

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street November 9, 2022 1:00 PM MINUTES

November 9, 2022 Historic District Board of Review

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM at 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Nan Taylor, Chair

David Altschiller Karen Guinn Michael Higgins Melissa Rowan Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: Ellie Isaacs

Melissa Memory

MPC Staff Present: Melanie Wilson, Executive Director

Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation

Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner Ethan Hagerman, Assistant Planner James Zerillo, Assistant Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant

Julie Yawn, System Analyst

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

- 1. Petition of Old Coast Heating and Air Conditioning, Roy Moore | 22-004347-COA | 107 West Perry Street | Solar Panels
 - Staff Report 22-004347-COA 107 W Perry St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 22-004347-COA.pdf
 - Staff Research Packet- 301 East Charlton Street.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the installation of eight (8)

solar panels on the roof for the property located at 107 West Perry Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain

Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn- AyeMichael Higgins- AyeMelissa H. Rowan- AyeThomas L. Thomson- Aye

2. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 22-004364-COA | 63 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. | Amendment to New Construction

- Staff Report 22-004364-COA 63 MLK Jr. Blvd..pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for a new construction hotel on the vacant property located at 63 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd [File No. 17-002904-COA] as requested because the proposed changes are visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn - Aye
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

- Staff Research.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Report 22-004587-COA 412-416 East Gwinnett Street.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve an amendment to a previous COA under file number 22-001326-COA for alterations to the front porch at 412-416 East Gwinnett Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present
Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn- AyeMichael Higgins- AyeMelissa H. Rowan- AyeThomas L. Thomson- Aye

4. Petition of Susan Mason | 22-004710-COA | 602 Habersham Street | New Handrail

- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Research Packet 602 Habersham St.pdf
- Staff Report 22-004710-COA 602 Habersham Street.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the installation of a connecting wood handrail section to a pre-existing handrail on the porch stairs at 602 Habersham Street with the following condition because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Provide staff with a color sample of the paint prior to painting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

5. Petition of Walt Freeman | 22-004726-COA | 3 West Perry Street | Fence

- Staff Report 22-004726-COA 3 West Perry Street
- Submittal Packet
- Staff Research

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the reconstruction of a new fence on the property located at 3 West Perry Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn - AyeMichael Higgins - AyeMelissa H. Rowan - AyeThomas L. Thomson - Aye

6. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 22-004730-COA | 406 East Hall Street | Amendment to Previous COA

- Staff Report 22-004730-COA 406 East Hall Street
- Submittal Packet
- Staff Research

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve an amendment to the previous COA (21-006806-COA) for the building located at 406 East Hall Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Abstain
Ellie Isaacs	- Not Present
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

7. Petition of Waters Building and Design | 22-004740-COA | 301 East Charlton Street | Alterations

- Staff Report 2-004740-COA 301 E Charlton St.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Research Packet- 301 East Charlton Street.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the removal of the non-historic partition walls enclosing the lower stoop for the property located at 301 East Charlton Street with the following condition because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1.If any uncovered historic features such as the stucco are found in a state of deterioration, that they shall be repaired rather than replaced unless the severity of the deterioration requires replacement.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn
Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Abstain

Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn - AyeMichael Higgins - AyeMelissa H. Rowan - AyeThomas L. Thomson - Aye

8. Petition of Historic Savannah Foundation | 22-004743-COA | 321 East York Street | Alterations

- Staff Research.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Report 22-004743-COA 321 E York St.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve alterations to the rear porch at 321 East York Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn- AyeMichael Higgins- AyeMelissa H. Rowan- AyeThomas L. Thomson- Aye

9. Petition of LS3P Associates Architects | 22-004746-COA | 110 Ann Street | Amendments to New Construction

- Staff Report 22-0004746-COA 110 Ann St.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for the new apartment building located at 110 Ann Street as requested because the proposed changes are visually compatible and meet the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn- AyeMichael Higgins- AyeMelissa H. Rowan- AyeThomas L. Thomson- Aye

10. Petition of Barnard Architects | 22-004749-COA | 21 East McDonough Street | Mechanical Enclosure

- Submittal Packet
- Staff Research

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve a mechanical enclosure attached to the building located at 21 East McDonough Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn
Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn- AyeMichael Higgins- AyeMelissa H. Rowan- AyeThomas L. Thomson- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

