



Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
June 14, 2023 1:00 p.m.
MINUTES

June 14, 2023 Historic District Board of Review

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM in the Mendonsa Hearing Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Ellie Isaacs, Chair
David Altschiller
Karen Guinn
Michael Higgins
Nan Taylor
Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: Stan Houle
Melissa Rowan

MPC Staff Present: Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director
Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation
Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner
James Zerillo, Assistant Planner
Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant
Hind Patel, Information Technology

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

[1. Petition of Kevin Rose, Rose Architects | 23-002536-COA | 311 West Congress Street | Alterations](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the request for alterations 311 West Congress Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1) Provide information on the material of the proposed structural columns.
- 2) Recess the proposed infill of the lane entryway so it is apparent that an opening existed previously.

3) Provide a material for the new first-floor rear door.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[2. Petition of GMSHay Architects, Patrick Shay | 23-002293-COA | 301 West Bay Street | Amendment to a previous COA \(22-004728-COA\)](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review approved the request the request for an amendment to a previous Certificate of Appropriateness (22-004728-COA) to allow for rehabilitation and alterations at 301 West Bay Street, with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

Provide a dimension for the inset of the storefront glazing.

MW: LGM: JZ

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic District Board of Review meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic District Board of Review at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain

Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[3. Petition of Christian Sottile, Sottile & Sottile | 23-002532-COA | 26 East Gaston Street | Alterations](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review approved the request of rehabilitation and alterations for the contributing historic resource located at 26 East Gaston Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval, because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

Change the proposed fiber cement infill panels on the carriage house rear at East Gordon Lane to wood panels.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

[4. Adopt the June 14, 2023 Agenda](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the June 14, 2023 HDBR Meeting Agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Karen Guinn

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[5. Approve May 10, 2023 Historic District Board of Review Meeting Minutes as presented.](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the May 10, 2023 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

[6. Petition of Eric O'Neill, Homeline Architecture | 23-002540-COA | 433 Tattnell Street | Alterations](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review approved the request to continue the petition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**IX. REGULAR AGENDA**

[7. Petition of Luis Burgos, Hansen Architects | 23-002538-COA | 109 West Broughton Street | Illuminated Sign](#)

Mr. James Zerillo presented the petitioner's request for an illuminated sign at 109 West Broughton Street. The proposed sign is an illuminated projecting sign, proposed to be affixed above the primary entryway on Broughton Street. A window sign is proposed on the storefront windows east of the primary entrance. The proposed window sign is gold colored lettering which reads "No 109 W. Broughton."

The historic building was constructed in 1875 and is a contributing resource within the Downtown Local Historic District. An existing fascia sign was approved for this property previously under the COA file number 23-002164-COA. This fascia sign is proposed to be removed to allow for the installation of the proposed illuminated sign. Window signs are proposed to be added; however, they are proposed to be less than 10% of the window area on the façade so they do not require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The surrounding context is commercial. There are many examples of visually related structures on Broughton Street, with similar storefronts. There is a range of different signage present on this block of Broughton Street. Illuminated signage, specifically illuminated signs, can be found on adjacent properties and throughout Broughton Street. The majority of illuminated signage on Broughton Street is internally illuminated.

Staff recommended to approve the request for an illuminated sign at 109 West Broughton Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Utilize internal illumination with reverse silhouette or "cut-out" letters instead of the proposed external neon illumination.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Patrick Phelps, petitioner, stated the requested adjustments were made regarding the sign.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There were no Board comments.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review approved the request the request for an illuminated sign at 109 West Broughton Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1) Utilize internal illumination with reverse silhouette or ";cut-out"; letters instead of the proposed external neon illumination.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[8. Petition of Erik Puljung, Hansen Architects | 23-002531-COA | 425 East Saint Julian Street | Rehabilitations](#)

Mr. James Zerillo presented the petitioner's request for approval for the rehabilitation of 425 East Saint Julian Street. Per the applicant, the scope of work on the front façade includes the following:

- Removal of storm windows and burglar bars
- In-kind repair and repainting of exterior trim and sashes
- In-kind repair and repainting of upper balcony ironwork
- Removal of first-floor vinyl shutters, and replacement with operable composite shutters
- Replace existing asphalt shingle roofing with TPO
- Repoint brick chimney

The scope of work on the rear façade includes the following:

