



Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room
June 14, 2017 1:00 P. M.
Meeting Minutes

JUNE 14, 2017 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

A Pre-Meeting will be held at 12:00 PM in the Jerry Surrency Conference Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda will be presented by staff, as time permits, and the Board may ask questions. No testimony will be received and no votes will be taken.

Members Present: Stephen Merriman, Chair
 Debra Caldwell
 Scott Cook
 Jennifer Deacon
 Kellie Fletcher
 Mic Matson
 Dwayne Stephens

Members Not Present: Zena McClain, Esq., Vice Chair
 Keith Howington
 Becky Lynch
 Andy McGarrity

MPC Staff Present: Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation
 Sara Farr, Historic Preservation Planner
 Leah Michalak, Historic Preservation Planner
 Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner
 Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

[1. Call to Order and Welcome](#)

Mr. Merriman called the meeting to order at 1:05 and welcomed everyone in attendance. He outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, 10 minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments.

The Board will then go into Board discussion at which time no further testimony is received unless specifically requested by the Chair. Each Board member will be given two minutes twice to provide comments, if they so

desire.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

[2. Approval of All Consent Agenda Items](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approval all consent agenda items

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[3. Petition of Palmetto State Sign Installation | 17-002550-COA | 312 West Broughton Street | Signs, Awnings, Color Change](#)

📎 [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Package.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for an awning recover and signage at 312 West Broughton Street with the following conditions to be approved by staff:

1. A different awning material is selected;
2. The awning signage is decreased to a maximum of 20 square feet;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain

Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[4. Petition of Charles Owens | 17-002688-COA | 48 East Broad Street | Fence and Shed](#)

- 📎 [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Application and Submittal Package.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Shed Information.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a fence and shed at 48 Broad Street with the following conditions to be submitted for staff approval prior to installation:

1. The design of the iron gates;
2. A different location is selected for the shed that does not impact the existing house;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[5. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 17-002890-COA | 140 Ann Street | Signs](#)

- 📎 [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Submittal Package.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a projecting principal use sign at 140 Ann Street, because it meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
----------------	-------

Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[6. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 17-002891-COA | 120 West Liberty Street | Signs](#)

[☞ Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

[☞ Submittal Package.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a freestanding sign at 120 West Liberty Street with the following conditions:

1. The lights are removed;
2. Park & Tree approve the sign location;
3. An encroachment license is approved;

because otherwise it meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[7. Petition of Alchemy Restoration | 17-002909-COA | 604 Barnard Street | Alterations and Addition](#)

[☞ Submittal Packet - Photos and Drawings.pdf](#)

[☞ Submittal Packet - Materials and Specs.pdf](#)

[☞ Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)

[☞ Historic Photos.pdf](#)

[☞ Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations to the front façade and a screened porch addition for the property located at 604 Barnard Street with the following

conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval:

1. Remove the divided lites from the new window in the faux doors.
2. Provide a door specification for the new opening on the south façade and a standing seam metal roof specification and color selection; ensure that the seam height does not exceed 1 inch. Ensure that the stucco finish and texture matches of the new chimney matches that of the existing building (smooth sand finish).

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Abstain
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[8. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 17-002910-COA | 23 West Perry Lane | Alterations](#)

- [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
- [Staff Research Photographs.pdf](#)
- [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations to the carriage house for the property located at 23 West Perry Lane with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. The head height of the westernmost opening is to remain in its current location.
2. Provide the finish for the new human and garage doors.
3. Ensure that the sloped apron to the new garage opening is not erected on the public right-of-way.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye

Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

[9. Adopt the June 14, 2017 Agenda](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt the June 14, 2017 Agenda.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon

Second: Scott Cook

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[10. Approval of Briefing Minutes May 10, 2017](#)

[May 10, 2017 HBR Briefing Minutes.docx](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve May 10, 2017 Briefing Minutes.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[11. Approval of May 10, 2017 Meeting Minutes](#)

[05-10-2017 Minutes.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve May 10, 2017 Meeting Minutes.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Scott Cook

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

[12. Continue All Items to Next Regular Meeting](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue all items to the next Regular Meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[13. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 17-002110-COA | 32 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. | New Construction: Part II, Design Details](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[14. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[15. Petition of Gary Sanders | 16-003487-COA | 305 West Wayne Street | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

[16. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006847-COA | 405 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

[17. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006849-COA | 607 Drayton Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

[18. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street \(Hilton Hotel\) | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[19. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street \(Parking Garage\) | New Construction Part II: Design Details](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[20. Petition of Gary Sanders | 17-000198-COA | 305 West Wayne Street | Demolition of a Non-Contributing Building](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye

Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[21. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-001561-COA | 630 West Bay Street | Hotel New Construction Part II: Design Details](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[22. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-001565-COA | 630 West Bay Street | Parking Garage New Construction Part II: Design Details](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[23. Petition of Patrick McNamara | 17-002109-COA | 348 Jefferson Street | Signs](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting due to incomplete application.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

- Debra Caldwell - Aye
- Jennifer Deacon - Aye
- Kellie Fletcher - Aye
- Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain
- Scott Cook - Aye
- Dwayne Stephens - Aye
- Mic Matson - Aye

[24. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 620 East River Street \(Hotel Anne\) | New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

- Debra Caldwell - Aye
- Jennifer Deacon - Aye
- Kellie Fletcher - Aye
- Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain
- Scott Cook - Aye
- Dwayne Stephens - Aye
- Mic Matson - Aye

[25. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 17-002128-COA | 300 and 326 West Bay Street | Demolition](#)

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

- Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

[26. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006848-COA | 501 Montgomery Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details](#)

- 📎 [Aerial View.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Gaston Ward.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Drawings.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Specifications.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Mr. Patrick Shay was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for revisions to Part 1, and review of Part 2: Design Details for new construction of a six unit, four story multi-family building with commercial uses on the first floor. The building will have a corner entrance orienting towards both Gaston and Montgomery Street. Two additional entrances will orient towards Gaston Street. The property will not feature on-site parking. Exterior lighting and signage will be selected and applied for at a later date.