11. Adopt the November 9, 2022 Agenda

Motion

The Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned to adopt the November 9, 2022 HDBR agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Karen Guinn

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Abstain

Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn- AyeMichael Higgins- AyeMelissa H. Rowan- AyeThomas L. Thomson- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

12. Approval of October 12, 2022 Meeting Minutes

∅ 10.12.22 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned to approve the October 12, 2022 Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present
Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn- AyeMichael Higgins- AyeMelissa H. Rowan- AyeThomas L. Thomson- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

13. Petition of Pantheon ADC | 22-002854-COA | 11 Jefferson Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details

Motion
Continue.
Vote Results (Not Started)
Motion:
Second:

Motion

The Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned to continue this petition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn - Aye
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

- 14. Petition of Gerald Chambers and Michael Gronebaum | 22-004372-COA | 222 East Gwinnett Street | Alterations
 - Staff Research.pdf
 - Submittal Packet.pdf
 - Staff Report 22-004372-COA 222 E Gwinett.pdf
 - Petitioner's Presentation.pdf

Mr. James Zerillo presented the applicant's request for rehabilitation and alterations to the rear lane building of 222 East Gwinnett Street. The petitioner is proposing the addition of a second story porch on the south facade, citing historical precedent based on physical evidence on the site as well as a testimonial from the previous owner. The porch will be minimally visible from East Gwinnett Street and East Gwinnett Lane. Additionally, along the south façade, on new door opening is proposed to be added and one window is proposed to be changed to a door; these changes will not be visible from a right-of-way.

Staff presented a recommendation of approval for rehabilitations and alterations at 222 East Gwinnett Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. The illegal brickwork shall be removed and inspected by the appropriate City departments (not MPC Preservation Staff) prior to the issuance of any stamped permit drawings for the proposed alterations.
- 2. Salvage all historic materials on the site for potential reuse.
- 3. Revise the proposed replacement siding material to wood siding that matches the existing historic wood siding in materials, design, texture, and other visual qualities. Fiber cement siding (Hardi board) is not permitted on a historic building.
- 4. Provide images of the proposed new doors.
- 5. The porch eaves must overhang at least 8 inches; provide a dimension.
- 6. Revise the porch roof soffits to be perpendicular to the posts below and not sloping in plane with the roof.
- 7. Add caps and base moldings to the porch posts.

Ms. Taylor asked about the oldest photos of the structure. **Mr. Zerillo** stated the oldest pictures were presented.

Mr. Thomson asked about the illegal wall and the new building, if it is attached to the new building. **Ms. Michalak** stated the concern and confusion stems that the new building is proposed to be exactly where the illegal wall is located, as the wall does not match what is proposed. The petitions were submitted a month apart at the petitioner's discretion.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Michael Groenbaum presented his support for his request and compliance to the conditions. He objected to the removal of the illegal brickwork condition from this application (it is applicable to the other application for this address).

Mr. Thomson asked if the brick wall is attached to historic building; it appears to be. Needs to be on both comments for the historic building.

Mr. Groenbaum stated the alterations is for existing carriage house to have historic character added back to the house. The brick wall is not part of that process, on the west side.

Mr. Altschiller asked what the wall is built for. **Mr. Groenbaum** responded to protect trashcans; continued existing fence line. Not attached to historic building. It will be removed in the future with the new construction requested.

Mr. Zerillo stated it was touching the main structure, so it was considered a part of the context; up to the Board to remove the wall condition.

Mr. Altschiller asked is there precedent to combine petitions. **Ms. Michalak** stated the Board can require them to be combined.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There was no Board comment.

