

# Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
April 12, 2023 1:00 PM
MINUTES

# April 12, 2023 Historic District Board of Review

A Pre-Meeting will was held at 12:00 PM in the Jerry Surrency Conference Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted. No testimony was received and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Ellie Isaacs, Chair

David Altschiller Karen Guinn Michael Higgins Stan Houle Melissa Rowan Nan Taylor

Thomas Thomson

**Members Absent:** 

MPC Staff Present: Melanie Wilson, Executive Director

Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation

Ethan Hageman, Assistant Planner James Zerillo, Assistant Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant Warren Durrer, Administrative Assistant

- I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME
- **II. SIGN POSTING**
- **III. CONSENT AGENDA** 
  - 1. Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 23-001243-COA | 331 Barnard Street | Amendment to Previous COA
    - Staff Report 23-001243-COA 331 Barnard St.pdf
    - Submittal Packet 331 Barnard St.pdf
    - Staff Photos.pdf

## Motion

The Historic Board of Review motioned for approval of amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation and additions for the property located at 331 Barnard Street, also known as the Israel Dasher House [File No. 22-000177-COA] as requested because the proposed changes are visually compatible and meet the standards.

Mr. Houle motioned in favor of the motion.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Not Present

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

## 2. Petition of Proper Construction and Design | 23-001249-COA | 603 Whitaker Street | Rehabilitation

- Staff Report 23-001249-COA 603 Whitaker Street
- Submittal Packet 603 Whitaker Street
- Staff Research

### Motion

The Historic Board of Review motioned for approval for the request for rehabilitation to the contributing single-family house located at 603 Whitaker Street with the following conditions, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Do not replace any windows without Staff documentation and review.

The repairs to the exterior walls must be painted to match the existing color of the house.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye

**MINUTES** 

Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Not Present

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

# 3. Petition of TC Construction, Travis Cormack | 23-001256-COA | 419 East Taylor Street | Alterations

- Submittal Packet 419 E. Taylor.pdf
- Staff Report 23-001256-COA 419 E Taylor St.pdf
- Staff Research 419 E. Taylor.pdf

#### Motion

The Historic Board of Review motioned to approve the request for alterations at 419 East Taylor Street with the following condition to be submitted to Staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Provide a dimension for the distance between the fence on the south facade and the parallel building wall and ensure it meets the 5-foot minimum standard.

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic District Board of Review meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic District Board of Review at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.

MW: LGM: JZ

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Not Present

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

### IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

4. Adopt the April 12, 2023 Agenda

#### **Motion**

The Historic Board of Review motioned to approve the April 12, 2023 HDBR Agenda as presented.

Mr. Houle seconded and voted in favor of the motion.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second:

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Not Present

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

## **V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

5. Approve March 8, 2023, HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

## ∅ 03.08.23 MINUTES.pdf

### **Motion**

The Historic Board of Review motioned to approve the March 8, 2023 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

Mr. Houle abstained from voting as he was not on the Board for that meeting.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Not Present

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

## VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

### **VII. CONTINUED AGENDA**

#### **VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**

### IX. REGULAR AGENDA

- 6. Petition of Felder & Associates | 23-0000197-COA | 27 Barnard Street | Alterations and Additions
  - Staff Report 23-000197-COA 27 Barnard St.pdf
  - Submittal Packet 27 Barnard St.pdf
  - Previous Submittal Packet.pdf

  - @1970s COA and photos.pdf
  - @1980s photos.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for alterations to the property located at 27 Barnard Street. This historic building was constructed in 1848 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Downtown Historic District. The building is part of a row (and collection) of similar buildings that make up City Market. They are all a vernacular "style" with basic masonry construction, simple headers and sills, and very little decoration.

Historically, this building has always been multiple commercial uses. Sanborn Maps from 1884-1973 (see attached) illustrate this. A (one-story?) wood porch or awning spans the width of the east façade (facing the original City Market) through the 1916 Sanborn Map. It is replaced by a one-story metal porch or awning by 1955 and is gone altogether in the 1973 map. A small metal canopy is present in the 1970s photographs. Clearly, the types and arrangements of awnings have changed many times on this building historically; the rest of the building arrangement (externally) appears to remain the same. Staff located a COA from the late 1970s for a rehabilitation of this building (see attached); however, could not located any approvals for the porch that currently exists on the east side of the building. Staff has been told in the past, that it was constructed without a COA by Wild Wing when it moved into the space c.2005. Wild Wing recently vacated the space.

Staff recommended to approve alterations to the property located at 27 Barnard Street with the following conditions because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. All signage must return to the Board for a COA.
- 2. All awnings must have a minimum vertical clearance of eight (8) feet above the sidewalk.

# **PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:**

Ryan Claus, petitioner, stated the lintels will be embedded with epoxy; don't want to fasten to the brick or drill through the wood. The flower boxes will go below the lintels. They will be held with mortar and epoxy to ensure there are no voids for water infiltration.

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

There was no public comment.

