



SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT  
BOARD OF REVIEW

---

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room  
November 9, 2016 1:00 P.M.  
Meeting minutes

**NOVEMBER 9, 2016 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING**

**HDRB Members Present:** Justin Gunther, Vice- Chair  
Debra Caldwell  
Jennifer Deacon  
Dr. Betsey Dominguez  
Kellie Fletcher  
Keith Howington  
Becky Lynch  
Andy McGarrity  
Tess Scheer

**HDRB Members Not Present:** Stephen Merriman, Jr., Chair  
Zena McClain, Esq., Parliamentarian

**MPC Staff Present:** Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation  
Leah G. Michalak, Historic Preservation Planner  
Sara Farr, Historic Preservation Planner  
Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner  
Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

**I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME**

1. [Call to Order and Welcome](#)

**Mr. Gunther** called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, ten minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments. The Board will

then go into Board discussion at which time no further testimony is received unless specifically requested by the Chair. Each Board member will be given two minutes twice to provide comments, if they so desire.

## II. SIGN POSTING

## III. CONSENT AGENDA

### 2. [Approval of Consent Agenda November 9, 2016](#)

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the Consent Agenda of November 9, 2016. - PASS

#### **Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington  
Second: Andy McGarrity  
Debra Caldwell - Aye  
Jennifer Deacon - Aye  
Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye  
Kellie Fletcher - Aye  
Justin Gunther - Abstain  
Keith Howington - Aye  
Becky Lynch - Aye  
Andy McGarrity - Aye  
Tess Scheer - Aye

### 3. [Petition of 317 East Broad LLC | 16-005565-COA | 317 East Broad Street | Sign](#)

Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve for two signs on one existing pole for the property located at 317 East Broad Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the sign standards. - PASS

#### **Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington  
Second: Andy McGarrity  
Debra Caldwell - Aye  
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Abstain
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye

4. [Petition of Doug Bean | 16-005628-COA | 641 Indian Street | Signs](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the principal use and supplemental ID signs at 641 Indian Street, because they meet the standards and are visually compatible. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Andy McGarrity

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Aye

Keith Howington - Abstain

Becky Lynch - Aye

Andy McGarrity - Aye

Tess Scheer - Aye

5. [Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 16-005631-COA | 320 Montgomery Street | Signs](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the supplemental identification signage as proposed for 320 Montgomery Street because it is visually compatible and meet the standards. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Andy McGarrity

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Abstain
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye

6. [Petition of LS3P Dawson Architects | 16-005633-COA | 15 East Liberty Street | Amendments to Previous COA](#)

Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for amendments to a previously issued COA for alterations and additions to the property located at 15 East Liberty Street with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and - PASS meets the standards:

- Ensure that no televisions or any other components are added to the cabanas or pergolas, or pool house.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Andy McGarrity

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Abstain
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye

7. [Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 16-005707-COA | 532 Indian Street | Fence](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Staff Photos.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the 6-foot-high metal picket fence with a pedestrian and vehicular gate at 532 Indian Street because the fence is visually compatible and meets the standards. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington  
Second: Andy McGarrity  
Debra Caldwell - Aye  
Jennifer Deacon - Aye  
Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye  
Kellie Fletcher - Aye  
Justin Gunther - Abstain  
Keith Howington - Aye  
Becky Lynch - Abstain  
Andy McGarrity - Aye  
Tess Scheer - Aye

**IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

8. [Adoption of Agenda for November 9, 2016 Meeting](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt the November 9, 2016 Meeting Agenda. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Tess Scheer  
Second: Jennifer Deacon  
Debra Caldwell - Aye  
Jennifer Deacon - Aye  
Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye  
Kellie Fletcher - Aye  
Justin Gunther - Abstain  
Keith Howington - Aye  
Becky Lynch - Aye  
Andy McGarrity - Aye  
Tess Scheer - Aye

**V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

9. [Approve October 12, 2016 Meeting Minutes](#)

Attachment: [10-12-2016 Minutes.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve October 12, 2016 Meeting Minutes. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Dr. Betsy Dominguez

Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Abstain

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Andy McGarrity - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

**VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA**

**VII. CONTINUED AGENDA**

10. [Continue All Items to Next Regular Meeting](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petitions as requested. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Jennifer Deacon

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Abstain

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Andy McGarrity - Aye

Tess Scheer - Aye

11. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | New Construction: Part](#)