Motion

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approval for rehabilitations and alterations at 222 East Gwinnett Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. The illegal brickwork shall be removed and inspected by the appropriate City departments (not MPC Preservation Staff) prior to the issuance of any stamped permit drawings for the proposed alterations.
- 2. Salvage all historic materials on the site for potential reuse.
- 3. Revise the proposed replacement siding material to wood siding that matches the existing historic wood siding in materials, design, texture, and other visual qualities. Fiber cement siding (Hardi board) is not permitted on a historic building.
- 4. Provide images of the proposed new doors.
- 5. The porch eaves must overhang at least 8 inches; provide a dimension.
- 6. Revise the porch roof soffits to be perpendicular to the posts below and not sloping in plane with the roof.
- 7. Add caps and base moldings to the porch posts.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain

Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn - Aye
Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Motion

Table

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller Second: Karen Guinn

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn - AyeMichael Higgins - AyeMelissa H. Rowan - AyeThomas L. Thomson - Aye

Motion

Return item to agenda.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain

Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn- AyeMichael Higgins- AyeMelissa H. Rowan- AyeThomas L. Thomson- Aye

15. Petition of Gerald Chambers and Michael Gronebaum | 22-004727-COA | 222 East Gwinnett Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)

Staff Research.pdf

- Staff Report 22-004727-COA 222 E Gwinnett St.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Petitioner's Presentation.pdf

Mr. James Zerillo presented the petitioner's request of approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 222 East Gwinnett Street. The new construction is an addition to an existing historic lane building, connected by a hyphen. The building will be a garage on the ground floor and a "bonus room" on the second floor and will be constructed over the existing paved parking pad. It is proposed to be connected internally to the existing historic lane building.

Staff presented a recommendation of approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 222 East Gwinnett Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. The illegal brickwork shall be removed and inspected by the appropriate City departments (not MPC Preservation Staff) prior to the issuance of any stamped permit drawings for the proposed new construction.
- 2. Provide a dimension for the inset of the hyphen and ensures it is a 6-inch minimum to clear the historic lane structure's corner boards.
- 3. Revise the foundation so it does not project forward of the building plane.
- 4. Revise the porch roof soffits to be perpendicular to the posts below and not sloping in plane with the roof.
- 5. Revise the proposed fiberglass doors to be steel, wood, or wood-clad.
- 6. Provide clarification of where the apron will be and ensure it is not erected on the public right-of-way.
- 7. Revise the second story porch railing to meet the 36-inch railing height standard.

8.

Mr. Higgins asked to see where the unpermitted work is located. **Mr. Zerillo** provided that information.

Ms. Taylor stated it makes more sense after seeing the second application.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Micheal Groenbaum asked who to notify when illegal brickwork is removed. **Ms. Michalak** stated the code compliance officer.

Mr. Groenbaum stated if approved, the brick wall will be removed as it is currently, the condition is not necessary. They will comply with other staff requests.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Higgins has concerns of not being able to see the projects together to see the effects of the designs together. There is not one view of all the requests together.

Ms. Taylor stated they will have to be viewed as separate projects independent of each other.

Mr. Higgins stated he has more concerns with second petition; possible continue of second to see everything together.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby Continue the request for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 222 East Gwinnett Street to the December 14, 2022 HDBR Meeting in order for the project to be redesigned as follows:

- 1. The illegal brickwork shall be removed and inspected by the appropriate City departments (not MPC Preservation Staff) prior to the issuance of any stamped permit drawings for the proposed new construction.
- 2. Provide a dimension for the inset of the hyphen and ensures it is a 6 inch minimum to clear the historic lane structure's corner boards.
- 3. Revise the foundation so it does not project forward of the building plane.
- 4. Revise the porch roof soffits to be perpendicular to the posts below and not sloping in plane with the roof.
- 5. Revise the proposed fiberglass doors to be steel, wood, or wood-clad.
- 6. Provide clarification of where the apron will be and ensure it is not erected on the public right-of-way.
- 7. Revise the second story porch railing to meet the 36-inch railing height standard.
- 8.Revise drawings to include both the historic lane building with the proposed and approved alterations and the addition so that the proposed work may be understood in context.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present
Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn - AyeMichael Higgins - AyeMelissa H. Rowan - AyeThomas L. Thomson - Aye

- 16. Petition of GM Shay Architects | 22-004359-COA | 225 East President Street | Alterations and Addition
 - Staff Report 22-004359-COA 225 E President.pdf

 - Staff Research Packet Part 1.pdf
 - Staff Research Packet Part 2.pdf
 - Staff Research Packet Part 3.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request of approval for alterations and an addition for the property at 225 East President Street, including demolition of a 1980s addition and replacement with a new addition, porch glazing and an in-kind roof replacement. This is a redesign based on the original submittal for the October 12, 2022, Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review meeting. The applicant addressed the issues and created a redesign based on Board comments and historic photographs.

