed.
 - -The existing windows will remain; the frames will be painted black.
 - -New openings in east façade to allow for connection to 14 East Bryan Street.
 - -New mechanical equipment on the roof to replace existing equipment.

For 14 East Bryan Street, which is a non-contributing building, the applicant "proposes an addition of an 11th and 12th floor of residences, within a 12-story height map location, along with a limited bonus floor (level 13) to allow for a small kitchen to service the proposed pool deck." The scope of work also includes the following:

- -Restaurant "outdoor" seating within the building footprint but covered with a new terrace above facing Bryan Street.
- -Exterior balcony with metal rail at level two.
- -New metal cladding on 12th floor addition.
- -New mechanical equipment to be screened.
- -New balcony doors on the north and south facades "along with limited new doorways on the east side." New balconies are proposed along the south side and Juliet balconies are

proposed on the east and north sides.

- -New sconces and lighting fixtures on the façade and balconies.
- -Storefront on floors 1 and 2 and windows to be replaced with new insulated glazing with black frames.

2 East Bryan Street was constructed in 1915 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. 14 East Bryan Street was constructed in 1976 and is a non-contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. The surrounding context consists of a mix of contributing and non-contributing buildings both tall and short.

Staff recommended approval for rehabilitation, alterations, and rooftop additions for the buildings located at 2-14 East Bryan Street with the following conditions because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the proposed entrance doors on the contributing building to wood.
- 2. Add an operable component to the new windows on the 11th floor facing Bryan Street or apply for a Special Exception in order to match the other windows on this façade which are not operable.
- 3. The awnings must have a minimum vertical clearance of 8 feet above the sidewalk.
- 4. The electrical equipment must be on the rear façade and minimally visible from view; illustrate the location on the site plan.
- 5. The refuse storage area must be located within the building or to the rear of the building and screening from the public right-of-way; illustrate the location on the site plan.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Jennifer McConny stated it will be difficult to modify offices to hotel/residence. The ground floor will be for office use.

Mr. Thomson asked how many hotel residences are proposed. **Ms. McConny** responded 100 hotel rooms and 20 residences.

Ms. McConny provided additional specific details regarding the proposed structure.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones expressed concerned with east facade drawings. Being city's tallest building, a lot of proposed additions will change the skyline.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated his agency was glad to see rehabilitation. They find the improvements appropriate to reactivate the ground level. They are also glad to see residences back to an area that is all commercial at this time.

Ms. Sabrina Nagel expressed support for the petition. Expressed concern regarding the existing palms; hopes the palms will stay.

Ms. McConny assured that the palms will stay.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

Ms. Taylor stated there is a good design on the annex; helps obscure height and agrees with staff.

Mr. Thomson agreed with staff recommendation. Expressed that it is good to see residential return in the area.

Ms. Isaacs stated she is happy to see mixed use in the area and it feels appropriate.

Ms. Guinn supported the petition.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve rehabilitation, alterations, and rooftop additions for the buildings located at 2-14 East Bryan Street with the following conditions because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Revise the proposed entrance doors on the contributing building to wood.
- 2.Add an operable component to the new windows on the 11th floor facing Bryan Street or apply for a Special Exception in order to match the other windows on this façade which are not operable.
- 3. The awnings must have a minimum vertical clearance of 8 feet above the sidewalk.
- 4. The electrical equipment must be on the rear façade and minimally visible from view; illustrate the location on the site plan.
- 5. The refuse storage area must be located within the building or to the rear of the building and screening from the public right-of-way; illustrate the location on the site plan.
- 6. Provide further details of how awnings will be attached to the historic façade.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: Michael Higgins

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Abstain

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

- 21. Petition of Sottile & Sottile | 23-004876-COA | 202 East Gwinnett Street | New Construction, Small (Part I), Addition, and Variance Recommendation Request
 - Staff Report 23-004876-COA 202 E Gwinnett St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 202 E Gwinnett St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 202 E Gwinnett St Variance Recommendation Request.pdf
 - Sanborn Maps.pdf
 - Previous COA Permit Drawings.pdf
 - Public Comment 202 East Gwinnett Andrew Jones.pdf
 - **Ms. Leah Michalak** presented the applicant's request of approval for New Construction, Small (Part I) for a two-story carriage house and for a rear porch addition for the main building for the property located at 202 East Gwinnett Street. The carriage house will be constructed using the existing one-story garage structure; the second floor will be added

above. Three vehicular gates will be added along the lane where a section of the masonry fence is currently missing.

A Variance Recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals is requested from the standard that reads as follows:

Sec 8.7 - Accessory Structures and Uses:

The building footprint of the accessory dwelling unit shall ... not to exceed 700 square feet.

In order to allow the footprint to be 760 square feet, which is the existing footprint of the garage.

On August 12, 2020, the HDBR issued a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to this property [File No. 20-003376-COA]; this work is underway.

The historic main building was constructed in 1882 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Local Historic District. The large rear porch was constructed during alterations to the building in 1895, and by 1916 the rear porch had been enclosed with wood siding; now altered again under the current COA issued in 2020, the rear façade has a regular rhythm of large openings with columns between to read as the previously enclosed porch. The existing garage structure does not appear on the Sanborn Maps and does not appear on the Historic Buildings Map. Staff estimates, based on the architectural design, that it was constructed in the 1990s-2000s; possibly even since the last time the map was updated in 2011. A 1994 COA shows that area as only a concrete slab.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Christian Sottile, petitioner, agreed with staff recommendation and will bring the porch information with Part 2. He stated he will comply with conditions.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Jim Hundsrucker gave a history of the property and asked about the carriage house. He expressed concern with the pool having no wall and asked about tenant parking.