Ms. Smith stated that the Historic District Board of Review approved Part 1: Height and Mass on January 11, 2017, with the following conditions:

1. Increase the height of the first floor to 14'-6"; *The condition is met.*
2. Increase the number of voids on the north elevation; *The condition is met. The petitioner has added three additional windows; one at the second, third and fourth floor on the north elevation.*
3. Provide the height of the rooftop elevator for review; *The rooftop elevator will have a height of 6'6" and the height of the rooftop stairwell enclosure will be 9'6".*
4. Increase the number of voids on the south and west elevations where visible from the public right-of-way; *The condition is met. Additional windows were added to the second, third and fourth stories of the two facades. These will be visible from the public right-of-way.*
5. Reduce the height of the second, third and fourth stories to reduce the overall height of the building; *The petitioner has revised the floor heights of the second, third and fourth stories, reducing the height of the floors from 11'4" to 10'8" in an effort to reduce the overall height of the building.*
6. Ensure that the parapet has a string course and coping; *The condition is met. A string course and coping have been added to the parapets. The parapet wall will feature metal coping and a stucco string course with a height of one foot and a thickness of ¾".*
7. Reduce the depth of the balconies on the east elevation to three feet to meet the standard; *The condition is met. The depth of the balconies on the east elevation have been reduced to three feet to meet the standard.*
8. Ensure that the window sashes and door frames are inset not less than three inches, and that the storefront be inset no less than four inches from the façade; *The condition is met. The insets will*

meet the minimum inset required at three inches.

Ms. Smith explained that the additional changes to the design with the current submittal include:

- The size of the double hung windows was previously specified to be 3' x 6'. The current drawings show these windows with proportions measuring 3' x 5'6".
- The size of the openings located above the corner entrance at the second, third and fourth floors have also been slightly reduced. The openings on the center facade previously featured window bays with three segmented window panels. The current design features two.
- The petitioner has revised the projecting wall feature that extends from the east elevation's balconies facing Montgomery Street. The wall was previously shown to extend 4'6" from the façade, and the design has now been revised to extend five feet from the east elevation. Since the depth of the balconies at this location needed to be reduced to meet the standard at three feet, the overall proportion of the wall feature has changed.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of Part 2 Design Details for new construction at 501 Montgomery Street with the following conditions to be reviewed and approved by staff prior to construction:

1. Submit a specification for the proposed louvers;
2. Ensure the proposed Hardie Board and Hardie Plank siding has a smooth finish;
3. Reduce the overall height of the building by reducing the floor-to-floor heights, parapet, and height of the enclosed stairwell;
4. Revise the fixed windows to an approved window type;
5. Remove or reduce the dimension of the projecting wall located on the east elevation so that the feature does not read as a privacy wall;
6. Change the material of the ground floor and top story, so that the distinction between the base, middle, and top of the north and east elevation are clearly distinct.

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Shay came forward and introduced the firm's staff members attending today's meeting with him. He said generally speaking, they are okay with the staff comments, but there are two recommendations that he wants to ask the Board to give them some relief on. Mr. Shay said that when they presented before the Board for the Part I Height and Mass approval, the discussion was had regarding the upper floor height from the 11' - 4" that was shown. He said, at that time, they asked the Board for some guidance for them to have enough floor to floor so they could preserve 9' ceilings within the apartments. They have reduced this as much as they possibly could and still have 9' ceilings from the 11' - 4" to 10' - 8". Therefore, they believe that they have met the intent. If they are required to reduce this any lower, it will adversely affect the people that will be dwelling here. Mr. Shay said they would appreciate discussion from the Board on this item. Mr. Shay said he respectfully disagrees with the staff as he does not believe that this makes the building incompatible visually with any of the other buildings that are contributing within the ward.

Mr. Shay said they also are seeking some discussion from the Board pertaining to the material from the ground story to the top story. He pointed out the mass that was presented to the Board when Part I review was held. They have studied this and are willing to add score lines on the lower floor closer together to give it a different texture so that it will differentiate the lower story from the upper stories. There is a band that is roughly telling where the floor structure is on the upper floor. They are willing to make this proud so that it will project like a stringcourse further up on the façade.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) stated that they have two points of contention, which are the height and materials. Otherwise, they agree with staff and appreciate the fact

that the petitioner is willing to make the adjustments to the items that staff has suggested. Mr. Carey stated that with respect to height and materials, they agree with the petitioner. The HSF believes the height is okay and relates well enough to its contemporary and to the neighbors. They believe the material is okay as well, especially with the suggestion of the band on the top and the scoring between floors one and two. If the band on the top floor could be minimal, they believe it would be evident enough as proposed. Mr. Carey said it is rather unusual for the HSF to support a slightly taller building, but in this case due to the contemporary nature of the building and the contemporary neighbors including the way that this needs to hang together and be cohesive as designed, too much tinkering or shrinking would make the building not have a positive result.

Mr. Merriman invited Mr. Shay to respond to public comments, but he declined.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board appreciated the petitioner's willingness to incorporate additional horizontal scoring at the first floor and thicken the horizontal band at the upper floors so that the base, middle, and top of the north and east elevation are clearly distinct. The Board agreed with leaving the height as is. They are in agreement with staff regarding the other remaining recommendations.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part 2 Design Details for new construction at 501 Montgomery Street with the following conditions to be reviewed and approved by staff prior to construction:

1. Submit a specification for the proposed louvers;
2. Ensure the proposed Hardie Board and Hardie Plank siding has a smooth finish;
3. Revise the fixed windows to an approved window type;
4. Remove or reduce the dimension of the projecting wall located on the east elevation so that the feature does not read as a privacy wall;
5. Incorporate additional horizontal scored bands at the first floor and thicken the horizontal scoring at the upper floors as presented by the petitioner at the HDBR meeting, so that the base, middle, and top of the north and east elevation are clearly distinct.

Because otherwise, the project meets the Design Standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[☞ Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

[☞ Final Submittal Package.pdf](#)

[☞ Supplemental Petitioner Information.pdf](#)

Ms. Sara Farr gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for revisions to Part I: Height and Mass and Part II: Design Details for new construction at 701, 702, and 703 Howard Street. The three attached townhouses face Howard Street and are located at the corner of Howard and Hall Streets. They abut the east and south property lines.

The previous approval for Part I: Height and Mass included the following conditions, which are addressed in the revised Part II design:

1. Revise the square windows on the west facade. *The condition is met. The windows on the west façade are now rectangular.*
2. Ensure the distance between windows on the north façade is not more than two times the width of the windows; *The condition is met. The parlor level includes two windows and two recessed openings, which meet the intent of the condition.*
3. Extend the Hall Street balcony the full width of the façade; *The condition is met. The balcony now extends the full width of the façade.*
4. Add brackets or other architectural support to the balcony; *The condition is met. Brackets were added to support the balcony.*
5. Provide screening details for the HVAC and refuse storage if necessary; *The condition is met. The applicant indicated that an existing fence would screen the HVAC and storage.*
6. Ensure the curb cut width does not exceed 20 feet;
The applicant agreed to meet this condition, although it is not shown on the site plan.