Per the applicant:

"HDBR Responses Addressed:

- -No existing historic fabric on exterior removed
- -Restored existing previously infilled window openings to windows
- -Reinterpreted Post-Modern non-historic porches with HDZO-allowed rear porch glazing
- -All existing window and shutter hardware restored
- -Proposed design is now subservient to historic structure and visually compatible"

Staff presented a recommendation of approval for alterations and an addition for the property located at 225 East President Street <u>as requested</u> because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Pat Shay, petitioner, commended staff on research of property. He stated they tried carefully to listen and incorporated Board requests. This presentation is more subdued, yet consistent with model presented two years ago. Reduced the mass and made the rear symmetrical. The historic buildings will read as such and not compete with new structures.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, citizen, stated the revised proposal is a dramatic improvement in regard to symmetry and closed porches. The upper level of enclosed porches obscures the brick and replacement windows. To remove the windows to install doors will require removal of windowsills and brick. Requested removal of historic fabric be indicated in staff notes.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, Historic Savannah Foundation, supports Mr. Jones. Lowest portions of the porch are typically more enclosed than glass. There is also concern of windows being turned into doors.

Ms. Ellen Harris, Downtown Neighborhood Association, stated appreciation of revised submittal. The enclosed porch will have a solid base to provide grounding to addition.

Mr. Shay thanked the public and stated the standards do allow for rear side of historic buildings. This addition is less in height and mass; they compromised considerably. He stated he will consider a more solid base, as it does makes sense.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

Ms. Guinn expressed appreciation of petitioner listening to Board and Staff recommendations; aided in improvement of design.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve alterations and an addition for the property located at 225 East President Street with the following condition because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1.Architect will redesign the ground floor glazed porches to have more solids

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Abstain
Ellie Isaacs	- Not Present
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

17. Petition of Rose Architects | 22-004373-COA | 111 West Congress Street | Alterations, Addition, Variance Request

- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Report 22-004373-COA 111 West Congress Street.pdf
- Submittal Packet Bifold Doors.pdf
- Staff Research Packet- 111 W Congress St.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request of alterations and a variance request recommendation for the property located at 111 West Congress Street. Proposed work includes reconfiguring the interior spaces, the addition of a roof deck and bar and indoor/outdoor operable patio, a roof replacement, and a marquee sign on the front façade.

The applicant is also requesting a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard regarding marquees in the *Special Sign Districts 9.9.17*, section f viii that reads:

"...the lowest point of the marquee sign shall not be less than 10 feet above the established grade."

to allow for 8'-9" of clearance from the underside of the marquee to the sidewalk.

Staff presented a recommendation of approval of the proposed alterations and addition at 111 West Congress Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Provide information on the sign illumination prior to installation.

AND

Recommend <u>approval</u> for a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard that reads:

"...the lowest point of the marquee sign shall not be less than 10 feet above the established grade."

To allow for 8'-9" of clearance from the underside of the marquee to the sidewalk and maintain the visual compatibility of the vertical dimensions prevalent on the 100 Block of West Congress Street.

^{***}Ms. Guinn recused herself from this item.

PETITIONER'S COMMENT:

Mr. Kevin Rose, petitioner, agreed with Staff comments. Requesting to eliminate column because it is a narrow sidewalk and the bi-fold doors have to open up, which the French doors would be difficult to open.

Mr. Higgins asked if anything other than marquees were explored. **Mr. Rose** stated the client wanted a marquee; staff seemed excited with it, as many have been lost. It will also serve as an awning. **Mr. Higgins** questioned the visual compatibility, and that it is on a narrow street.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board commented that the design is much improved. The height issue of the marquee is overwhelming; could be higher and away from the sidewalk. There is a way to have it done to meet the height.

Many of the awnings on that street are 8' and lower. **Ms. Michalak** stated awnings are required to be 8 feet clear; marquee 10- feet. **Mr. Altschiller** stated he is wary of variances from the Ordinance. **Mr. Rose** stated they are lining up with what is on the street. There are four historic marquises in Savannah, two are less than 10 feet. Used historic pattern as inspiration; raising it will contradict that.

Mr. Higgins stated the historic marqueees were done before ordinance. Thinks there could be an alternate design for it, which was agreed by **Mr. Thomson**.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the proposed alterations and addition at 111 West Congress Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Provide information on the sign illumination prior to installation.

