

# Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street May 10, 2023 1:00 PM MINUTES

# May 10, 2023 Historic District Board of Review

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM in the Mendonsa Hearing Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present:	Ellie Isaacs, Chair
	David Altschiller
	Karen Guinn
	Michael Higgins
	Stan Houle
	Melissa Rowan
	Nan Taylor
	Thomas Thomson

- Members Absent: Michael Higgins
- MPC Staff Present: Melanie Wilson, Executive Director Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation James Zerillo, Assistant Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant Warren Durrer, Administrative Assistant Hind Patel, Information Technology

# I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

### **II. SIGN POSTING**

### **III. CONSENT AGENDA**

### 1. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 23-001893-COA | 110 West Congress Street | Awning

# Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to install an awning for the property located at 110 West Congress Street, known as Madame Butterfly with the following conditions because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. The awning must receive an encroachment permit.

2. The installation of the awning hardware shall not damage the historic materials.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Karen Guinn	
Second: Nan Taylor	
Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Not Present
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

### 2. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 23-001942-COA | 151 West Bryan Street | Illuminated Sign

#### Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for an illuminated sign at 151 West Bryan Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Clarify the horizontal distance between the sign and the curb line and ensure it meets the standard.

2. Revise the design of the sign to include reverse silhouette or cut-out letters.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn	
Second: Nan Taylor	
Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Not Present
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

#### **IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

#### 3. Adopt the May 10, 2023 Agenda

Motion

the Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned to approve the May 10, 2023 Agenda.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: David Altschiller	
Second: Melissa H. Rowan	
Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Not Present
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

### V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

#### 4. Approve April 12, 2023 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the April 12, 2023 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson	
Second: Nan Taylor	
Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Not Present
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

### VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

#### **VII. CONTINUED AGENDA**

#### **VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**

### IX. REGULAR AGENDA

5. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 23-001945-COA | 3 MLK, Jr. Blvd. | Amendments

**Ms. Leah Michalak** presented the petitioner's request to amend a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness [File No. 22-000171-COA] for rehabilitation and alterations to the property located at 3 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. The amendments include the following:

-Expanded terrace along the north façade of the building.

- -Windows have changed to multi-lite configurations and one window sill on the north façade lowered to become a door opening for ADA access into the building.
- -The fabric awnings have been changed to a metal canopy that wraps the corner of the building.

Staff recommended approval for the request to amend a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness [File No. 22-000171-COA] for rehabilitation and alterations to the property located at 3 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. with the following conditions because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Redesign the awning that wraps the corner of the building to have a transparent roof (similar to the examples provided in the submittal packet) in order to lessen the visual impact on the historic facades.
- 2. The historic painted signs (one on east façade and one on north façade) shall not be damaged and shall remain intact.
- 3. Ensure the proper encroachment permits for the terrace along River Street are received prior to commencement of work.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Andrew Lynch**, agent for the owner, thanked Staff for support. The owners stated there is space in the rear for refuse. The petitioners take no exception to Staff comments. Regarding Staff Comment 1, the translucent paneling rather than metal poses concern regarding maintenance cleaning from tree debris. The pitch was lowered to minimize impact from the street and reconsideration regarding that was requested.

# PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

# BOARD COMMENTS:

**Ms. Guinn** stated the petitioners concern regarding the metal versus translucent covering is valid, considering the tree canopy. She suggested finding an alternative. **Ms. Taylor** stated the redesigned corner is nice, as it connects the two streets. She agreed with Staff's transparent covering condition because the area is so large that other materials would be a distraction. **Mr. Houle** agrees with Staff recommendation.

Mr. Houle motioned to approve the petitioner's request with conditions.

### Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to amend a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness [File No. 22-000171-COA] for rehabilitation and alterations to the property located at 3 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. with the following conditions because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. The historic painted signs (one on east façade and one on north façade) shall not be damaged and shall remain intact.

