

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
July 12, 2023 1:00 PM
MINUTES

July 12, 2023 Historic District Board of Review Meeting

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM in the Mendonsa Hearing Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Ellie Isaacs, Chair

Karen Guinn Michael Higgins Stan Houle Melissa Rowan Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: David Altschiller

Nan Taylor

MPC Staff Present: Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director

Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation

Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant Hind Patel, Information Technology

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 23-003185-COA | 705 Barnard Street | Rehabilitation & Alterations

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for rehabilitation for the property located at 705 Barnard Street with the following condition because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Ensure that the rear stairs and deck are installed through the mortar joints rather than the historic brick.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle Second: Karen Guinn

- Not Present **Dwayne Stephens** - Not Present Melissa Memory - Not Present David Altschiller - Not Present Nan Taylor Ellie Isaacs - Abstain Karen Guinn - Aye Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

2. Petition of Architecture 101 | 23-003219-COA | 431 Habersham Street | Addition and Alterations

Motion

Approval for alterations and a screened porch addition for the property located at 431 Habersham Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

The distance between balusters shall not exceed four (4) inches on center and the height of the railing shall not exceed 36 inches for single- and two-family dwelling units.

The fence is to be painted or stained; provide the color selection to staff for review.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle Second: Karen Guinn

- Not Present **Dwayne Stephens** - Not Present Melissa Memory David Altschiller - Not Present Nan Taylor - Not Present Ellie Isaacs - Abstain Karen Guinn - Aye Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Motion

Adopt the July 12, 2023 HDBR Meeting Agenda as presented.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present Melissa Memory - Not Present **David Altschiller** - Not Present - Not Present Nan Taylor Ellie Isaacs - Abstain Karen Guinn - Aye Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

4. Approve June 14, 2023 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

Motion

Approve the June14, 2023 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present - Not Present Melissa Memory **David Altschiller** - Not Present Nan Taylor - Not Present Ellie Isaacs - Abstain Karen Guinn - Aye Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

5. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 23-003215-COA | 603 Whitaker Street | Amendment / Rehabilitation

Motion		MIINOTES
Continue.		
Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.		
Vote Results (Approved)		
Motion: Karen Guinn		
Second: Melissa H. Rowan		
Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present	
Melissa Memory	- Not Present	
David Altschiller	- Not Present	
Nan Taylor	- Not Present	
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain	
Karen Guinn	- Aye	
Michael Higgins	- Aye	
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye	
Thomas I Thomson	- Δνο	

6. Petition of Homeline Architecture | 23-002540-COA | 433 Tattnall Street | Additions and Alterations

Motion	
Continue.	
Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.	
Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Karen Guinn	
Second: Melissa H. Rowan	
Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

7. Petition of Hansen Architects | 23-002535-COA | 127 East Gordon Street | Additions and Alterations

Motion	
Continue.	

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present - Not Present Melissa Memory - Not Present David Altschiller Nan Taylor - Not Present Ellie Isaacs - Abstain Karen Guinn - Aye Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

8. Petition of Signs by James, LLC, James Burnsed | 23-003037-COA | 107 West Congress Street | Illuminated Sign

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request of approval to install a new illuminated sign for the business located at 107 West Congress Street. 107 West Congress Street is a non-contributing structure within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District.

Staff recommended to approve the request to install an illuminated sign at 107 West Congress Street with the following conditions to be submitted for staff review and approval prior to starting the work, because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Revise the color scheme to be more visually compatible with the surrounding area.
- 2. Revise the design to include individually illuminated letters with an opaque background.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

The petitioner was not present for the meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Berrien Jones, citizen, stated he supports Staff recommendations.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Thomson stated the item should be continued until the petitioner is here to answer questions.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request to the install an illuminated sign at 107 West Congress Street to the August 9, 2023 HDBR Meeting to provide time for the petitioner to be present to address the following:

- 1. Revise the color scheme to be more visually compatible with the surrounding area.
- 2. Revise the design to include individually illuminated letters with an opaque background.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present Melissa Memory - Not Present **David Altschiller** - Not Present - Not Present Nan Taylor Ellie Isaacs - Abstain Karen Guinn - Aye Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

9. Petition of Rose Architects | 23-002530-COA | 301 Alice Street | New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass

**Ms. Ellie Isaacs recused herself from this petition. Ms. Karen Guinn chaired the meeting during this petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for a single-family residence with a four-car carriage house for the property located at 301 Alice Street.