- Removal of storm windows and burglar bars
- Removal and salvage of an existing window
- Install existing door into the opening of the removed window
- Install new double-hung TDL, wood window into the existing door opening
- Move existing metal canopy/overhang to align with the new position of the existing door

-Repoint brick fence

The historic building was constructed in 1892 and is a contributing resource within the Downtown Local Historic District. The subject property is a two-story, masonry residence. The building is designed in the Italianate style, with decorative eave brackets and a full-width second-story balcony with historic ironwork on the front façade. The windows on the property appear to be historic, however, the shutters are non-historic additions and are inoperable. The 1916-1953 Sanborn Map shows that a wood structure was present on the rear of the property. This wood structure is no longer present on the property. The surrounding context is primarily residential. The subject property is located east of Warren Square, on the block of East Saint Julian Street between Habersham Street and Price Street.

Staff recommended to approve the request for rehabilitations at 425 East Saint Julian Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Provide a specification for the ASTM Mortar Type for the proposed mortar for the brick repointing.
2. Ensure a four-foot by four-foot test patch is installed and reviewed by staff prior to the commencement of the brick repointing.
3. Utilize the existing window on the rear façade that is proposed to be moved instead of a new window, or to provide additional documentation which shows that the window cannot be repaired.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Erik Puljung, petitioner, stated they are in agreement with the staff conditions. They will review the openings and comply; or come back to Staff. The door to window change is in regard to the floor plan. It opens to a singular room and also to the kitchen. The Tax Credit Administrator prefers the layout as well. There is no intent to remove any historic material. The intent is for the owner to occupy the space; the hardship would be to the user and owner.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Taylor expressed concern with swapping the door and window, and agrees with Staff recommendations.

Mr. Higgins expressed concern with swapping the door and window; there will be historic material removed. He does not see the need for the hardship request; it is purely for convenience and cannot support.

Ms. Isaacs stated she agrees with Mr. Higgins.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review approved the request for rehabilitations at 425 East Saint Julian Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1) Provide a specification for the ASTM Mortar Type for the proposed mortar for the brick repointing.
- 2) Ensure a four-foot by four-foot test patch is installed and reviewed by staff prior to the commencement of the brick repointing.
- 3) Maintain the existing location and configuration of the rear door and window which are proposed to be swapped.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Nay
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Nay

9. Petition of Mike DeCaire, Wakely Properties, LLC | 23-002527-COA | 143 Houston Street | Demolition

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request of approval for the deconstruction and demolition of a non-contributing building located at 143 Houston Street. The long-term purpose of the project is to construct a new restaurant building on the property. Preliminary design plans were included but are not part of this review. Per the applicant:

"The project as stated above involves the deconstruction/removal of the existing one-story structure located at the corner of Oglethorpe Ave. and Houston Street. It is within the boundaries of the Downtown Historic District and Greene Ward, on a non-historic, non-contributing corner lot.

143 Houston Street was built in 1976 and is a non-contributing building within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. There are a mix of contributing residential and commercial resources in the vicinity of the property along with several non-contributing buildings as well. 143 Houston Street is currently a vacant building due to the fact that it was deemed structurally unsound. The applicant has stated that the CMU blocks, wood frame members, ceiling joists and rafters will be salvaged and reused.

Staff recommended to approve the request for deconstruction and demolition of the structurally unsound, non-contributing building located at 143 Houston Street as requested because the standards for non-contributing demolition are met.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Mike DeCaire and **Ms. Christina Swinson**, petitioners, stated that they had no questions or statements.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

No public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There were no Board Comments.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review approved the request for deconstruction and demolition of the structurally unsound, non-contributing building located at 143 Houston Street as requested because the standards for non-contributing demolition are met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Karen Guinn

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[10. Petition of James Gallucci, Pantheon ADC | 23-002537-COA | 11 Jefferson Street | Special Exception Request](#)

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for a Special Exception for the previously approved new construction parking garage located at 11 Jefferson Street [File No. 22-002854-COA]. The applicant requests a Special Exception from 7.8.10 (t)(iv)(4) – Setback Standard which reads:

Incorporate setbacks within the façade. Setbacks between street fronting walls shall be at least 24 feet wide and eight (8) feet deep and contain windows in the walls perpendicular to the street (Fig. 7.8-9) Setbacks shall extend to the ground or begin immediately above the ground floor.

In order to reduce the Setback Standard from the required 8'-0" to 5'-2".