2.Ensure the proper encroachment permits for the terrace along River Street are received prior to commencement of work.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (	Approved )
----------------	------------

- Not Present
- Not Present
- Aye
- Aye
- Abstain
- Aye
- Not Present
- Aye
- Aye

# 6. Petition of Patrick Phelps, Hansen Architects | 23-001939-COA | 641 Indian Street | Alterations

\*\***Ms. Rowan** disclosed she has a relationship with the owner of the property but has no bearing on the petition.

**Mr. Jamie Zerillo** presented the petitioner's request for alterations and rehabilitations at 641 Indian Street. Per the petitioner, the work includes the following:

-Painting of all exterior walls, rails, trim

-Removal of the existing blade sign

-New openings on the north façade for storefront windows, entryways

-New aluminum canopy and stoop at the northeast corner of the building

-Replacement of existing storefront entry systems

-Addition of steel columns, downspouts along the front façade

-New exterior light fixtures.

Staff recommended to approve the request for alterations and rehabilitations at 641 Indian Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Provide a dimension for the height of the new railing and the distance between the balusters and ensure it meets the standards.
- 2. Provide a dimension for the inset of the storefront glazing and ensure it meets the standards.
- 3. Redesign the proposed storefront glazing so that it extends from a sill or a base of contrasting material and ensure it meets the standards.

# PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street May 10, 2023 1:00 PM MINUTES **Mr. Patrick Phelps**, petitioner, stated they are working to match the existing railing and meet the 4-inch requirement. **Mr. Phelp**s explained the reasoning behind their changes and how they will accommodate Staff recommendations.

# PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

# **BOARD COMMENTS**:

There was no comment from the Board.

### Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for alterations and rehabilitations at 641 Indian Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1.Provide a dimension for the height of the new railing and the distance between the balusters and ensure it meets the standards.

2. Provide a dimension for the inset of the storefront glazing and ensure it meets the standards.

3.Redesign the proposed storefront glazing so that it extends from a sill or a base of contrasting material and ensure it meets the standards.

Mr. Houle motioned in favor the motion.

### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: Karen Guinn	
Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Not Present
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

### 7. Petition of Architecture 101 (Steven G. Stowers, AIA) | 23-001952-COA | 17 East Perry Street | Alterations

**Mr. Jamie Zerillo** presented the petitioner's request for alterations at 17 East Perry Street. The proposed alterations include the following:

-Replace the existing front doors with new glazed wood doors.

-Convert one historic front window opening into a new entrance door for the first-floor commercial occupancy.

-Replace existing non-historic windows, doors, and canopy on the rear façade.

-Install a new door opening and four new windows in the infilled opening where the carriage house doors previously existed.

Staff recommended to approve the request for alterations at 17 East Pretty Street as

requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

# PETITIONER COMMENTS:

**Mr. Steve Stowers,** stated this is not a typical Savannah row house and there are not many like it. He presented similar likenesses on Perry, York, and Abercorn Streets; the latter being the closest to the petitioned property. The non-historic door is requested to be replaced, not the frame and the non-historic window and frame is to be replaced. The historic ironwork is planned to be mounted into the body of the inside with a plaque. It does not match the second-floor piece of ironwork. The structure is being reverted back to its original residential use from commercial.

# PUBLIC COMMENTS:

**Mr. Andrew Jones**, stated this is not in harmony with the Oglethorpe Plan. He is opposed to the removal of the window based on the design standards and believed the additional doors makes it mixed use - the window should be retained. If the sashes are not original; they are very old. The ironwork should be retained. The request is inconsistent with Department of Interior Standards and the original features should be retained.

**Mr. Ryan Jarles**, Historic Savannah Foundation, expressed concern regarding historic fenestration at the primary facade. He recommended retaining the historical fenestration.

**Mr. Steve Edwards**, Downtown Neighborhood Association, opposes the petition. Alterations should have the least amount of removal; contributing structures should be retained as best as possible.