Per the applicant, the changes since the last meeting include the following:

- 1. Changed the proportions of the windows to make them more vertical in nature.
- 2. Changed the vertical brick surrounds from stack bond to stack header bond which helps emphasize the verticality of the windows.
- 3. Remove the pilasters creating a more cohesive façade.
- 4. Changed the entrance roof at the roof level and the first floor, emphasizing more simplicity and further delineating the two masses.
- 5. Created more transparency in the entrance vestibule.
- 6. Further developed the cornice (will refine more in Part II).
- 7. Dimensioned (and revised) the curb cuts.
- 8. Added some brick detail.
- 9. Reworked the brick and proportions of the east wall.
- 10. Changed the height of the roof over the courtyard each walkway roof and simplified the garden wall (will refine more in Part II).

On February 8, 2023, the Historic District Board of Review recommended approval to City

Council to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing structure in the National Historic Landmark District; staff's recommendation was for denial. Then on March 9, 2023, City Council approved the change. 301 Alice Street is now a non-contributing building on the Historic Building Map for the National Historic Landmark District [File No. 22-005388-COA].

On June 14, 2023, the HDBR:

Approved to demolish the building with the following conditions:

- 1. The building shall be deconstructed, rather than demolished, and the historic materials salvaged.
- 2. A Certificate of Appropriateness must first be issued for the new construction of the replacement building prior to approval of the demolition.

Continued New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass to further examine the context and to address the following:

- 1. Door frames and window sashes shall not be inset less than 3 inches from the exterior surface of the façade of the building.
- 2. Eaves on the primary building shall extend no less than 12 inches beyond supporting walls
- 3. Eaves and rakes on accessory buildings and dormers shall overhang at least eight (8) inches.
- 4. The driveway apron shall not be erected on the public right-of-way.
- 5. Curb cuts shall not exceed 20 feet in width.
- 6. The footprint of the accessory dwelling unit shall be a maximum of 40% of the habitable floor area of the principal dwelling. Provide the calculation and ensure the standard is met.

Staff recommended approval for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for a single-family residence with a four-car carriage house for the property located at 301 Alice Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Door frames shall be inset not less than three (3) inches.
- 2. Driveway aprons shall not be erected on the public right-of-way.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Kevin Rose, petitioner, agrees with Staff recommendation. Applied Board and public comments as best possible; still in the process of making a building respectful to the neighborhood.

Mr. Higgins commended the changes and stated the carriage house is large for the street and the facade is blank on the rear. **Mr. Rose** stated they are working to adjust that.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, citizen, stated the petition does not meet the standards - the entrance, rhythm, and materials. He recommended continuation for design reconstruction, as the slope is not visually compatible and the windows yield a bulky design, as they are large.

Mr. Rose stated their project meets the ordinance and they like the building. It is not intended to be a copy of another.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board appreciated the petitioner's design. Mr. Thomson asked what style the structure

is. Mr. Rose stated it is of its time, to be of historic value in the future.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for a single-family residence with a four-car carriage house for the property located at 301 Alice Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Door frames shall be inset not less than three (3) inches.
- 2.Driveway aprons shall not be erected on the public right-of-way.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present Melissa Memory - Not Present **David Altschiller** - Not Present Nan Taylor - Not Present - Not Present Ellie Isaacs Karen Guinn - Abstain Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

10. Petition of Rose Architects | 23-003208-COA | 110 West Taylor Street | Rehabilitation & Alterations

Ms. Cailtin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request of approval for rehabilitation at 110 West Taylor Street. The project includes undoing alterations from the 1970s and 1980s such as the front stoop, replacement of non-historic windows, and reopening a historic door. The project also includes adding a roof to the existing deck on the rear elevation.