Per the applicant

On December 14, 2022, the Historic District Board of Review voted to approve the request for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a 4-story parking structure for the vacant parcel (surface parking lot) at 11 Jefferson Street, at which point Pantheon ADC (the petitioner) proceeded to the construction document phase of the project.

A part of this construction document phase was meeting with different city entities, including Traffic and Engineering. On Thursday April 13th, our design team met with the Traffic and Engineering Department to discuss West Bay Lane becoming one-way. The Traffic and engineering Department is in support of one-way westbound traffic through the lane.

They were also in support of the pedestrian sidewalk down the lane, however there is an

issue of encroaching on the right-of-way (R/W), which is currently 22.5 Feet. If our building was to build to the property line, the flush sidewalk would make the R/W 18.5 Feet, which is too narrow for fire department access, and would hinder the ability to fight fire. The Fire Department requires a minimum of 20.5 Feet in the R/W.

The functionality of the parking system is dependent on a uniform structural grid, with equal and fixed dimensions of the steel framing, which supports the building envelope. When shifting the building south, the parking structural grid must shift with it.

To accommodate the request of Traffic and Engineering, protect the pedestrians walking in the Lane, and to provide adequate fire truck access, we are proposing moving our Rear (north) elevation towards Bryan Street by approximately 2ft. This would allow for a 4ft pedestrian sidewalk and maintain the minimum 20.5 FT R/W.

The Special Exception Request is therefore a matter of public safety.

Staff recommended approval for a Special Exception for the previously approved new construction parking garage located at 11 Jefferson Street [File No. 22-002854-COA] as requested because the Special Exception criteria are met.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. James Gallucci stated he met with varying agencies, and learned fire truck access was not sufficient and decided to make building smaller to accommodate. He agrees with Staff's recommendations.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board expressed appreciation for the petitioner's compliance.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review approved the request for a Special Exception for the previously approved new construction parking garage located at 11 Jefferson Street [File No. 22-002854-COA] as requested because the Special Exception criteria are met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[11. Petition of Kevin Rose, Rose Architects | 23-002530-COA | 301 Alice Street | Demolition and New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass](#)

*****Ms. Ellie Isaacs recused herself from this petition. Ms. Karen Guinn succeed as chair for this petition.***

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request for approval to demolish a non-contributing building and for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for a single-family residence with a four-car carriage house for the property located at 301 Alice Street.

On February 8, 2023, the Historic District Board of Review recommended approval to City Council to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing structure in the National Historic Landmark District; staff's recommendation was for denial. Then on March 9, 2023, City Council approved the change. 301 Alice Street is now a non-contributing building on the Historic Building Map for the National Historic Landmark District. [File No. 22-005388-COA]

DEMOLITION FINDINGS:

This building will be evaluated and considered for contributing status. The building was constructed c.1952 which is within the Period of Significance of 1733-1960. The site is not associated with lives of significant events or persons, and does not embody distinctive characteristics, the work of a master, and is highly unlikely to yield information important in history or prehistory. However, staff finds that it does retain its original location, general design, setting, some materials and workmanship, feeling, and association. Staff finds that the building is associated with the automobile era which has made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of Savannah's history; Sanborn Maps indicate that this building was used for auto repair. Staff finds that this building still meets the criteria for contributing status.

If the HDBR approves demolishing the building, staff recommends that the building be deconstructed, and historic materials be salvaged. Additionally, a Certificate of Appropriateness must first be issued for the new construction of the replacement building prior to approval of the demolition. The applicant has provided a detailed explanation, including photographs documenting the current condition of the building and why, they believe, demolition cannot be avoided. The applicant provided documentation of the construction date, history, and development of the property within their submittal packet.

SAPP Structural is a Georgia-licensed structural engineering firm. Staff could not determine if the structural engineer has demonstrated experience in historic renovation, restoration, or rehabilitation. Quoting from the report, some of the structural conditions the engineer identified include:

"From visual observations, the structure was found to be in good general condition with some areas of deterioration from exposure to environmental elements. However, the structural elements of the building appear to be more utilitarian than typical commercial buildings with lower structural capacities than commercial building codes would typically allow."

"The analysis of the [roof] deck shows that this edge is not capable of supporting live loading along the edge."

"An analysis shows that the existing roof purlins are not adequate to support a code-required live load of 20 pounds per square feet ... Upon inspection of some of the roof purlins, the sections show some mild corrosion and deformations that reduce the structural integrity of the members."