II, Design Details

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Jennifer Deacon

Tess Scheer	- Aye
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Abstain
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye

12. [Petition of Gary Sanders | 16-003487-COA | 305 West Wayne Street | New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Jennifer Deacon

Becky Lynch	- Aye
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Abstain
Keith Howington	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye

13. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 16-003492-COA | 607 Drayton Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Jennifer Deacon

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Abstain

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Andy McGarrity - Aye

Tess Scheer - Aye

14. [Petition of King Chau | 16-005167-COA | 8 East Broughton Street | Sign](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition due to an incomplete application. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Jennifer Deacon

Tess Scheer - Aye

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Abstain

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Andy McGarrity - Aye

15. [Petition of Gregory Beck | 16-005197-COA | 409 East Charlton Street | Alterations](#)



**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition due to - PASS an incomplete application.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Jennifer Deacon

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Abstain

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Andy McGarrity - Aye

Tess Scheer - Aye

**VIII. REGULAR AGENDA**

16. [Petition of Barnard Architects | 16-002725-COA | 202 East Gaston Street | Alterations and Additions](#)

Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Photographs.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- historic research.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Previous Renderings, Color, Drawings, Specs.pdf](#)

**Mr. John Clegg** was present on behalf of the petitioner.

**Ms. Leah Michalak** gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for multiple alterations to both the main house and the carriage house at 202 East Gaston Street. This project was heard and approved with conditions by the Board at the October 12, 2016 HDBR meeting; this review only addresses the conditions as all other proposed work was approved at the previous meeting. The conditions were as follows; below each condition is the petitioner's response in italics:

The Board requested that the following conditions be submitted to staff for final review and approval (however, the petitioner included this information for Board review):

1. Do not use elastomeric paint.

*Elastomeric paint has been replaced with regular paint.*

2. The new front façade windows are proposed to have a 2-over-2 lite pattern and the rear façade window is proposed to be 1-over-1; staff requests clarification as to why these lite patterns were chosen by the petitioner.

*The new front façade windows are now shown as 6-over-6 lites - similar to what exists on the side elevation.*

3. If, after installation, the HVAC units are visible from the public right-of-way, submit screening to staff for review and approval.

*The petitioner agreed that if, after installation, the HVAC units are visible from the public right-of-way, then a screen will be provided to obscure view.*

Submit to the Review Board for final review and approval:

1. Redesign all porch and stoops railings to be more compatible or leave all existing railings in place.

*Railings have been given some visual weight and detail. This is a challenging issue: HPD does not want new rails to have much detail – otherwise it would give a false impression.*

2. Redesign the design of the courtyard entrance wall and gate to be more visually compatible with other courtyard entrances.

*The arch top has been removed from the courtyard entrance gate.*

3. Redesign the demising wall to be visually compatible with the rhythm of structures and not alter the spatial relationship of the main house/carriage house relationship. Ensure that the demising wall is not greater than 11 feet high.

*The privacy wall at the bridge has been replaced with a simple metal rail.*

4. Ensure that the new garage door width matches the width of the historic opening; approximately 8 feet wide.

*The new garage door width matches the width of the historic opening; approximately 8 feet wide.*

5. Define and/or clarify whether a “restoration” or a “rehabilitation” is proposed; if a restoration is proposed provide the proposed Period of Significance.

*Rehabilitation: The intent of this project is a rehabilitation (not restoration), per NPS, rehabilitation “acknowledges the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing of changing uses while retaining the property’s historic character.”*

**Ms. Michalak** reported that staff recommends approval for multiple alterations to both the main house and the carriage house at 202 East Gaston Street with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- If, after installation, the roof HVAC units are visible from the public right-of-way, submit screening to staff for review and approval.

**Mr. Gunther** said at the last meeting, staff asked the petitioner to clearly define the period of significance. Has this been done?

**Ms. Michalak** answered that the staff was asking that the petition define and/or clarify whether a rehabilitation or a restoration was being proposed. If a restoration is being proposed, then provide the period of significance. The petitioner has informed staff

that they are doing rehabilitation.

**PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Mr. Clegg** said they met with staff and went through the Board's requests. They agree with staff recommendations.

**Mr. Howington** asked the petitioner if the brick will be painted.

**Mr. Clegg** answered that the brick will be painted and will match the house. They have submitted a sample that has more texture.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF)** said they have a different opinion than SHPO about the railings that are being proposed. HSF believes the railings warrant a little more detail. Perhaps a higher style railing could be use such as at 230-232 Bull Street. He believes the railings at this address were approved by SHPO. They agree with the staff recommendation regarding the HVAC screening.