110 West Taylor Street was built circa 1850 and is a contributing resource within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. 110 West Taylor Street is in the middle of three two-story wood-frame rowhouses with raised basements. This house has undergone various alterations, including the addition of a two-story porch that went across all three houses, which can be seen on the 1916 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. The applicant also noted that in 1914, an A.S. Cohen applied for a permit on 110 and 112 to add a wood-frame addition with a brick veneer and metal roof to each of these houses. Also by 1916, the homes had all been converted into duplexes. More recently, in the 1970s and 1980s, there were more changes. In 1975, the two-story front porch was removed and restored to a configuration similar to what was on the 1888 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. There were also changes on the rear elevation to the windows and doors. The applicant's research shows that in 2003, a general maintenance permit was pulled for \$5,000.00.

Staff recommended to approve the request for rehabilitation and alterations at 110 West

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street July 12, 2023 1:00 PM

Taylor Street with the following conditions for staff review and approval prior to starting the project because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Ensure that the columns have bases and that details are reflected on the drawings.
- 2. Provide further information about the roof over the deck at the rear elevation.

3.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Rose stated he agrees with Staff recommendations and would like to add the door to help with the facade. The back door will be detailed; there were structural issues to stabilize building before designing.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There were no board comments.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for rehabilitation and alterations at 110 West Taylor Street with the following conditions for staff review and approval prior to starting the project because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1.Ensure that the columns have bases and that details are reflected on the drawings.
- 2. Provide further information about the roof over the deck at the rear elevation.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

- Not Present **Dwayne Stephens** Melissa Memory - Not Present - Not Present **David Altschiller** - Not Present Nan Taylor Ellie Isaacs - Abstain Karen Guinn - Aye Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

11. Petition of DeRenne Home Owners Association | 23-003212-COA | 24 East Liberty Street | Rehabilitation

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for rehabilitation of the property located at 24 East Liberty Street, known as the DeRenne Apartments.

The scope of work includes:

- -Brick cleaning and repointing
- -Brick lintel repairs and replacement
- -Stone cleaning and repairs
- -Balcony repairs

- -Balcony railing repairs and repainting
- -Terracotta/tile repair at cornice
- -Window repairs

Per the applicant "the goal is to stabilize and refurbish the exterior." A mockup of all work proposed for the rehabilitation, prior to full execution of the work, will be located on the west façade of the building.

Designed by architect Henrick Wallin, the DeRenne Apartments were constructed in 1924 and was the first high rise apartment building in Savannah; it has remained in continuous residential use. The ground floor is faced with granite, the upper floors with red brick, and the frieze with glazed tile.

Staff recommended approval for rehabilitation of the property located at 24 East Liberty Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. The new mortar color, texture, and tooling must match the historic mortar.
- 2. Coordinate with staff to review the mock-up on the west façade prior to full execution of the work.
- 3. Clarify what method will be used to clean the brick and the precast.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Ellen Harris, Ethos preservation, stated she and petitioner agrees with Staff recommendations.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Thomson commended the homeowner's association.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve rehabilitation of the property located at 24 East Liberty Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. The new mortar color, texture, and tooling must match the historic mortar.
- 2.Coordinate with staff to review the mock-up on the west façade prior to full execution of the work.
- 3. Clarify what method will be used to clean the brick and the precast.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Not Present

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

		MINUTES
Karen Guinn	- Aye	
Michael Higgins	- Aye	
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye	
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye	

12. Petition of Pantheon ADC | 23-003216-COA | 200 West Bryan Street | Amendment / New Construction

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval to amend a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for a 6-story building at 200 West Bryan Street.

The amendments include the following:

- -The 6th floor has been expanded to enclose the formerly open roof area on the north side of the building at the lane. The language is consistent with the east elevation; the curtain wall is extended to the roof.
- -The banding between the 4th and 5th floors has been removed.
- -The south façade 5th floor windows have been revised to match the 5th floor windows on the east façade.

The original COA identified the property as Lot 6, tithing lot of Decker Ward [File No. 21-002857-COA].

On July 14, 2021, this project was approved for New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass, with the following conditions:

- 1. Provide evidence that the equipment will not be visible from the public right-of-way or submit a method of appropriate screening.
- 2. Ensure that the parapet height is appropriate and accurately depicted in the drawings.

The petitioner, also, received approval for the request for a Special Exception from the following standard:

Incorporate recesses within the wall plane. Building frontage shall be limited to 30 feet with recesses of at least 12 feet in width and four (4) feet in depth. Recesses shall extend to the ground or begin immediately above the ground floor.