Mr. Andrew Jones stated the design is too elaborate for a carriage house. Historically carriage houses are much simpler. This gives a false sense of history and its utilitarian use.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, agreed with the Staff recommendation, as it is a common roof style.

Mr. Sottile stated the design is appropriate; proposing a new brick wall in north side of the garden.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

Ms. Taylor agreed with Staff recommendation. She stated it is a bit elaborate but doesn't present false sense of history. It does need a variance.

Mr. Thomson stated he agreed with Staff recommendation.

Mr. Higgins stated the hip roof is appropriate and agreed with Special Exception. The decorative elements could be toned down a bit; it is almost too elaborate.

Mr. Becker stated it is a bit elaborate for carriage house, and supports Staff recommendations.

Ms. Isaacs stated it is too elaborate. She questioned the appropriateness of balconies on

the carriage house.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

Approve New Construction, Small (Part I) for a two-story carriage house and for a rear porch addition for the main building for the property located at 202 East Gwinnett Street with the following conditions to be submitted to the Board for review with Part II, Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Provide additional information regarding the connection of the new porch addition to the historic building and if it will require removal of or damage to any historic materials and that it is reversible.
- 2. Provide the depth of the balconies on the carriage house; they must be a maximum of 3 feet deep.
- 3. Eaves on the carriage house must overhang a minimum of 8 inches.
- 4. Apply for a Special Exception for the roof shape on the carriage house or revise the roof shape; a hip roof is proposed however, the ordinance requires side gable, hip with parapet, flat or shed hidden by a parapet.

AND

Approve a Variance Recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals from the standard that reads as follows:

Sec 8.7 - Accessory Structures and Uses:

The building footprint of the accessory dwelling unit shall ... not to exceed 700 square feet.

In order to allow the footprint to be 760 square feet, which is the existing footprint of the garage, because the variance criteria are met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Nan Taylor

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Stan Houle - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Abstain

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

22. Acknowledgement and approval of Staff-approved petitions.

Motion

Approve Staff approved petitions.

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

- 23. Petition of Sign D'Sign | 23-0048494-COA | 301 Habersham Street | Projecting Sign
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004849-COA 301 Habersham St.pdf
- 24. Petition of Lynch Architects | 23-004868-COA | 132 E Broughton Street | Mechanical equipment
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004868-COA 132 E Brougton.pdf
- 25. Petition of Littles on Liberty | 23-004684-COA | 129 E. Liberty St | Non-illuminated lettered wall sign
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004684-COA 129 E Liberty.pdf
- 26. Petition of Zach Belger | 23-004938-COA | 513 East Jones Street | Roof replacement
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004938-COA 513 E Jones St.pdf
- 27. Petition of Robin Restoration | 23-004688-COA | 220 East Liberty Street | Stucco replacement
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004688-COA 220 E Liberty.pdf
- 28. Petition of Steve Bodek | 23-004680-COA | 520 Howard Street | Brick repointing and trim repair
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004680-COA 520 Howard St.pdf
- 29. Petition of Steve Bodek | 23-004679-COA | 206 East Taylor Street | Woodwork repair
 - SIGNED Decision 23-004679-COA 206 E Taylor St.pdf
- 30. Petition of Coastal Canvas | 23-004672-COA | 424 West Broughton Street | Re-cover existing awnings
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004672-COA 424 W Broughton St.pdf
- 31. Petition of Peter Thompson | 23-004658-COA | 535, 537 E Harris Street | Repair damaged siding
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004658-COA 535-537 E Harris St.pdf
- 32. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 23-004675-COA | 412 Williamsson Street (Mercantile) | Externally illuminated projecting wall sign on front facade.
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004675-COA 412 WIlliamson St (Mercantile).pdf
- 33. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 23-004675-COA | 412 Williamsson Street (Wine Time) | Externally illuminated projecting wall sign on front facade
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004676-COA 412 WIlliamson St (Wine Time).pdf
- 34. Petition of Eduardo Rivas | 23-004677-COA | 408 Bull Street | Re-cover tow awnings
 - SIGNED Staff Decision -23-004677-COA 408 Bull St.pdf
- 35. Petition of Fast Signs | 23-004681-COA | 311 W Broughton St | Installation of a non-illuminated projecting sign
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004681-COA 311 W Broughton St.pdf
- 36. Petition of WIlliam Campbell | 23-004841-COA | 204 East Liberty Street | Replace two fence gates

- SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004841-COA 204 E Liberty St.pdf
- 37. Petition of Roofhunters | 23-004291-COA | 23-004291-COA | 110 W Gordon Street | In-kind roof replacement
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-004291-COA 110 W Gordon St.pdf
- 38. Petition of Danyel Leathers | 23-003179-COA | 1120 Barnard Street | Stucco repair and window replacement
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-003179-COA 1120 Barnard St.pdf

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 39. Violations October Report (4 Items)
 - Violations Report October 2023.pdf

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

- 40. Items Deferred to Staff October Report (1 Item)
 - Items Deferred to Staff October Report.pdf

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 41. Inspections October Report (2 Items)
 - Inspections October 2023 Report.pdf
- 42. Stamped Drawings October Report (10 Items)
 - Stamped Drawings October 2023 Report.pdf

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

- 43. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting Wednesday November 8, 2023 at 12pm 112 East State Street
- 44. Next HDBR Regular Meeting Wednesday November 8, 2023 at 1pm 112 East State Street
- 45. Adjourn

3:40

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.