In addition to addressing the conditions of Part I approval, the design of the townhouses was also modified to be more traditional. Major changes include the stoop design and the addition of a two story projecting square bay element above the garages. Four French doors were also added on the Hall Street façade.

Ms. Farr reported that staff recommends approval of Part II: Design Details for new construction at 701, 702, and 703 Howard Street with the following conditions to be submitted for staff approval:

1. The columns and garage doors are revised to be wood composite or wood;
2. The window muntins do not exceed 7/8 inches;
3. The deck finish is specified;
4. Ensure the curb cut width does not exceed 20 feet;
5. Ensure the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height;

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Puljung stated that they will change the columns on the garage to be composite material. The window muntins will not exceed 7/8 inches. They will use a solid stain color on the deck. They received a revision from the civil engineer regarding the curb cut. They will ensure that the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height.

Mr. Puljung said they had an error in the property addresses. The correct addresses are **701, 703 and 705 Howard Street**.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) thanked the petitioner for responding to

the Review Board's comments at the last meeting. The traditional design is more successful. Due to there not being a large crowd present at today's meeting, he does not believe that many neighbors are in objection to this petition. Mr. Carey said the HSF supports the revised design.

Mr. Carey had two questions that he wanted the petitioner to answer. He is familiar with the renderings and general design, but he has not gotten into the details, but the HSF's Architecture Review Committee has done so and wanted him to ask some questions about the garage detail. It seems that the width of the bump-out above the garage disagrees with the width and proportion of the garage door. Also, the colors and renderings appear to be in conflict with the colors in the specifications.

Mr. Puljung in response to the public comments, explained that it is accurate that the bay above the garage door is more narrow than the actual garage door. This is a direct relationship to how the floor plans are used. They are not able to create a bay; so there is a strong centerline that aligns vertically. The colors on the renderings do differ. They have provided samples of the colors.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was appreciative of the efforts made by the petitioner and his willingness to meet all of staff's recommendations.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part II: Design Details for new construction at 701, 703, and 705 Howard Street with the following conditions to be submitted for staff approval:

1. The columns and garage doors are revised to be wood composite or wood;
2. The window muntins do not exceed 7/8 inches;
3. The deck finish is specified;
4. Ensure the curb cut width does not exceed 20 feet;
5. Ensure the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height;
6. Add fence and gate details to the final drawings;

Because otherwise the project meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Scott Cook

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

☞ [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

☞ [Revised Signs.pdf](#)

☞ [Original Submittal Package.pdf](#)

Ms. Jennifer Deacon and Mr. Scott Cook recused themselves from participating in this petition. They are employees of LS3P who is contracted with the owner on this project.

Ms. Sharon O'Neill was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for eleven signs at 15 East Liberty Street. These signs are part of a rebranding project and will replace the existing signage. Signs A, B, C1, C2, D1, D2, E, and J will replace existing signs. Signs F, H, and K will be new signs for two new restaurants.

Ms. Farr reported that staff recommends approval of the application for signage at 15 East Liberty with the following conditions to be approved by staff:

1. Provide the frontage of each restaurant to verify the signs meet the size standards;
2. Revise Sign F's location and height to a minimum of 10 feet of clearance

Because otherwise the signs meet the standards and are visually compatible.

Ms. Farr additionally reported that staff recommends approval to the ZBA for variances from the sign standards for signs A and B to allow for larger principal use signage, because the variance criteria are met.

Ms. Farr further reported that staff recommends denial to the ZBA for variances to the sign standards for signs C1, C2, D1, D2, and E. because the variance criteria are not met.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. O'Neill said that her son, who owns the company, believed that the canopy signs are allowed. They are replacing the signs that are presently there. The new signs will be the same size and will be backlit.

Ms. O'Neill said the signs that are in the medallion in the middle will be halo lit and just the actual letters will be lite. The signs in the back will not be lite. She asked if there was a problem with the restaurant sign.

Ms. Farr answered that the staff needed to know the size of the restaurant sign so they could ensure that it is the right size. One of the signs need to be changed to the correct location.

Ms. O'Neill explained that one sign where the canopy is located will be removed. The new sign will be placed on the façade just above the door. There is a separate entrance into the restaurant and a lounge and a meeting room are here also. A sign will be placed here to let the customers know that the lounge and meeting room are here. The menu board is near the front door, but it will not be lit.

Ms. O'Neill asked what do they need to do in order for the canopy sign to be approved.

Ms. Farr explained that this is at the discretion of the Board. However, if the petitioner reduces the overall signage, they may be able to have some signage there.

Mr. Merriman asked Ms. O'Neill if someone from the company met with staff since the last meeting.

Ms. O'Neill answered that her son met with staff and went over the entire project as the work is scheduled to be done the first two weeks in July. Her son is under the impression that he has revised the signs for the canopy and that they are acceptable because of the way they were lit. The sign will not intrude; it is a classic-looking sign.

Mr. Merriman explained to Ms. O'Neill that the reason he asked her the question is because the Sign Ordinance is basically direct.

Ms. O'Neill said her son will be in Savannah on June 22, 2017 for a variance meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was in agreement with staff recommendations which includes the recommendation for denial to ZBA for variances to the sign standards for signs C1, C2, D1, D2, and E because the variance criteria are not met.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the application for signage at 15 East Liberty with the following conditions to be approved by staff:

1. Provide the frontage of each restaurant to verify the signs meet the size standards;
2. Revise Sign F's location and height to a minimum of 10 feet of clearance;

Because otherwise the signs meet the standards and are visually compatible.

Recommend approval to the ZBA for variances from the sign standards for signs A and B to allow for larger principal use signage, because the variance criteria are met.

Recommend denial to the ZBA for variances to the sign standards for signs C1, C2, D1, D2, and E, because the variance criteria are not met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Abstain
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Abstain
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[29. Petition of Carlstedt's LLC | 17-002813-COA | 515 Barnard Street | Signs and Color Change](#)

📎 [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Package.pdf](#)

Ms. Audrey Wagner was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Farr gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for signs and color changes. Three panels currently painted green on the north façade will be painted to match the main color of the building. The petitioner is also requesting variances from the sign standards to allow for larger signage and more principal use signage. Four sign panels approximately 128 square feet each are proposed on the east façade. They will feature illustrations of flowers. These panels were determined by the zoning administrator to be signage, not murals, due to the nature of the business, which is a florist.