To allow for 7'-2" wide recesses along the West Bryan Street frontage, as well as 2'-8" deep recesses along West Bryan Street and for 2'-0" deep recesses along Barnard Street.

On September 9, 2021, the HDBR decided the following:

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby <u>approve</u> the petition for the revisions to New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass of a new five-story building on the east-west connecting street of Lot 6, tithing lot of Decker Ward <u>as requested</u>, because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

AND

<u>Approved</u> the New Construction, Part II: Design Details <u>with the following conditions</u> to be submitted to Staff, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the drawings to appropriately depict the color of all areas utilizing the glass fiber reinforced concrete by *Moonlight Molds* in the color "grey" (191004-1C).
- 2. Revise the painted glazing with an alternative, such as metal, so that the standards are met.
- 3. Ensure that any proposed lighting is submitted to Staff for review prior to installation.

- 4. Ensure that a new sample panel is submitted to Staff for review that accurately reflects any changes in materials, workmanship and/or color palette of the proposed building's final design per the Sample Panel Policy (see attached).
- 5. The corner, curtain wall should be made operable *or* a Special Exception shall be applied for from the related standard.

On January 12, 2022, the HDBR approved an amendment to Parts I and II to allow for the building to go from five (5) floors to six (6) floors (including some minor additional revisions) with the following condition (a minimum of (6) feet of unobstructed sidewalk shall be maintained).

AND

Approved the request for a Special Exception from the following standard:

Windows facing a street shall be double or triple hung, awning, casement or Palladian.

"...To allow for a curtain wall to be treated as a wall, rather than a window or punched opening,".

On January 22, 2023, the HDBR approved an amendment [File No. 22-005842-COA] to change the building's field brick as follows:

Approved: 50/50 blend of 1.25 Greystone Wirecut and 2.0 Greystone Wirecut

Proposed: Acme Brick – Slate Gray

Staff recommended to approve the request to amend a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for a new 6-story building at 200 East Bryan Street as requested because the proposed changes are visually compatible and meet the standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. James Gallucci, agreed with Staff recommendation. The hotel branding required restaurant and banquet space. They chose to enclose the north side and leave south end open for massing.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There were no Board comments.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to amend a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for a new 6-story building at 200 East Bryan Street as requested because the proposed changes are visually compatible and meet the standards.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

13. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 23-003222-COA | 408 MLK, Jr. Blvd. | Amendment / Rooftop Addition

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for a rooftop addition for the property located at 408 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. [File No. 22-004369-COA]. The amendment expands the size of the rooftop addition; the depth of the front setback is decreased, and, in the rear, an additional projection is proposed. The rooftop addition is visible from the I-16 Flyover; however, it is only minimally visible from the front façade.

The historic building was constructed in 1906 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah Downtown Historic District and the National Historic Landmark District. On October 12, 2022, the HDBR approved the rooftop addition and storefront alterations with the following condition:

1. Provide the roof pitch for the roof and ensure it meets the standards.

Staff recommended approval of amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for a rooftop addition for the property located at 408 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. [File No. 22-004369-COA] with the following condition to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Revise the 1:12 roof pitch to meet the standard (minimum of 2:12).

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Jerome Elder stated they are adjusting the top pitch adjusted.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There was no Board comment.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for a rooftop addition for the property located at 408 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. [File No. 22-004369-COA] with the following condition to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1.Revise the 1:12 roof pitch to meet the standard (minimum of 2:12).

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: Melissa H. Rowan **Dwayne Stephens** - Not Present Melissa Memory - Not Present **David Altschiller** - Not Present Nan Taylor - Not Present Ellie Isaacs - Abstain Karen Guinn - Aye - Aye Michael Higgins Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

14. Petition of SHEDDarchitecture, Shederick Coleman | 23-003202-COA | 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard | Demolition

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request of approval to demolish the non-contributing buildings at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard. The dates of construction of 412 and 414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard are unknown, but it is believed that 412 was built in the early 1900s, and 414 as it exists today was originally four wood-framed town houses seen first on the 1898 Sanborn Map.