**Mr. Stowers** stated the building is very unwelcoming currently. The proposed request is the best option for the structure. He stated they can move forward without the window, though they prefer to have it.

# BOARD COMMENTS:

**Mr. Houle** stated their role is not to look at the economics but to preserve. **Ms. Taylor** stated the opening is a window, not a door, and does not support the alteration.

Mr. Houle made a motion to approve the petitioner's request with conditions.

### Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for alterations at 17 East Perry Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final approval, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1.Retain the existing fenestration on the primary façade by preserving the existing first-floor window which was proposed to be converted into an entryway.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

# Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Second: Melissa H. Rowan Dwayne Stephens

- Not Present

Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Not Present
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

# X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

8. Acknowledgement and approval of Staff-approved petitions.

### Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review acknowledged and approved Staff-approved decisions.

### Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

9. Petition of Steven Bodek, Inc. | 23-001700-COA | 310 West Charlton St | Non-historical architectural asphalt shingle roof replacement to standing seam metal roof; stucco over non-historic chimney

10. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 23-001944-COA | 129 - 131 East Broughton Street | Storefront door replacement with hollow metal door.

11. Petition of Steven Bodek, Inc. | 23-002085-COA | 101 West Taylor St | Color change (door).

12. Petition of Ward Architecture | 23-001923-COA | 118 East Jones Street | Amendment of 22-005840-COA: 10" wood Doric Columns and square wood Newell post instead of Newell posts with ball caps.

13. Petition of South Coast, Inc.| 23-002078-COA | 510 East McDonough Street | Amend 22-005867-COA: color change.

14. Petition of Farrell Click | 23-002072-COA | 11 West Gordon Street (carriage house) | Paint color change to walls.

15. Petition of Hansen Architects | 23-001938-COA | 609 Habersham Street | Color change, door/transom replacement, in-kind repairs.

<u>16. Petition of Brad and Stephanie Harris | 23-001921-COA | 120 West Taylor Street | Repaint stucco, replace shutters, and repair/repaint porch and stairs.</u>

17. Petition of Lynch Associates and Architects | 23-001692-COA |1201 Bull Street | Amend 20-005064-COA for rehabilitation and alterations: extend awning of Duffy St facade, trellis removal, revise stucco detailing, reconfigure refuse storage area.

18. Petition of Home Depot, Benjamin Coffey | 23-001922-COA | 340 West Jones Street | Window replacement.

19. Petition of Matthew Zaloumis | 23-001937- COA | 315, 317 East York Lane | Amend 21-006199-COA rehabilitation and alterations: replace existing historic roof with standing seam metal roof, and repair and repoint

the existing historic chimney with Quickcrete mortar.

20. Petition of Farrell Click | 23-001772-COA | 220 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Stucco coating reapplication on a side wall.

21. Petition of Roof Crafters | 23-001757-COA | 525 East Gaston Street | Roof material change and in-kind soffit/eave repairs

22. Petition of Savannah Confections | 23-001684-COA | 347 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. | Color change and non-illuminated wall signage.

23. Petition of Rose Architects | 23-001787-COA | 1526 Bull St | Replace existing fixed window with double-hung walk-up window.

### XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

24. Report on Work Done Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the May 10, 2023 HDBR Meeting

25. Report on Work Done Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the May 10, 2023 HDBR Meeting

26. Report on Work Done Which Is Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the May 10, 2023 HDBR Meeting

### **XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF**

27. Items Deferred to Staff - May Report

### XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

28. Inspections Completed by Staff - May Report

29. Stamped Drawings - May Report

#### **XIV. OTHER BUSINESS**

#### **XV. ADJOURNMENT**

30. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting - Wednesday June 14, 2023 at 12pm - 112 East State Street

31. Next HDBR Regular Meeting - Wednesday June 14, 2023 at 1pm - 112 East State Street

#### 32. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the May 10, 2023 Historic Board of Review meeting adjourned at 1:54 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah G. Michalak Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.