The property is vacant and non-income producing. It is not likely that funding is available because this building was constructed outside the National Historic Landmark District's period of significance.

Mr. Altschiller asked if any project this wide has been approved. **Ms. Michalak** stated the width is broken into two masses. Many carriages houses have this width. **Mr. Thomson** asked about the four car garage - how can that be broken up with appropriate curb cuts.

Staff recommended to deny the request to demolish a non-contributing building at 301 Alice Street because the building is eligible for contributing status. If the HDBR approves the demolition, staff recommends the following conditions:

1. The building shall be deconstructed, rather than demolished, and the historic materials salvaged.
2. A Certificate of Appropriateness must first be issued for the new construction of the replacement building prior to approval of the demolition.

Additionally, Staff recommended to continue the New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for a single-family residence with a four-car carriage house for the property located at 301 Alice Street until a decision is rendered by the HDBR for the demolition of the non-contributing building. The petitioner is also to address the following:

1. Door frames and window sashes shall not be inset less than 3 inches from the exterior surface of the façade of the building.
2. Eaves on the primary building shall extend no less than 12 inches beyond supporting walls.
3. Eaves and rakes on accessory buildings and dormers shall overhang at least eight (8) inches.
4. The driveway apron shall not be erected on the public right-of-way.
5. Curb cuts shall not exceed 20 feet in width.
6. The footprint of the accessory dwelling unit shall be a maximum of 40% of the habitable floor area of the principal dwelling. Provide the calculation and ensure the standard is met.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Harley Krinsky, stated the structure is no longer contributing and would like approval of new construction. Little is left that is original.

Mr. Kevin Rose, architect, commented on Part 1. Stated they tried to break into two buildings: cited Gaston St buildings as good examples. The door frames and window sashes stated over four inches of brick relief will be. Eaves on the primary building will be over 8 and 12 inches on main structure; will refine on carriage house. The driveway design was not included in Part 1, but will add a door and curb cut. They are within the building coverage and size per the ordinance.

Mr. Thomson asked about the curb cuts; **Mr. Rose** showed their plans from the drawings how it will be accomplished.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, with the Oglethorpe Coalition, showed pictures of other structures within the neighborhood. He believes the presented new construction does not read as the neighboring structures; should not be broken into two buildings, should be one wide building. The solid and voids are not matching the neighborhood; should be more visually compatible.

Mr. Steve Edwards, DNA, supports the demolition. The design of the structure has visual compatibility concerns; does not meet all of the requirements. Only three contributing buildings near the structure. More attention should be paid attention to the Ordinance requirements. Officially objects to the design.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated delisting will bring forward ideas that are not fit to be in the historic districts. Cited examples of block buildings that are contributing. Anticipates more historic loss; this type of architecture is appreciated. Savannah is erasing this area; does not support demolition.

Mr. Rose responded he lives in a mid-century home and likes them; but 301 Alice Street is not a good example of mid-century architecture. He stated the structure is not recognized as contributing because of the styles of build; the only thing left historic are the windows.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Taylor supports the denial of demolition and still sees it as a contributing structure. **Mr. Thomson** stated the delisting has been approved. The building should not have been built in the neighborhood. The compatibility of the design does not fit. **Mr. Higgins** stated his view has not changed (opposes). **Mr. Altschiller** stated he does not see how the building enhances the City. **Ms. Taylor** stated utilitarian buildings still have significance and tell a story.

Part 1

The Board had concern with the workers' cottages across the street; more work needs to be done to design. Should be continued.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review approved the request to demolish a non-contributing building at 301 Alice Street because the building is eligible for contributing status. If the HDBR approves the demolition, staff recommends the following conditions:

- 1) The building shall be deconstructed, rather than demolished, and the historic materials salvaged.
- 2) A Certificate of Appropriateness must first be issued for the new construction of the replacement building prior to approval of the demolition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Nay
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Nay

Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to continue Part 1 to the July 12, 2023 HDBR meeting to observed the context more closely. Continue New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for a single-family residence with a four-car carriage house for the property located at 301 Alice Street until a decision is rendered by the HDBR for the demolition of the non-contributing building. The petitioner is also to address the following:

- 1) Door frames and window sashes shall not be inset less than 3 inches from the exterior surface of the facade of the building.
- 2) Eaves on the primary building shall extend no less than 12 inches beyond supporting walls.
- 3) Eaves and rakes on accessory buildings and dormers shall overhang at least eight (8) inches.
- 4) The driveway apron shall not be erected on the public right-of-way.
- 5) Curb cuts shall not exceed 20 feet in width.
- 6) The footprint of the accessory dwelling unit shall be a maximum of 40% of the habitable floor area of the principal dwelling. Provide the calculation and ensure the standard is met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[12. Petition of Erik Puljung, Hansen Architects | 23-002535-COA | 127 East Gordon Street | Additions and Alterations](#)

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for alterations and additions to the property located at 127 East Gordon Street.