Both buildings are listed as non-contributing resources within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. The Sanborn Fire Insurance Map from 1888 shows two attached one-story wood frame dwellings at the site of 414 and a two-story wood frame dwelling at the approximate site of 412. By 1898, 412 West Broad Street is still a two-story wood frame dwelling but with some alterations at the rear. 414 West Broad Street is not shown as an address but there are four attached two-story wood frame dwellings on Tattnall Street and heading towards the corner of West Broad Street. Photographs from the 1940s show what looks like this configuration was still there but adapted into a commercial building on the street level.

The Savannah Ward Notebook for the Berrien Ward has a note to omit both 412 and 414 West Broad Street, but a reason is not given. Neither page includes much detail except to note that they have a vague construction date of '20th Century.' Based on photographs starting in the 1930s, it appears that the structure at 414 today is an alteration of the original structure. The storefront seen in historic photographs and the frieze above the storefront with the shop name appear to be the only surviving features still visible. 412 has undergone major renovations where it is nearly unrecognizable from the earlier photos. At some point between the 1953 and 1973 Sanborn Maps, the two buildings were adjoined. It may have been around that time that the exterior of 414 was stuccoed and the bay windows removed from the former wood frame houses, which may still exist underneath. The 1953 Sanborn Map lists 414 as a paint store on the main level, with rooms on the second floor. There was a rear portion of the building listed as a dwelling, but it is no longer given a separate listing as a dwelling by 1973, indicating that if it had been functioning separately in 1953, it no longer was twenty years later. The metal windows that were installed on the Tattnall Street side of the building have since been removed.

The 1898 Sanborn Map shows the 412 West Broad Street address still as a two-story wood frame dwelling, but by 1916, there is instead a three-story masonry store building, which may have been an expansion of the older structure. The Sanborn Maps from 1953 and 1973 show the same building, so in this case, the same building that is there currently, was built

within the period of significance, but it has undergone many changes on the front façade that occurred beyond 1960, rendering them unrecognizable from their earlier facades.

Staff recommended to approve the request for demolition of the non-contributing buildings located at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard with the following conditions because the criteria for non-contributing demolition have otherwise been met.

- 1. The buildings must be documented per the MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings.
- 2. Rather than traditional demolition, the building be deconstructed, and the materials salvaged for reuse.

Ms. Guinn asked if Staff was able to observe the interior. **Ms. Chamberlain** stated that there was an exterior observation only, no access to the interior. The Board asked was a structural report provided. **Ms. Michalak** replied the report was not provided to Staff.

Mr. Higgins asked about the history of the structure to the African American community and civil rights. He stated he was certain more can be done.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Shedrick Coleman, petitioner, stated he has 3 years of the building structural reports in efforts to save. The client wanted to use the building. It was a total structural reuse. The repurpose value is why deconstruct was requested and showed pictures to support the decision to deconstruct, as it is not structurally sound. The cost was not conducive - just for the inside.

Mr. Stephen Friedman, owner, stated both structural engineers stated there was no salvaging the structure. He stated he wanted to save the structure and would like the materials within to be saved.

Ms. Guinn stated she is happy the structural report was done. **Mr. Coleman** stated it is not required; did not push it with Staff. The Board asked if an assessment was done on 412. **Mr. Coleman** replied no, there is nothing because it an open area. The Board inquired if historical materials were under the stucco.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated they did a walk through and found it unfortunate it has altered to a structurally unsafe building. HSF understands and accepts the deconstruction and will work with the petitioner.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board had concerns over the lack of a structural assessment which was not provided by the applicant, as well as expressing a desire to see more information about 412 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. **Ms. Guinn** and other members felt that there was not enough information presented to be able to make a decision. **Mr. Higgins** stated that in the interior photographs, the fact that old knob and tube wiring can still be seen inside shows that the building dates to the late nineteenth or early twentieth century. He also mentioned the need to further explore the a rich Civil Rights era history and African American history associated with what little remains of the West Broad Street corridor, that had not been destroyed by the I-16 flyover project. **Mr. Houle** stated that 412 could potentially still be saved and may be more intact under the stucco. **Ms. Guinn** also stated that not having criteria or guidelines for deconstruction makes it difficult to approve that as a condition.