Ms. Farr reported that staff recommends to continue the petition for signage and color changes at 515 Barnard Street at the request of the petitioner to address the following:

1. Size of all signage;
2. Number of principal use signs.

Ms. Farr additionally reported that staff recommends denial to the ZBA for variances from the sign standards to allow for larger signage and more principal use signs, because the variances criteria are not met.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Wagner said her concern is with the panels being determined to be signage, not murals, due to the nature of the business. She said they do sell flowers, but she argues that flowers are artwork. The portion of the building where the flowers will be located are in window areas that have been removed and will be painted on the brick. These will be temporary pieces. Ms. Wagner stated that, therefore, she looks to the Board for the best way to move forward.

Mr. Merriman explained to Ms. Wagner that the best way for her to move forward is to ask for a continuance. The zoning administrator made a determination that the panels are signage, and not murals. Therefore, the Board operates within the confines that the panels are signage. He explained that Ms. Wagner can make an application to go to the Zoning Board of Appeals [ZBA] and present her case to them. Mr. Merriman stated to Ms. Wagner that in the meantime, she can meet with staff for further direction.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) said this is tricky. He said this is a floral shop and not a retail shop. It will probably be suitable to discuss this further.

Ms. Wagner, in response to public comments, stated that their artist has no problem with doing the painting. They also want to get flowers honoring Savannah with native plants. She said that hydrangeas do not grow around here. Ms. Wagner asked for a continuance.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was in agreement with the staff recommendations which includes denial to the ZBA for variances from the sign standards to allow for larger signage and more principal use signs, because the variances criteria are not met.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for signage and color changes at 515 Barnard Street at the request of the petitioner to address the following:

1. Size of all signage;
2. Number of principal use signs.

Recommend Denial to the ZBA for variances from the sign standards to allow for larger signage and more principal use signs, because the variance criteria are not met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Debra Caldwell

Second: Jennifer Deacon

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[30. Petition of Michael Savidge | 17-002861-COA | 510 East Oglethorpe Avenue | New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

[📎 Drawings.pdf](#)

[📎 Geene Ward.pdf](#)

[📎 Applicant Photos.pdf](#)

[📎 Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)

[📎 Staff Photos.pdf](#)

[📎 Staff Recommendation .pdf](#)

[📎 Aerial Map.pdf](#)

[📎 Comment from Owner.pdf](#)

Mr. Michael Savidge was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for Part 1: Height and Mass for new construction of a carriage house at 510 East Oglethorpe Avenue. The two-story, two-bay carriage house will orient north towards East York Lane. The petitioner is also requesting a variance from the carriage house roof standard which requires that roofs be side gable, hip with parapet, flat or shed hidden by a parapet.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of Part 1: Height and Mass for new construction of a carriage house at 510 East Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted with Part 2:

1. Revise the proposed front-facing gable roof to meet the carriage house roof standard;
2. Remove the round window on the lane façade or replace with another window to match the proportions of the other two windows at that façade;
3. Replace the smaller window on the east elevation with an opening that matches the proportions of the other openings;
4. Provide additional information regarding the garage apron. Ensure that the proposed slope occurs inside the garage and not on the public right-of-way (lane).

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Ms. Smith reported that staff additionally recommends denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard in the Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of Savannah Zoning Ordinance which states:

Roofs shall be side gable, hip with parapet, flat or shed hidden by a parapet.

Because the proposed front facing gable is not visually compatible or consistent with contributing carriage house roof types.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Savidge came forward and introduced his wife and neighbors who were accompanying him at today's meeting. He stated that his mass model is large, but believed the Board could see the three homes. He bought his home, 510 East Oglethorpe Avenue, in 2010 which was basically a shell. Mr. Savidge said he worked with the MPC and the Historic Savannah Foundation, of which he is a member, to restore the house. Three houses are here and they were somewhat identical at one time. But, now one has been turned into a duplex, the other is a single family home. Mr. Savidge said having met the majority of the requirements for an addition, he is asking for some help with the roof orientation and the windows. They want the gable end to face north to allow water to run off and be collected on his property instead of running off to the lane. He said that there are threshold entrances to the Wall's Barbeque which are two inches of water running into the lane. A drainage problem has been here for quite some time.

Mr. Savidge said maybe the Board could grant them some relief. When serving is done on the patio any small amount of rain causes problems. The City has graded the lane several times, but basically it just makes more mud. If the Board can help him, he wants to capture the water on each side with plantings. Therefore, he is hopeful that the Board will support the variance. His other concerns are the round window. He included the round window because there are round windows in each of the existing homes. Consequently, all three of the homes have the round windows under the staircase, which is now a powder room. He said he included this over the bathroom area in the apartment. He will be happy to make it a square window, but it will have to be a half window because otherwise it would be over the toilet. The other window on the side is a half window and is over the kitchen sink. This is the same existing size and style of windows that are in the homes now.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Teresa West stated that they are in the lane behind the 510 property. Her father bought the property in the 1950s. Her concern is the drainage. The lane floods. As a young child growing up in the 1960s and 1970s, they never had problems in the lane when it rained. During these years, they got much more rain than what they are getting now. Ms. West said at the corner of York Lane and Price Street a sewage system was installed. When this was done, the flooding occurred. The lane is dirt. The City of Savannah on three occasions has drained and graded the area. She said there is not a lot of water in front of Wall's Barbeque when it rains, but Mr. Savidge's property has a pool of water every time it rains. Ms. McWaters has flooding all the time. They have had problems with construction and if the roof is pitched this will create more flooding problems for them as the run-off will be directed towards the lane.

Mr. Robert Bretol resides at 502 East Oglethorpe Avenue. He is familiar with the flooding that occurs here. The variance makes sense. The City comes in the area occasionally and deals with the flooding. Mr. Bretol urged the Board to approve the variance.

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] stated they agree with staff on the recommendation for changing the windows. The windows should also be a little more centered over the openings above. Presently, it seems a little asymmetrical. Once the three windows are worked out, it should be proportional and follow the guidelines. Is there a design detail on the garage doors? Mr. Carey said with respect to the roofline, he agrees with staff. He hears what the petitioner said, but it appears to him that there is a solution that needs to be figured out. They do not want to compound the problem. Maybe a French drain would help. But, just where the water is routed might cover the problem and not exacerbate it. This would require more studying, but he believes this can be solved.