Per the applicant:

127 East Gordon Street was originally constructed in the hall-parlor configuration, with a wooden side porch added sometime before 1916. Since that time, alterations to the building, including replacing the side porch with a masonry addition and adding an additional stair to the front stoop, have created a different building form and presence on the square and the building currently reads more like an "I" house with a central hallway. In fact, it was described as such on the historic resource card. The vision and goal of this

project is to restore the building as a single-family residence, with the hall-parlor configuration legible, and restore the balance of the building with a wooden porch in the same footprint as the historic wooden porch.

To achieve this, we are proposing the following: a comprehensive rehabilitation for the main house, removal of a brick addition, an addition with massing and design aesthetic as an enclosed side porch, and a masonry element. A previously existing garage location is being re-established as a garage with a terrace space above. We will use Abercorn Street for garage and driveway access -- new wood double gates are proposed. The entry stoop will be modified to have a single stair toward Abercorn and also to have a masonry construction aesthetic vs that of a formed and poured concrete stoop and stair.

Through the review of the sanborn maps and zoning requirements, we have established that the existing three story brick addition is not a contributing element to the original side hall townhouse. Please review our contributing status documentation prepared by Ethos.

In the process of reviewing the history of the home, we learned that there was a wood side porch in the location of the masonry addition we are proposing for removal. Our plans for the addition of a mostly enclosed side porch are based on the same footprint of this porch noted in the sanborn maps. We are proposing this porch have an open porch bay toward the square and the balance will be enclosed with glass from the rail height up. The expression of the porch rail is maintained for the enclosed areas.

We are requesting in kind repairs for the historic main house including the stucco, stucco detail, wood trim, wood details, wood windows, and rear balcony reconstruction based on historic images.

The primary materials of the new addition are stucco over masonry (8" CMU) walls and wood framing and wood detailing on the enclosed porch. New Marvin brand windows are proposed for the new addition; cut sheets are provided.

The side yard facing Gordon Street will be restored as a garden. Upon approval of the rehabilitation and design work currently being presented, we intend to engage the services of a local Landscape Architect. We will return with this phase for review as appropriate as it relates to gates, garden walls, hardscape etc. In this application we are only asking for the removal of the concrete within the yard space.

Staff recommended to continue the request for alterations and additions to the property located at 127 East Gordon Street for a maximum of 90 days in order for the petitioner to address the following:

1. Redesign in order to retain the historic addition.
2. Reduce the scale of the remainder of the new addition.
3. Provide door specifications and inset door frames 3 inches from the exterior façade.
4. Inset window sashes 3 inches from the exterior façade.
5. Revise the design of the front stoop columns to be more in keeping with the historic building's design. Change the composite material to wood for front stoop elements. Provide a newel post at the bottom of the stoop railing.
6. Provide the depth of the reconstructed balcony; ensure it does not exceed 3 feet in depth.
7. Remove the curb cut and the vehicular gates from the east-west street.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Erik Puljung, stated the design approach was based on the historic research found.

Ms. Ellen Harris presented a historic evolution of the structure. There was no initial side porch, but a balcony area. There was a single stair to the east. Between 1868 and 1916, a side porch was added, documented and beneficial for restoration. Between 1937 and 1954, the wooden porch was bricked in, with an auto garage. Earliest photograph was from 1967. There has not been much changed much since the porch addition. The bricked portion is in the contributing time period.

Mr. Puljung stated 432 Abercorn is similar to structure, on a trust lot. He showed additional pictures he believes to be similar to structure already existing/approved on East Jones and West Gaston.

Ms. Taylor asked about existing addition, why remove it. **Mr. Puljung** stated the floors are slanted, the spacing is excessive, the roofline is pulling away from the building, causing stress to original historic structure. The footings are undersized and pulling away. Ms. Taylor asked can it be stabilized and used. Mr. Puljung responded it was not feasible.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones agrees with applicant regarding the addition; it detracts from the original building. He suggested vertical columns or lower porch.