AND

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby recommend approval for a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard that reads:

"...the lowest point of the marquee sign shall not be less than 10 feet above the established grade."

To allow for 8'-9" of clearance from the underside of the marquee to the sidewalk and maintain the visual compatibility of the vertical dimensions prevalent on the 100 Block of West Congress Street.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Abstain

Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn - Aye

Michael Higgins - Nay

Melissa H. Rowan - Aye

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

- 18. Petition of GM Shay Architects | 22-004728-COA | 301 West Bay Street | Alterations and Additions
 - Staff Report 22-004728-COA 301 West Bay Street
 - Submittal Packet & Materials
 - Staff Research

Mr. Ethan Hageman presented the petitioner's request of approval for alterations and additions to the building located at **301 West Bay Street.** The project description is listed below per the petitioner:

"The petitioner seeks to renovate and adaptively rehabilitate the building, bringing it up to current building codes. The intended uses are for an event space on the top floor taking full advantage of the views from the existing roof deck; residential apartments on Level 3 and Level 2; and a tenant space for a food and beverage establishment (Club One?) on the ground and in the existing basement.

Access to the top floor event space will be from Jefferson Street leading to an elevator. Separate access to a separate elevator up to the apartments will also be from Jefferson Street. Primary access to the food and beverage tenant at the ground floor will be through a monumental entrance on Bay Street which is dangerously narrow now. Also, a new service entrance will be created on Bay Lane for deliveries and waste removal.

To the extent possible, the intent is to refurbish the existing exterior elements of the original building in kind by refurbishing existing (non-historic) upper floor windows; refurbishing existing shutters on Bay Lane; opening and refurbishing existing wood storefronts; repointing existing brickwork; and replacing or refurbishing existing (non-historic) metal work. The upper floor addition will be kept in place but extensively improved by removing existing non-historic aluminum storefronts and replacing them with newly constructed walls and operable doors. These new elements will be clad in cedar siding to clearly differentiate them from the historic structure. Remaining existing non-historic stucco elements will be recoated in a much more visually compatible (Merlot) color.

The existing historic masonry wall facing the adjacent much larger Hilton Garden Inn will be completely repointed, and six new openings cut into these walls in inconspicuous areas to allow daylight into the apartments in these areas. These openings in the now blank wall will be obscured by the adjacent existing hotel about 5 feet away. Also, to conceal the outdoor air-conditioning units needed to make the upper floor habitable, a fully screened mechanical platform is proposed on the side of the existing roof deck furthest away from street view."

Staff presented recommendation of approval for alterations and additions to the building located at 301 West Bay Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Provide the proposed mortar type and specification for the repointing work and ensure that a four foot by four-foot test patch of the proposed repointing as it will appear finished (including final finish pointing style and relationship to the brick face) is

- installed in an inconspicuous location on the building; contact staff to review the test patch prior to full execution of the work.
- 2. Provide the dimensions of the balusters for the proposed guardrails and railings of the rooftop of the south façade.
- 3. Submit where the refuse storage area will be located.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Pat Shay stated he agrees with Staff recommendations. As it not a restoration project, they cannot bring back to what it was. Will provide final detail design. A door will be added to rear of house.

Mr. Thomson asked for third floor plans. Mr. Shay stated they will be apartments.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board stated appreciation that the buildings are being invested in.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the proposed alterations and additions to the building located at 301 West Bay Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1.Provide the proposed mortar type and specification for the repointing work and ensure that a four foot by four-foot test patch of the proposed repointing as it will appear finished (including final finish pointing style and relationship to the brick face) is installed in an inconspicuous location on the building; contact staff to review the test patch prior to full execution of the work.
- 2.Provide the dimensions of the balusters for the proposed guardrails and railings of the rooftop of the south façade.
- 3. Submit where the refuse storage area will be located.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present
Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Abstain

Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn- AyeMichael Higgins- AyeMelissa H. Rowan- AyeThomas L. Thomson- Aye

19. Petition of Hansen Architects | 22-002279-COA | 220 East Bryan Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details

- Submittal Packet Specifications.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
- ∅ 1954 and 1973 Sanborn Maps.pdf
- 1 Previous Submittal Packet.pdf
- @2 Previous Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Report 22-002279-COA 220 E Bryan St.pdf
- Petitioner's Presentation.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for the petition of New Construction: Part II, Design Details to construct a 7-story hotel on the property located at 220 East Bryan Street. The project qualifies as Large-Scale Development, and the project has been granted an additional story above the Height Map utilizing Criterion B which requires "multiple ground floor active uses" and "exterior building walls incorporate 100% modular masonry materials on all sides with the use of granite, marble, or other natural quarried stone over a minimum of 30 percent of all street fronting facades". The existing building on the site, built in 1970, has already been approved for demolition.