Mr. Savidge, in response to public comments, stated that they are trying to solve the problem with the roofline. If the water runs off and is collected in the gutter a problem would more than likely still exist. He said he is trying to take the water off the façade and put it into a garden area that he has already constructed. This garden area has mulch, rocks, etc. that will settle the water so that it will not run out into the lane. He is trying to solve the problem with his neighbors. The way the roof is pitched now causes the water to run-off into the lane. This is why they turned the roof as is so the water would be

taken off side-ways and run-off into the gardens. This is the help he is seeking. The bathroom is between two bedrooms.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed that there are other ways that the rainwater could possibly run-off the roof without getting a variance. They discussed the windows. The Board was in agreement with the staff recommendation and the suggestion of the HSF. They urged the petitioner to continue working with staff.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part 1: Height and Mass for new construction of a carriage house at 510 East Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted with Part 2:

1. Revise the proposed front-facing gable roof to meet the carriage house roof standard;
2. Remove the round window on the lane façade or replace with another window to match the proportions of the other two windows at that façade;
3. Replace the smaller window on the east elevation with an opening that matches the proportions of the other openings;
4. Provide additional information regarding the garage apron. Ensure that the proposed slope occurs inside the garage and not on the public right-of-way (lane).

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Recommends denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard in the Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of Savannah Zoning Ordinance which states:

"Roofs shall be side gable, hip with parapet, flat or shed hidden by a parapet."

Because the proposed front facing gable is not visually compatible with contributing carriage house roof types, and the variance criteria have not been met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

- ④ [17-002904-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- ④ [Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf](#)
- ④ [Submittal Packet- Model Photographs.pdf](#)
- ④ [Submittal Packet- Application.pdf](#)
- ④ [Submittal Packet- Project Description.pdf](#)
- ④ [Aerial.pdf](#)
- ④ [Franklin Ward.pdf](#)
- ④ [Liberty Ward.pdf](#)
- ④ [Middle Oglethorpe Ward.pdf](#)
- ④ [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
- ④ [Historical Photographs.pdf](#)

Mr. John Deering was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petition is requesting approval of a new six story hotel at 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. The building features a symmetrical front façade facing MLK with two floors of underground parking accessed from Zubley Street. The footprint is approximately 35,000 square feet and the building is U-shaped above the ground floor, with the open area facing Zubley Street. Architecturally, the building is evocative of Art Deco style.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends to continue the petition in order for the petitioner to address the following:

1. Substantially reduce the overall height, including the height of the ground and sixth floor.
2. Provide elevations of the east and west facades within the “U”.
3. Provide true transparent voids at the south corner of the building on the sixth floor, on the western bays of the south façade, and on the west façade.
4. Restudy the proportions of the sixth floor which feature a large amount of blank space above the windows.
5. Add voids to the south façade, at the eastern two bays.
6. Restudy the rhythm of the window and door openings which feature balconies on the south façade.
7. Incorporate a regular rhythm of storefronts on the ground floor of the north façade.
8. Reduce the height and simplify the parapet shapes on the north and south elevations.
9. Revise the top floor setback to be symmetrical.
10. Add additional visual expression and differentiation to the top story on the west, south and north facades.
11. Restudy the location, configuration, and number of access points to the vehicle drop off area.
12. Select an additional massing standard to meet. The massing standards for recess and roofline variation are not met.
13. Provide additional roofline variation on the north and south elevations which feature more than 120 linear feet of continuous height.
14. Contain the mechanical access structure within the additional story.
15. Increase the percentage of limestone on the north, south and west facades to 30% to meet the standard.
16. Revise the bay widths to be greater than 15 feet wide and less than 20 feet wide.
17. Increase the number of entrances on the north and south facades to at least five each to meet the standard.
18. Increase the amount of glazing on the south façade to 35% to meet the standard.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Deering said he will go over staff recommendations to get feedback from the Board. He said regarding [1] Their parapet is almost in line with the neighbors. The remaining building is only about 15 feet. The Scarborough House is 217 feet a way. They believe that if there is anywhere in Savannah that can handle this tall building then this is it ; [2] They have provided some of the elevations of the "U" interior building; [3] They will study this. An elevator shaft is actually on the south façade. Glass is in the opening and they can look at putting other voids in the opening. Guests room are here and it will be problematic to put voids here; [4] The character of the building is tall and he believes some variation is needed in the parapet; [5] They can study this; [6] They can restudy the rhythm of the windows and doors. This is more of a design detail situation; [7] This is a difficult site. The north façade will be highly visible when driving down Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard. The eastern façade is visible; [8] They have four fronts on this building and trying to find a place for a back-of-house operation for a hotel has many challenges. In looking at this, they need a place to have a kitchen, etc. They do not want to use Ann Street as a complete rear elevation. They think of this as a front, the south side as a full front, and the north side as a full front; [9] This is a five foot setback, a 7 foot setback, and a 16 foot setback. He believes that in viewing the hotel down Broughton Street, you will not really see that much of the building. But, coming from the north or the south on Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard, you will see the tower element one side or the other to a certain degree. If they reduce to create equal setbacks on each side they will lose hotel rooms in this area and will not have as much rooftop terrace area on the southern side of the property. This is a difficult situation; [10] They will look at changing the sixth floor design; [11] They will look at changing the sixth floor design; [12] They looked at the massing standards. This is a large building and a large project. When looking at other large projects within the district, all the projects look the same and supports the same standard. They wanted to put in some variation along the Ann Street side of the building. Therefore, they selected the recess standard, and on Orange Street side of the building, they selected the standard incorporating this. Along the south elevation, they selected the recess standard. They blended the standards to try to come up with something that would be a little different than the typical 12 foot wide recess; [13] They will look at the roofline variation standards; [14] They will look at the access to the green roof; [15] They will increase the limestone, but he is not sure whether this is the right solution as Orange Street is not a very active street. Also there is no retail on the north façade; [16] They will look at this; [17] They are only required to have a window on the ground floor on the north façade. But he does not know if putting entrances on this side of the façade would make any difference; and [18] They will look at this.

Ms. Caldwell stated that she tried to keep up with the petitioner's responses, but the list is very long. She asked Mr. Deering to tell the Board which recommendations he agrees with and which ones he will restudy/consider.

Mr. Deering said he is willing to consider all of the recommendations, but he is looking for feedback from Board.