Ms. Christiana Turner, adjacent neighbor, stated she appreciated the owners' efforts to restore the structure to original design.

Mr. Steve Edwards, DNA, stated this is an important building on a prominent square. Hope an agreement will allow restoration.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, believes the current addition is appropriate. Does not support demolition of added structure. Does not have to be of immaculate design to be contributing. Historic differentiation should be preserved. If the addition was not there, would support the proposed design.

Mr. Ross Sheppard, citizen, supports the demolition of the addition. Actively detracts from the historic building.

Mr. Puljung responded the support is appreciated. Tried to examine what is best: remove brick addition and add side porch.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Taylor asked about the curb cut condition. Ms. Michalak stated two accesses are not required. The addition is complicated because the addition is historic but the proposed is historically appropriate. She expressed concerns about the massive garage.

Mr. Thomson stated he prefers keeping things as applicant would like.

Mr. Higgins expressed concerns about the existing conditions, mass.

Mr. Altschiller expressed appreciation of the masonry change, feels very large. Wish mass would be reconsidered; it's growing.

Ms. Taylor stated that if the addition was removed, the proposed is still massive and takes on what it is now. It would be better smaller; same dimensions are currently being used, rather than what's appropriate for context of neighborhood.

Mr. Higgins and Mr. Altschiller agreed with Ms. Taylor.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to continue to the September 13, 2023 or prior the request for alterations and additions to the property located at 127 East Gordon Street for a maximum of 90 days in order for the petitioner to address the following:

- 1) Redesign in order to retain the historic addition.
- 2) Reduce the scale of the remainder of the new addition.
- 3) Provide door specifications and inset door frames 3 inches from the exterior facade.
- 4) Inset window sashes 3 inches from the exterior facade.
- 5) Revise the design of the front stoop columns to be more in keeping with the historic building's design.

Change the composite material to wood for front stoop

elements. Provide a newel post at the bottom of the stoop railing.

- 6) Provide the depth of the reconstructed balcony; ensure it does not exceed 3 feet in depth.
- 7) Remove the curb cut and the vehicular gates from the east-west street.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Karen Guinn

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

[13. Acknowledge and approve of Staff-approved petitions.](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Revoiew acknowledged and approvedof the Staff-approved petitions as presented.

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

[14. Petition of Heather Filgate | 23-002650-COA | 528, 530 Price Street | Color Change \(front doors\)](#)

[15. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 23-002422-COA | 25 East Broughton Street | Non-illuminated wall sign on front facade.](#)

[16. Petition of Niles Bolton | 23-002512-COA | 226 East Bryan Street | Amend 22-005843-COA: alterations](#)

[17. Petition of Steven Bodek, Inc. | 23-002227-COA | 126 East Taylor Street | Brick repointing with test patch condition.](#)

[18. Petition of Hansen Architectss | 23-002164-COA | 109 West Broughton Street | Color change, non-illuminated sign, and lighting.](#)

[19. Petition of David Cutlip | 23-002803 | 552 East Charlton Street | Eleven replacement windows \(non-contributing structure\)](#)

[20. Petition of Musgrove House | 23-002805-COA | 121 West Gordon Street | New front entrance wall sign](#)

[21. Petition of Jay Andrews | 23-002647-COA | 25 West Broughton St | Stucco repair and in-kind replacement](#)

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

[22. Report on Work Done Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the June 14, 2023 HDBR Meeting \(9 items\)](#)

[23. Report on Work Done Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the June 14, 2023 HDBR Meeting \(1 item\)](#)

[24. Report on Work Done Which Is Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the June 14, 2023 HDBR Meeting \(2 items\)](#)

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

[25. Items Deferred to Staff - June Report \(5 items\)](#)

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

[26. Stamped Drawings - June Report \(9 items\)](#)

[27. Inspections Completed by Staff - June Report \(1 item\)](#)

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

[28. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting - Wednesday July 12, 2023 at 12pm - 112 East State Street](#)

[29. Next HDBR Regular Meeting - Wednesday July 12, 2023 at 1pm - 112 East State Street](#)

[30. Adjourn](#)

There being no further business to present before the Board, the June 14, 2023 Historic District Board of Review meeting adjourned at 3:22 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah G. Michalak
Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.