The Downtown Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the application for the request for demolition of the non-contributing buildings located at 412-414 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, for no more than ninety (90) days, to allow time for the applicant to provide information such as structural reports and photographs, and for staff to reevaluate whether these buildings qualify for contributing status.

Mr. Houle voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present Melissa Memory - Not Present **David Altschiller** - Not Present - Not Present Nan Taylor Ellie Isaacs - Abstain Karen Guinn - Aye Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Nay

15. Petition of Glenn Keyes Architect | 23-003204-COA | 14-18 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Rehabilitation & Alterations

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request of approval to rehabilitate the exterior of 14 East Oglethorpe Avenue and 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue, and the installation of a new metal stair and elevator tower with new mechanical equipment on the roof. The rehabilitation work includes repair of all wood elements, restoration of windows and doors, repair and recoating of roof, replacement of non-historic windows, and removal of elastomeric coating from historic stucco and repainting.

14 East Oglethorpe Avenue was built circa 1838 and 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue was built in 1844. Both are currently part of the Ballastone Inn and are contributing resources within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. The structures are situated on East Oglethorpe between Drayton and Bull Streets. The buildings are between the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace to the west, and a one-story midcentury modern building to the east that is home to Seabolt Real Estate. Both addresses have their rear elevations completely visible from East York Lane.

14 East Oglethorpe Avenue is also known as the Anderson-Preston House and was renovated and enlarged in 1883 by William Gibbons Preston. This is the main building of the Ballastone Inn. The property is first seen on the 1884 Sanborn Map as a three-story masonry dwelling with a basement. There are wood frame porches on the east, west, and rear elevations with a wood walkway at the rear that connected to a two-story masonry carriage house. A smaller one-story masonry outbuilding also existed at the west corner of the lot, adjacent to the carriage house. Changes to the property are not seen until the 1898 Sanborn Map where the rear porch was enclosed, the side porches were removed, and the front west side was extended with a bay window added. This can still be seen today. By 1916, it was functioning as an apartment building, which is also noted on the 1953 and 1973 Sanborn Maps. No major structural changes are seen on the maps during this time, but the

outbuildings were demolished by 1973.

18 East Oglethorpe Avenue is also known as the Williams-Anderson-Blun House. It currently functions as the Ballastone Inn annex and was renovated in 1966. The building is first seen on the 1884 Sanborn Map as a three-story wood frame dwelling with a side porch on the east elevation, and a masonry addition to the rear. There is also a one-story outbuilding at the west rear corner of the lot, which shows as a wood building but then on the 1888 Sanborn Map, a one-story masonry outbuilding appears to have taken the place of the former wood frame one. There are no structural changes to the building on the 1888 Sanborn Map, except the front stairs are no longer noted. In 1916, there was a store in the basement level and rooming on the upper levels. There was an addition of a stoop to the west corner of the front elevation. There are no major changes seen on the 1953 map, but by 1973, the rear masonry addition had been removed and the front stoop is no longer noted.

Staff recommended to approve the request for rehabilitation of historic features at 14 East Oglethorpe Avenue and 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue, and the construction of an unattached elevator tower at the rear of the property of 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue, with the following conditions for staff review and approval prior to starting the project, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Confirm that the addition of the stairs and elevator tower would remain within the 75% maximum lot coverage zoned for D-N properties.
- 2. Consider options that may include incorporating the existing historic door into the design rather than sealing off and cutting a new opening into the ground level of 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue.
- 3. Ensure that the rear stairs on 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue are attached in a way that would not cause major damage to the building if removed.
- 4. Provide any information on color changes for painting, if it differs from the existing.
- 5. Provide information about the stucco finish for 14 East Oglethorpe Street, and to ensure that the gentlest means possible is utilized for removing the elastomeric coating, including a test patch in an inconspicuous area.
- 6. Provide a window and door schedule, and specific product information, including how existing openings may be altered.
- 7. Provide information regarding the wood type for the replacement shutters.
- 8. Provide specific details about the exterior lighting.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Glenn Keyes, petitioner, stated he agreed with Staff recommendations. The rear has been compromised and is trying to make as close to original configuration as possible. They would like to move the rear door to make it align with windows above it. The stair and elevator will not impact anything for egress and ADA requirements.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, presented a mockup to support his opposition. He stated that the elevator should be put inside. It is a hotel that is altering the structure for the worse.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, expressed concerns with elevate shaft facades being stucco. He stated that the facade should be the same material of the building or wood siding with enclosed window. There is also concern with the opening, prefer the elevator on the exterior. Recommends continuation.