Mr. Merriman, for clarification, explained that he believes the petitioner is willing to ask for a continuance, but is seeking feedback on what to come back with.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) stated the nature of the intersection at Broughton and Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard warrants the taller building. In fact, the way the building works if they were to make it shorter would lose what is trying to be achieved here. They would like to see what they consider the main primary façade be carried throughout which is the Art Deco design and maintain a strong vertical element around all four sides. They agree with staff and he believes that the petitioner has agreed that the sixth floor openings should be elongated and open up the solids and the garage. Mr. Carey said they are okay with the setbacks and parapets. He said they are also okay with the ground floor height and entrance, but it could be a little lower as staff recommended. The HSF is okay with the Zubley Street side being used for a couple reasons because it is their respect for Yamacraw Village. He believes they need to bear in mind that Yamacraw is prime real estate; Ann Street side needs to be good. The pool should not be on the north side of the building. He does not believe that the sixth floor should be changed so much that it deviates from the intention of the design of the building.

Mr. Tom Holloway said he has concerns about the building rhythm and relationship to the historic context of Savannah. He believes the Art Deco style is great for the building. His main concern is not only how residents will experience the building, but how visitors will experience it. He does not have an issue with the additional story, but has an issue with the primary entrance as it should be setback from the street. Mr. Holloway asked that they look at some way to break up the façade and address the pedestrian scale.

Mr. Deering, in response to the public comments, thanked the HSF and Mr. Holloway for their comments.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board's discussion centered around staff recommendations which included the following:

1. Substantially reduce the overall height, including the height of the ground and sixth floor.
2. Provide elevations of the east and west facades within the "U".
3. Provide true transparent voids at the south corner of the building on the sixth floor, on the western bays of the south façade, and on the west façade.
4. Restudy the proportions of the sixth floor which feature a large amount of blank space above the windows.
5. Add voids to the south façade, at the eastern two bays.
6. Restudy the rhythm of the window and door openings which feature balconies on the south façade.
7. Incorporate a regular rhythm of storefronts on the ground floor of the north façade.
8. Reduce the height and simplify the parapet shapes on the north and south elevations.
9. Revise the top floor setback to be symmetrical.
10. Add additional visual expression and differentiation to the top story on the west, south and north facades.
11. Restudy the location, configuration, and number of access points to the vehicle drop off area.
12. Select an additional massing standard to meet. The massing standards for recess and roofline variation are not met.
13. Provide additional roofline variation on the north and south elevations which feature more than 120 linear feet of continuous height.
14. Contain the mechanical access structure within the additional story.
15. Increase the percentage of limestone on the north, south and west facades to 30% to meet the standard.
16. Revise the bay widths to be greater than 15 feet wide and less than 20 feet wide.
17. Increase the number of entrances on the north and south facades to at least five each to meet the standard.
18. Increase the amount of glazing on the south façade to 35% to meet the standard.

The Board additionally discussed the sixth story, the green roof and the access to it. The green roof will affect any green roof going forward. When a petitioner goes through the process to get a green roof and uses it to get a bonus story, they must go through a process with the City. They discussed minimizing the access to the roof. At the MLK side, there is a large vertical piece and it was not clear what is the program there. It appears that where the mechanical units are being proposed is where the elevator access is located. Ms. Deacon said she believes that access to the roof needs to be minimized. If someone plans to use the roof as an amenity for guests, then they would want to have at least two stairs and an elevator as they would need to meet egress requirements.

Ms. Harris read the standards pertaining to the mechanical and access structures.

Mr. Deering asked for a continuance.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for Part I Height and Mass at the request of the petitioner.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

[32. Petition of Hansen Architecture | 17-002907-COA | 303-309 Alice Street | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass](#)

- [☞ Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- [☞ Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
- [☞ Description.pdf](#)
- [☞ Submittal Package.pdf](#)
- [☞ Aerial Image.pdf](#)
- [☞ Berrien Ward.pdf](#)
- [☞ Supplemental Petitioner Information.pdf](#)
- [☞ Facade Options.pdf](#)

Mr. Eric Puljung was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for new construction, Part I: Height and Mass, for four carriage houses at 303, 305, 307, and 309 Alice Street. The carriage house will be two stories tall with flat parapet roofs. They will face West Gaston Street and be connected with two pedestrian pass throughs.

Ms. Farr reported that staff recommends approval of Part I: Height and Mass for carriage houses at 303, 305, 307, and 309 Alice Street with the following conditions to be brought back with Part II: Design Details:

1. The width of the eastern end carriage house is reduced so all the carriage houses are the same width;
2. A vertical element is added to differentiate between carriage houses;
3. The insets are replaced with windows;
4. The sloped apron is not erected on the public right of way;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Puljung thanked the Board for reviewing their application for height and mass for the carriage houses. He said he would address the staff recommendations. Regarding the sloped apron for the public right-of-way, they have a site plan update from the civil engineer showing that they do not exceed 20 feet. They have had a conversation about the inset window replacement and the vertical element pattern. Mr. Puljung explained that they started out by increasing the vertical element and simultaneously addressed the eastern most units as it was a little wider than the others from the physical foot print. They added downspouts. They want pedestrian walkways in this area. They want to study the option of how they can change this on the back. One option that he looked at would require a variance because they would still have more than two window widths spacing between the windows. But, it is a single egress window over each garage door. But, they want to avoid this.

They are introducing four windows which he believes is a more successful way of meeting the ordinance requirements and not changing the floor plan works well for the interior of the carriage house. Mr. Pujung said, pointing to an area, that they have a wall almost directly centered for each of the units. Therefore, they must be careful how they balance the openings for each unit. From the original submittal, in regards to the eastern most carriage house, they have reconfigured the vertical division between the overhead doors would work for the other carriage houses.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] said their comments were in sync with staff. He believes the petitioner has addressed the concerns either from clarification or through future suggestions. If he understood what the petitioner said about using downspouts to provide vertical element between the units, there is an example on a row house on East Liberty Street that has a carriage house on East Perry Street. Mr. Carey said he believes they used the downspouts in a similar way. The HSF thought about if there was a little more detailing with the masonry, there could be some other way to do so between the units; maybe use pilasters or some other differentiation. Their Architectural Review Committee stated that rather than worrying about each one, maybe look at it as two separate units and probably put one vertical element in the middle.