Staff presented recommendation of approval for the petition of New Construction: Part II, Design Details to construct a 7-story hotel on the property located at 220 East Bryan Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the front entrance doors from sliding doors to traditional swing doors to meet the standard.
- 2. Provide a full-sized sample of the Peerless metal window that has muntins that do not exceed 7/8" wide and have a wider bottom rail than the meeting and top rails OR select a previous approved window from the window brochure.
- 3. Revise the storefront base to have a contrasting design or material to meet the standard.

Mr. Altschiller asked is PVC prohibited. Ms. Michalak stated it is not prohibited. Mr. Altschiller asked will it become a precedent. Ms. Michalak stated recommendations stand separately.

Mr. Thomson asked if PVC is final color or will be painted.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Pat Phelps, petitioner, stated the PVC is the most compatible material; metal not appropriate and wood would be troublesome. It is to look like smooth wood after painting.

Mr. Thomson asked about maintenance. **Mr. Phelps** stated special paint will be used to lengthen paint lifecycle. Agrees with Staff and provide swinging doors; adhere to Staff recommendations. Will provide additional samples of proposed materials as needed.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, Historic Savannah Foundation, agrees with Staff that materiality is appropriate. Reiterated that recombination of lots is threat to our Historic District.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Thomson asked if the conditions are satisfactory to Staff.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition of New Construction: Part II, Design Details to construct a 7-story hotel on the property located at 220 East Bryan Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the front entrance doors from sliding doors to traditional swing doors to meet the standard.
- 2. The applicant is to work with staff to agree upon an appropriate window
- 3. Revise the storefront base to have a contrasting design or material to meet the standard.

Board Note: The PVC approved is unique to this project and is not precedent setting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain
Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn - Aye
Michael Higgins - Aye
Melissa H. Rowan - Aye
Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

- 20. Acknowledge approved Staff-reviewed petitions
- 21. Petition of PROVIDENCE CONSULTING, Amanda Street | 22-003597-COA | 411 WEST BAY STREET | Equipment Upgrade
 - SIGNED Staff Decision- 22-003597-COA 411 West Bay Street.pdf
- 22. Petition of HANSEN ARCHITECTS, Shaddericka Huff | 22-004290-COA | 18 E BROUGHTON STREET | Non-historic window replacement
 - SIGNED Staff Dec 22-004290-COA 18 E Broughton St.pdf
- 23. Petition of ALLEGIANCE ROOFING & EXTERIORS, Kyle Redding | 22-004457-COA | 410 EAST BROUGHTON STREET | Roof Repairs
- 24. Petition of SIX BRICKS REALTY, Nathan Snyder | 22-004256-COA | 305, 307 EAST LIBERTY STREET | Inkind window replacement
 - SIGNED Staff Dec 22-004256-COA 305 307 E Liberty St.pdf
- 25. Petition of DOUG BEAN SIGNS, Angela Bean | 22-004275-COA | 15 EAST YORK STREET | Sign face-change