Mr. Keyes stated their goal is to have as a light a touch on a historic structure.

BOARD COMMENTS;

Board members would like to see more information about the height of the elevator shaft, and how it relates to the surrounding contributing buildings. Members agreed that seeing alternate views and mockups of the rear, such as how it would be seen from different street view perspectives, would be helpful with this. There was discussion of creating a back porch look to the rear stairs and adding faux windows to the elevator tower, to be more visually compatible.

Motion

The Downtown Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request for rehabilitation of historic features at 14 East Oglethorpe Avenue and 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue, and the construction of an unattached elevator tower at the rear of the property of 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue, for a period not to exceed ninety (90) days, in order for the petitioner to address the following conditions, and to provide alternative views and mockups of the rear:

- 1.Confirm that the addition of the stairs and elevator tower would remain within the 75% maximum lot coverage zoned for D-N properties.
- 2.Consider options that may include incorporating the existing historic door into the design rather than sealing off and cutting a new opening into the ground level of 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue.
- 3.Ensure that the rear stairs on 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue are attached in a way that would not cause major damage to the building if removed.
- 4. Provide any information on color changes for painting, if it differs from the existing.
- 5. Provide information about the stucco finish for 14 East Oglethorpe Street, and to ensure that the gentlest means possible is utilized for removing the elastomeric coating, including a test patch in an inconspicuous area.
- 6. Provide a window and door schedule, and specific product information, including how existing openings may be altered.
- 7. Provide information regarding the wood type for the replacement shutters.
- 8. Provide specific details about the exterior lighting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle Second: Karen Guinn

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present - Not Present Melissa Memory **David Altschiller** - Not Present Nan Taylor - Not Present - Abstain Ellie Isaacs Karen Guinn - Ave Michael Higgins - Aye Melissa H. Rowan - Aye Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

16. Acknowledgement and approval of Staff-approved petitions.

Motion

The Board acknowledged the Staff-approved petitions.

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

- 17. Petition of Alternative Roofing Solutions | 23-00305-COA | 417 East Bay Street | Replace steel deck roof
- 18. Petition of Robert Hendrian | 23-003160-COA | 112 West Waldburg Street | In-kind siding repair and replacement.
- 19. Petition of Yan Polansky | 23-002919-COA | 304 E State Street | Replace aluminum siding with wood lap and paint white.
- 20. Petition of MetalCrafts | 23-002987-COA | 228 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. | Mechanical screening and roof replacement.
- 21. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 23-002875-COA | 705 Barnard Street | Roof and stucco repairs.
- 22. Petition of Yan Polansky | 23-002916-COA | 304 E State Street | Return non-historic window opening to door opening.
- 23. Petition of Roofcrafters | 23-002872-COA | 215 West Liberty Street | Replace white TPO roof in-kind.
- 24. Petition of FastSigns | 23-001250-COA | 317 East Liberty Street | Relocate existing pole sign from 120 E Liberty to tree lawn of 317 E Liberty.
- 25. Petition of FastSigns | 23-002701-COA | 1415 Abercorn Street | Install two non-illuminated signs.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 26. Report on Work Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued COA for the July 12th HDBR Meeting (1 Item)
- 27. Report on Work Which is Inconsistent with an Issued COA for the July 12th HDBR Meeting (2 Items)
- 28. Report on Work Which was Performed Without a COA for the July 12th HDBR Meeting (9 Items)

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

29. Report on Items Deferred to Staff for the July 12th HDBR Meeting (1 Item)

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 30. Stamped Drawings July 12th Report (5 items)
- 31. Report on Inspections Completed by Staff for the July 12th HDBR Meeting (1 item)

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

32. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting - Wednesday August 9, 2023 at 12pm - 112 East State Street

33. Next HDBR Regular Meeting - Wednesday August 9, 2023 at 1pm - 112 East State Street

34. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the July 12, HDBR meeting adjourned at 2:58 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah G. Michalak Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.