Mr. Pujung, in response to public comments, thanked the HSF for its comments. In Design Details, they will consider how they can articulate these buildings more vertically. However, he believes the idea of stucco finish is the idea of stucco over masonry. Without heavily articulating, they will find the vertical element in the buildings. Therefore, he believes the pedestrian opening is the best cue.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The petitioner presented several options to address staff concerns on the West Gaston Street façade. The favored option was one that incorporated two pairs of double windows on each carriage house façade. The petitioner also proposed altering the spacing of the garage doors on the eastern carriage house while maintaining its width, which the Board found visually compatible.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part I: Height and Mass for carriage houses at 303, 305, 307, and 309 Alice Street with following conditions to be brought back with Part II: Design Details:

1. A vertical element is added to differentiate between carriage houses;
2. The sloped apron is not erected on the public right of way;
3. The design of the West Gaston Street façade incorporates the revised proposal presented at the meeting, which includes paired windows and altered garage door spacing;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye

33. Petition of LS3P Associates Architects | 17-002908-COA | 200 West Harris Street | Addition

📎 [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet - Photos and Drawings.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet - Application and Specs.pdf](#)

Ms. Jennifer Deacon and Mr. Scott Cook recused themselves from participating in this petition. They are employees of LS3P.

Ms. Jenny Mizejeski was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for an addition to the property located at 200 West Harris Street. The existing rear porch will also be modified as a part of the 150 square foot addition, 2-story rear addition project. The existing 2-story rear building projection will be elongated and the entire roof structure removed to accommodate the addition. The existing staircase to the porch will be removed, framing and decking infilled, and an additional landing and stair will be constructed without extending the existing porch roof.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval for an addition to the property located at 200 West Harris Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Add another window opening on the east façade of the addition.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Mizejeski thanked the staff for their comments. The house is not historic. The owner has found that some additions are needed for their existing home. They have limited the size and foot print of the addition. The owners are seeking extra storage. The window on the Barnard Street side is being requested to be eliminated to increase the functionality of the addition. They want to proceed with the elevation as submitted. Ms. Mizejeski said they have come up with an additional thought and want to review that with the Board. It is not their preference, but as they have previously discussed the installation of closed shutters at the location with staff and if the Board feels the spacing as indicated on the elevations, they want to go with the elevations as submitted. However, if the Board feels that the spacing is not appropriate, they would like to further work with staff on a compromise.

Ms. Mizejeski said they understand that a warranty deed stated that the beehive Foundation has a covenant on the land, but they have a letter addressed by the client that states at the death of Mr. Lane that the covenant is ended. She asked Mr. Argentines to please clarify the parking easement that is associated with the rear of the structure.

Ms. Caldwell asked Ms. Mizejeski what the parking easement had to do with this.

Ms. Mizejeski explained that it is her understanding is that the adjacent owner would like to provide some feedback. Therefore, this is why she asked for the information to be made known to the Board. The easement that they are aware of runs along the brick wall and at the parking on the rear. It runs to their garden area and the brick fence. They understand that anything that comes to the building has been terminated.

Mr. Merriman stated that the Board is aware that this is relevant to the project, but as far as the Board's decision, it has no bearings.

Ms. Michalak said the petitioner just wanted to make it known that although the Beehive Foundation had an easement, they no longer have it according to the letter. It is only given to the Board as information. This is just the same as sometimes the HSF makes it known that they have an easement on property.

Mr. Stephens asked the petitioner that as a compromise, are they requesting to use operable shutters?

Ms. Mizejeski explained that they want to see that if the spacing requirement is not met, they are requesting full closed shutters that preserve the functionality of the interior wall.

Mr. Stephens asked if they were requesting the shutters instead of a real window.

Ms. Mizejeski answered yes.

Mr. Merriman asked staff if the petitioner would be able to do this.

Ms. Michalak answered that it would have to look like a real window. This can be done only if the Board believes it is visually compatible in certain situations. It must have all of the hardware.

Ms. Caldwell asked if staff is in agreement that it would be close to a real window.

Ms. Michalak answered that the preference is for a real window to be there.

Mizejeski stated that a window is at the end of the pantry. Now, they have added a window on the rear of the façade. They believe that the window on the rear would be lovely because of the garden.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) stated this is not a contributing building, but reconstruction was done to the building in 1993. He is aware that a lot of details were spared by Mr. Lane during construction. He believes that the new addition should follow that same line of discipline and it should be favorable. Therefore, this is why the HSF advocates for a true window to be used on the addition. The window will be on the visible side of the street and they are already removing one portion and making a larger addition. The symmetry is not here and it does not meet the guidelines. Mr. Carey said he appreciates the gesture towards a compromise, but he does not see a need for a compromise as what is needed is to follow the guidelines which are straight forward. The HSF agrees with staff.

Mr. Carey said a nonconforming fence is here now and he is curious about the future of that fence. There was an opaque wooden fence here for a long time. He is also curious about what happened to this fence and what are the plans to replace that fence.

Mr. Gary Arthur of the Beehive Foundation said they built the house in 1992-1993. The design anchors the corner. A lot of care and details went into building this house. Their office is a 19 Century brick building next door. They look into the garden. The covenant that the Beehive had governed the exterior details of the building. The deed expired at Mr. Lane's death. They have an easement also as was brought up. They own the three feet strip that is next to their brick building and they need access to this. However, this is a separate issue that is still in force. Mr. Arthur said they agree with staff that the addition needs a true working window. They want confirmation that they are going to match the existing material and profile. They want to ensure that petitioner will not use the AZEK for anything else.

Ms. Mizejeski said the materials used will be matched in-kind. They will match the existing cornice, siding, stucco and fence rail. They intend to match all existing detailing. She explained that what they really need to do on some of the existing porch rails is something they might need to address as it comes up. The decking is only meant for the porch and the stairs. They want to work with staff further about the shutters.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed the shutters. They believe that a real window is appropriate here. They agreed with staff recommendation.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for an addition to the property located at 200 West Harris Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Add another window opening on the east façade of the addition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Debra Caldwell

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Abstain
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Abstain
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

[34. Petition of Commonwealth Construction | 16-003480-COA | 612 Drayton Street | 12-Month Extension](#)

[☞ Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

[☞ Request to Extend HDRB approval.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve a 12-month extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) issued on July 13, 2016 for the alterations to the rear addition of 612 Drayton Street, with the previous conditions to be met, and for the COA to expire on July 13, 2018.