- 26. Petition of ELISE HIGGINS | 22-004279-COA | 356 MARTIN LUTHER KING, JR. BLVD. | Color change and sign installation
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-004279-COA 356 MLK.pdf
- 27. Petition of STEVEN BODEK INC., Ashley Field | 22-0042314-COA | 318 HABERSHAM STREET | Color change of exterior front door
 - SIGNED Staff Dec 22-004231-COA 318 Habersham.pdf
- 28. Petition of LYNCH & ASSOCIATES, Gloria Rittmann | 22-004012-COA | 15 EAST GORDON STREET | Amendment: rear porch trellis from wood to metal
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-004012-COA 15 E Gordon St.pdf
- 29. Petition of PIONEER CONSTRUCTION, Aaron Stanley | 22-004051-COA | 26 EAST BAY STREET | Replace masonry facade
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-004051-COA 26 E Bay St.pdf
- 30. Petition of FASTSIGNS, Kelly Brooks | 22-004200-COA | 300 BULL STREET | Non-illuminated sign
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-004200-COA 300 Bull St.pdf
- 31. Petition of ALAN ROBINSON | 22-004860-COA | 414 E Huntingdon St | Color Change
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-004860-COA 414 E Huntingdon St.pdf
- 32. Petition of SOTTILE & SOTTILE, Craig Clements | 22-004894-COA | 2117, 119, 121 W GORDON STREET | Color Change
 - SIGNED Decision-22-004894-COA 117 119 121 W Gordon.pdf
- 33. Petition of CHATHAM DEVELOPERS, Patrick Johnston | 22-004861-COA | 23 WEST BROUGHTON STREET | AMEND: 21-006811-COA Storefront (conditions)
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-004861-COA 23 W Broughton St..pdf
- 34. Petition of DOUG BEAN SIGNS, Angela Bean | 22-004869-COA | 232 BULL STREET | Non-illuminated sign (condition)
 - SIGNED Staff Dec 22-004869-COA 232 Bull St.pdf
- 35. Petition of WALT FREEMAN | 22-004862-COA | 3 WEST PERRY STREET | Color change
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-004862-COA 3 W Perry St.pdf
- 36. Petition of COASTAL SIGNS & APPAREL, Chris Standard | 22-004707-COA | 305 EAST RIVER STREET | Non-illuminated sign to front facade
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-004707-COA 305 E River St.pdf
- 37. Petition of LYNCH & ASSOCIATES, Gloria Rittmann | 22-004589-COA | 2400 BULL STREET | Fence (height reduction)
 - SIGNED Staff Dec 22-004589-COA 2400 Bull St.pdf
- 38. Petition of FARRELL CLICK | 22-004596-COA | 424 E PRESIDENT STREET | Color change
 - SIGNED Staff Dec 22-004596-COA 424 E President.pdf
- 39. Petition of COASTAL CANVAS, Austin Webb | 22-004214-COA | 116 WEST CONGRESS STREET | Awning installation

- SIGNED Staff Decision 22-004614-COA 116 W Congress St..pdf
- 40. Petition of LS3P | 22-005054-COA | 700 DRAYTON STREET | AMEND 22-000172-COA
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-005054-COA 700 Drayton St.pdf
- 41. Petition of BROWN DESIGN STUDIO | 22-005007-COA | 420 EAST JONES STREET | Awning installation
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-005007-COA 420 E Jones St.pdf

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 42. Report on Work Performed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the November 9, 2022 HDBR Meeting
 - Report on Work Performed Without a COA November 2022.pdf
- 43. Report on Work Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the November 9, 2022 HDBR Meeting
 - Report on Work that is Inconsistent with an Issued COA November 2022.pdf
- 44. Report on Work that Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the November 9, 2022 HDBR Meeting
 - Report on Work that Exceeds the Scope of an Issued COA November 2022.pdf

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

- 45. Items Deferred to Staff November Report
 - Items Deferred to Staff November Report.pdf

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 46. Stamped Drawings November Report
 - Stamped Drawings November.pdf

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

- 47. Additional Comment 336 Barnard Street
 - public-comment-336-barnard-street.pdf

NEW BUSINESS

48. Chairwoman to Appoint 3-Person Nominating Committee for 2023 Chair and Vice-Chair

Postponed to December 14, 2022 HDBR Meeting.

XV. ADJOURNMENT

- 49. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting Wednesday December 14, 2022 at 12pm 112 East State Street, Mendonsa Hearing Room
- 50. Next HDBR Regular Meeting Wednesday December 14, 2022 at 1pm 112 East State Street, Mendonsa Hearing Room

51. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the November 9, 2022 Historic District Board of Review meeting adjourned at 3:07 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah G. Michalak Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to adjourn the November 9, 2022 meeting at 3:07 p.m.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Abstain

Ellie Isaacs - Not Present

Karen Guinn- AyeMichael Higgins- AyeMelissa H. Rowan- AyeThomas L. Thomson- Aye

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.