## **BOARD COMMENTS:**

There was no Board discussion.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve alterations to the property located at 27 Barnard Street with the following conditions because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.All signage must return to the Board for a COA.
- 2.All awnings must have a minimum vertical clearance of eight (8) feet above the sidewalk.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

# Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan Second: Melissa Memory

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Not Present

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

## 7. Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 23-001244-COA | 405 East Charlton Street | Alterations

- Staff Report 23-001244-COA 405 E Charlton St.pdf
- Staff Research 405 East Charlton Street.pdf
- Submittal Packet 405 EAST CHARLTON.pdf

**Mr. James Zerillo** presented the petitioner's request of approval for alterations at 405 East Charlton Street. The scope of work is described by the petitioner as the following: "North Façade: Existing non-historic stoop railing will be replaced with more decorative iron railing. The new pickets will closely resemble the existing window grilles at the parlor level.

Wood rot along the soffit will be repaired, a new pre-finished metal chimney cap will be installed, and a new skylight will replace an older damaged one.

**South Façade:** Two windows will receive new operable composite louvered shutters with adequate hardware. The historic hinges still exist on the window jambs and will be re-used where functional.

A non-historic metal canopy will be removed from the upper floor and replaced with a retractable black canvas awning. A matching awning will be installed over the balcony below.

**West Façade:** The pre-finished metal chimneys caps discussed above are the only changes that will be visible from the west."

The historic building was constructed in 1882 and is a contributing resource within the Downtown Local Historic District. The 1996-1998 survey card states that this row of

buildings (405-411 East Charlton) on East Charlton Street was constructed for M.S. Dale. The survey card also mentions that these townhomes were renovated in the 1970s. The survey card also states that the subject property was constructed eight years after the other units in the row. This block of East Charlton Street is primarily residential. Both sides of this block of East Charlton have a row of multi-unit townhomes. Opposite the subject property is a row of similar, Italianate townhomes. Adjacent to the subject property is a smaller, single-family residence that is set back from the sidewalk. The row of townhomes at 405-411 East Charlton all have identical front porch stoops. The front porch railings of these units are non-historic and were likely changed to the existing design during the 1970s renovations.

Staff recommended to approve the request for alterations at 405 East Charlton Street, with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Revise the design of the new porch railing to include a transition element (such as a Newell post) to separate the subject railing from the neighboring railing.

## **PETITIONER'S COMMENTS**:

**Mr. Josh Ward**, petitioner, stated they will work with staff to create a transition piece for the two types of railing.

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

There was no public comment.

# **BOARD COMMENTS:**

### **Motion**

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for alterations at 405 East Charlton Street, with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1.Revise the design of the new porch railing to include a transition element (such as a Newell post) to separate the subject railing from the neighboring railing.

Mr. Houle motion to approve Staff recommendation and in voted in favor of the motion.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion:

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Not Present

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson

- Aye

- 8. Petition of Architecture 101 | 23-001257-COA | 126 East Broughton Street | Alteration
  - Staff Report 23-001257-COA 126 East Broughton Street
  - Submittal Packet 126 East Broughton Street
  - Staff Research

**Mr. Ethan Hageman** presented the petitioner's request for approval for alterations to restore the original front façade and storefront of the contributing building located at **126 East Broughton Street.** 

The project description is listed below per the petitioner:

"We are renovating the existing structure at 126 East Broughton Street. There is no work proposed on the rear façade of the building. On the front façade we propose removing the non-historic entrance on the first floor and the non-historic windows on the second floor while maintaining the historic openings. The windows on the second floor will be replaced in a pattern consistent with the historic photograph provided on G000. The historic storefront that was removed is not intended to be replicated. A new wood-trimmed storefront is proposed on the first floor which is visually compatible with local historic context as shown on G000 as well."

126 East Broughton Street is currently a vacant storefront. Planet Fun intends to renovate and alter the existing storefront to use it as their new store. East Broughton Street is primarily mixed-use in nature with commercial uses existing on the first floor and residential uses existing on the upper floors. 126 East Broughton Street received staff approval on December 19, 2018, for the removal of the jalousie windows to be replaced with the *Marvin Ultimate*, wood French casement windows and transoms above. The changes to the Jalousie windows were never undertaken as they presently exist today.

Staff recommended approval for alterations to restore the original front façade and storefront of the contributing building located at 126 East Broughton Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

## **PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Steve Stowers**, petitioner, welcomed questions from the Board. **Ms. Taylor** asked about the entry, if there are any historic photos. **Mr. Stowers** stated they tried to match the small amount of historic fabric and the other historic storefronts. **Ms. Taylor** stated they would like to exhaust all options to find a historic photo. **Mr. Stowers** stated that has been done.

**Mr. Houle** stated the front doors of the other stores appear recessed. **Mr. Stowers** stated that it is recessed about 5'8" to match the others.

# **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

There was no public comment.

## **BOARD COMMENTS:**

**Ms. Taylor** expressed concern if there has been enough investigation for historic photos of the area.

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
April 12, 2023 1:00 PM
MINUTES

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for alterations to restore the original front façade and storefront of the contributing building located at 126 East Broughton Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Mr. Houle motioned to approve Staff recommendation and voted in favor the motion.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion:

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Nay
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Not Present

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

### X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

9. Acknowledgement of Staff-approved petitions.

### **Motion**

Acknowledged as presented.

## Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

- 10. Petition of Your Exterior Pros | 23-001152-COA | 524 Nicoll Street | Siding and deck repair
  - SIGNED Staff Decision -23-001152-COA 524 Nicoll St (003).pdf
- 11. Petition of Mate' Factor | 23-001565-COA | 402 East Hall Street | Concrete retaining wall repair with in-kind materials.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001565-COA 402 E Hall St.pdf
- 12. Petition of Shah Architecture | 23-001574-COA | 124 East McDonough Street | In-kind repair to iron and wood balconies on front facade.
- 13. Petition of Andrew Coody | 23-001354-COA | 554 East Liberty Street | Removal of rear yard concrete block wall.

- SIGNED Staff Decision -23-001354-COA 554 E Liberty Street.pdf
- 14. Petition of Jared Colli | 623, 625 Montgomery Street, 402 412 West Hall Street | Color change and brick repointing.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001361-COA 623 Montgomery St (1).pdf
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001363-COA 625 Montgomery St.pdf
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001376-COA 402 W Hall St.pdf
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001374-COA 404 W Hall St.pdf
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001371-COA 406 W Hall St.pdf
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001367-COA 408 W Hall St.pdf
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001369-COA 410 W Hall St.pdf
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001365-COA 412 W Hall St.pdf
- 15. Petition of Lord Aeck Sargent | 23-001566-COA | 223 Bull Street | Addition of louvers into three existing window frames.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001566-COA 223 Bull St.pdf
- 16. Petition of Your Exterior Pros | 23-001150-COA| 538 East Hall Street | Porch and siding repairs.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision -23-001150-COA 538 E Hall St.pdf
- 17. Petition of Ellsworth Design Build | 23-001474-COA | 535 East Perry Street | Amend 23-000664-COA for installation of gutters to front facade.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001474-COA 535 East Perry Street.pdf
- 18. Petition of Roofcrafters | 23-001278-COA | 228 MLK | In-kind steel replacement gutters and downspouts.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001278-COA 228 MLK.pdf
- 19. Petition of Noble Hardee House Condominium Association | 23-001479-COA | 501 East Charlton Street | Color change.
- 20. Petition of Byck Management | 23-000133-COA | 234, 236, 24 Bull St | Lettered wall signs with conditions.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001260-COA 234, 236, 240 Bull St.pdf
- 21. Petition of Barbara Cogdell | 23-001356-COA | 517 East Congress Street | Re-shingle roof.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001356-COA 517 East Congress Street.pdf
- 22. Petition of Rebecca Bustinduy | 23-001153-COA | 409 Whitaker Street | Window sign
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001153-COA 409 Whitaker Street.pdf
- 23. Petition of Yan Polansky | 23-001279-COA | 304 East State Street | Replace shutters, in-kind.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001279-COA 304 E State St.pdf
- 24. Petition of William Frick | 23-001277-COA | 114 East Jones Street | Amend 22-005065-COA: Revise the exterior wall, downspout, and front and rear step.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision -23-001277-COA 114 E Jones St.pdf
- 25. Petition of Broad Street Interiors | 23-000950-COA | 209 East Broad Street | Color change.

- SIGNED Staff Decision 23-000950-COA 209 E. Broad St..pdf
- 26. Petition of Sara Pennak | 23-001250-COA | 522 Blair Street | Paint front door.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001250-COA 522 Blair Street.pdf
- 27. Petition of Pinyan Company | 23-001045-COA | 508 East Factor's Walk | Walkway replacement.
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-001045-COA 508 E Factor's Walk.pdf
- 28. Petition of Farrell Click | 23-000792-COA | 424 E President Street | Awning installation
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-000792-COA 424 E President.pdf

## XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 29. Report on Work Done Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the April 12, 2023 HDBR Meeting
  - Report on Work Performed Without a COA April 2023 HDBR.pdf
- 30. Report on Work Done Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the April 12, 2023 HDBR Meeting
  - Work Which Exceeds the Scope of Issued COA April 2023 Report.pdf
- 31. Report on Work Done Which Is Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the April 12, 2023 HDBR Meeting
  - Work Which is Inconsistent With an Issued COA April 2023 HDBR.pdf

### XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

- 32. Items Deferred to Staff April Report
  - ## Items Deferred to Staff April Report.pdf

# XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 33. Inspections Completed by Staff April Report
  - Inspections Completed by Staff April 2023 Report.pdf
- 34. Stamped Drawings April Report
  - Stamped Drawings April 2023 Report.pdf

### **XIV. OTHER BUSINESS**

### XV. ADJOURNMENT

- 35. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting Wednesday May 10, 2023 at 12pm 112 East State Street
- 36. Next HDBR Regular Meeting Wednesday May 10, 2023 at 1pm 112 East State Street
- 37. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the April 12, 2023 Historic District Board of Review adjourned at 1:35 p.m.

Sincerely,

Leah G. Michalak Director of Historic Preservation Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
April 12, 2023 1:00 PM
MINUTES

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.