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion: Mic Matson

Second: Kellie Fletcher

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

[35. Petition of Lora McGrath | 17-002822-COA | 116 West Harris Street | Staff Approved - Roof Repair](#)

[☞ COA - 116 West Harris Street 17-002822-COA.pdf](#)

[☞ Roof Specification.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[36. Amended Petition of Maria Whack for Palmetto State Sign Installation | 17-002912-COA | 301 West Broughton](#)

Street | Staff Approved - Sign Face Change

- 📎 [COA - 301 W. Broughton Street 17-002912-COA.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Submittal Packet - 301 W. Broughton Street 17-002912-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

37. Petition of Barry Moore for Zeno Moore Construction | 17-002883-COA | 201 East River Street | Staff Approved - Replace Deteriorated Bridge

- 📎 [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)
- 📎 [COA - 201 East River Street 17-002883-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

38. Petition of Criss Strain for Coastal Canvas Products. LLC | 17-002884-COA | 320 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Sign Face Change

- 📎 [COA - 320 West Broughton Street 17-002884-COA.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Submittal Packet - 320 West Broughton Street 17-002884-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

39. Petition of David "Luke" Gabelman | 17-002885-COA | 518-520 Blair Street | Staff Approved - Flower Bed Planter

- 📎 [COA - 518-520 Blair Street 17-002885-COA.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Staff Photo.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

40. Petition of Lori Judge for Judge Realty | 17-002911-COA | 201 East Charlton Street | Staff Approved - Color Change

- 📎 [COA - 201 East Charlton Street 17-002911-COA.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Submittal Packet - 201 East Charlton Street 17-002911-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

41. Petition of Abigail Powell for Ellsworth Hallett Home Professionals | 17-002929-COA | 415 Whitaker Street | Staff Approved - Alterations

- 📎 [COA - 415 Whitaker Street 17-002929-COA.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Submittal Packet - Elevations_arch 415 Whitaker Street 17-002929-COA.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Submittal Packet - Exterior_Lighting_Schedule 415 Whitaker Street 17-002929-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

42. Petition of Matthew S. Hallett for Ellsworth Hallett Home Professionals | 17-002932-COA | 515 East Perry Street | Staff Approved - Louvered Shutters

- 📎 [COA - 515 East Perry Street 17-002932-COA.pdf](#)
- 📎 [shutter spec.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

43. Petition of Matthew S. Hallett for Ellsworth Hallett Home Professionals | 17-002938-COA | 141 Lincoln Street |

Staff Approved - Louvered Wood Shutters

☞ [COA - 141 Lincoln Street 17-002938-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Submittal Packet - 141 Lincoln Street 17-002938-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

44. Petition of Matthew S. Hallett for Ellsworth Hallett Home Professionals | 17-003017-COA | 502 East McDonough Street | Staff Approved - Pedestrian Gate

☞ [COA - 502 East McDonough 17-003017-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Application and Submittal Packet - 502 East McDonough Street 17-003017-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

45. Petition of Hansen Architects, P.C. | 17-003029-COA | 120 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Color Changes

☞ [COA - 120 Bull Street 17-003029-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Submittal Packet - 120 Bull Street 17-003029-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

46. Petition of Michael Franck | 17-003038-COA | 19 West Perry Street | Staff Approved - Color Change

☞ [COA - 19 West Perry Street 17-003038-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Submittal Packet - 19 West Perry Street 17-003038-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

47. Petition of Donnie Rushing for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 17-003058-COA | 205 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Awnings

☞ [COA - 205 West Broughton Street 17-003058-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Submittal Packet - 205 West Broughton Street 17-003058-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

48. Amended Petition of William S. and Connie F. Ray | 17-003065-COA | 128 habersham Street | Staff Approved - Color Changes

☞ [COA - 128 Habersham Street 17-003065-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Submittal Packet - 128 Habersham Street 17-003065-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

49. Petition of Harley Krinsky for Congress Street Social Club | 17-003066-COA | 411 West Congress Street | Staff Approved - Fence Replacement

☞ [COA - 411 West Congress Street 17-003066-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Submittal Packet - 411 West Congress Street 17-003066-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

50. Petition of Marysue McCarthy | 17-003067-COA | 230 Houston Street | Staff Approved - Security Panels

☞ [COA - 230 Houston Street 17-003067-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Submittal Packet - 230 Houston Street 17-003067-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[51. Petition of T. Jerry Lominack for Lominack Kolman Smith Architects, LLP | 17-003118-COA | 660 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Color Change and Kitchen Vent](#)

☞ [COA - 660 East Broughton Street 17-003118-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Submittal Packet - 660 East Broughton Street 17-003118-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[52. Petition of Sam Carroll for Carroll Construction | 17-003154-COA | 113 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Staff Approved - Color Change and In-Kind Work Front and Back Stairs](#)

☞ [COA - 113 East Oglethorpe Avenue 17-003154-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Submittal Packet - 113 East Oglethorpe Avenue 17-003154-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[53. Amended Petition of Rebecca Smith for Lominack Kolman Smith Architects | 17-003195-COA | 2 West Bay Street | Staff Approved - Stairs](#)

☞ [COA - 2 West Bay Street 17-003195-COA.pdf](#)

☞ [Submittal Packet - 2 West Bay Street 17-003195-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

[54. Report on Work Performed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the June 14, 2017 HDBR Meeting](#)

☞ [6-14-17 HDBR Report on Work Without a COA.pdf](#)

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

[55. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting - Thursday, June 15, 2017 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC 110 East State Street](#)

[56. Next Pre-Meeting - Wednesday, July 12, 2017 at 12:00 p.m. in the Jerry Surrency Room, MPC, 112 East State Street](#)

[57. Next Regular Meeting - Wednesday, July 12, 2017 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 East State Street](#)

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

[58. Update on GAPC Training- Alyson Smith](#)

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the update on the GAPC Training on May 18-20, 2017 held in Madison, GA. The GAPC is a statewide non-profit organization dedicated to providing support to local historic preservation commissions. Its purpose is to provide a forum to promote communication between preservation commissions and help coordinate their efforts throughout the state. For more information, please visit their website: <http://www.georgiahpcs.org/>

In addition to fulfilling the mission of the GAPC, its board members meet quarterly in Macon, GA (phone is okay on occasion), and assist in up to two preservation conferences per year. The board has committees related to outreach, membership, event planning, etc.

-For additional information or questions regarding the position please contact the Board's Chair:
Angela Threadgill (Planning Director for the City of Decatur)
Angela.Threadgill@decaturga.com

-If you are interested in the position, please forward Angela a short letter of interest and a resume.

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) informed the Board that their Preservation and Education Coordinator, Ms. Danielle Meunier, will be leaving the HSF on July 1, 2017 as she has accepted a position with the Georgia Trust in Atlanta, GA as their Preservation Communication Coordinator.

XV. ADJOURNMENT

[59. Adjournment](#)

There being no further business to come before the Board, Mr. Merriman adjourned the meeting at 5:30 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen I. Harris, Director
Urban Planning and Historic Preservation
EIH:mem

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.