**Mr. Gunther** invited Mr. Clegg to respond to public comments, but he declined.

**BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board agreed with the HSF regarding the railing details. They believe that a more decorative railing would be better suited for this structure. This is a prominent corner.

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for multiple alterations to both the main house and the carriage house at 202 East Gaston Street with the following conditions submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. If, after installation, the roof HVAC units are visible from the public right-of-way, submit screening details.
2. Restudy the metal railing design.

- PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Tess Scheer

Second: Becky Lynch

Debra Caldwell

- Aye

Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Abstain
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye

17. [Petition of Randolph Kulp | 16-005620-COA | 7 East Jones Street | Carriage House Alterations](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation 16-005620-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Drawings.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Description and Photographs.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Application.pdf](#)

**Mr. Randolph Kulp** was present on behalf of the petition.

**Ms. Harris** gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting alterations to the carriage house and garden wall along the lane as follows:

- Remove the existing T-111 siding and windows in the existing openings on the ground floor of the carriage house;
- Infill the arched opening with double wood panel carriage doors;
- Enlarge the existing eight-foot wide rectangular opening to 12 feet, removing the adjacent window opening, and install wood overhead door and new wood surround with engaged columns;
- Remove an eight-foot wide section of the garden wall and install sliding wood panel door; and
- Replace existing wood gate with new wood door.

**Ms. Harris** explained that 7 East Jones Street and its carriage house were built in 1851 and are contributing resources within the Savannah Historic District. An application was originally submitted as part of a larger rehabilitation project and was approved by the HDBR on October 8, 2008 (H-08-0454-2). Subsequently the ordinance has been revised to incorporate the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

**Ms. Harris** stated that the submittal packet represents the larger project, although the request is only for the alterations to the carriage house and lane wall, which were not completed.

**Ms. Harris** reported that staff recommends:

1. Approval of the request to infill the arched opening with double wood panel carriage doors; remove an eight-foot wide section of the garden wall and install sliding wood panel door; and replace existing wood door with new wood door with the condition that if a sloped apron is needed, that it is not erected on the public right-of-way; because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

2. Denial of the request to enlarge the existing eight-foot wide rectangular opening to 12 feet, removing the adjacent window opening, and install wood overhead door and new wood surround with engaged columns because the proposed alteration does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation or design standards.

**Mr. McGarrity** asked what is the current width of the opening.

**Ms. Harris** answered that the opening is eight feet and is being proposed to be enlarged to twelve feet.

**Mr. Gunther** asked when was the brick wall constructed.

**Ms. Harris** answered that she did not know; it could be original to the building. The bricks are Savannah grey bricks. It looks consistent with the carriage house.

### **PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Mr. Kulp** said he is renovating this house for his family. He realizes that they are only considering modifications to the carriage house, but as a larger scope was originally approved with the visual compatibility guidelines, his understanding that what has changed from then to now is the adoption of the Secretary's Standards. Therefore, it is important that they take a step back and recognize that in order for him to make his case, the project must be considered in its entirety and within the historic context. He purchased the property in January 2008 and spent the next six months working with members of the preservation community. He retained Lominack, Kolman, Smith as the architects for the project and worked with the MPC preservation staff, Ms. Beth Reiter. They studied this property for six months to get an understanding of what was the most appropriate way to take the property back to what it was, which was a single family home in 1851. Mr. Kulp said when he purchased the house it was converted to six apartments; there was no central heat or air. The house had not been modified since WWII. The house was built in 1851.

**Mr. Kulp** said with wanting to modernize this property as much as possible, they looked at what were their options. He said given the fact that they have two eight foot openings, the arched opening is eight feet and the rectangle opening is eight feet. The eight foot opening in the garage will work, and they would have the ability to have two eight foot garages. But, the problem is the carriage house is only 19' - 2" deep. The north façade is visible from the public view and does not sit directly behind the main house. The accommodations that were made with staff and the architect at that time were to take the abandon window and move it and enlarge the opening so that a car could come in at an angle. The common dimensions for a one car garage is 12 feet wide by 20 feet deep. Based on their calculations, if a car was brought in straight through the eight feet opening, you would only have 12 inches either way. Therefore, by doing this, they only gained one space. However, they understand that they cannot use the arched opening and they do not want to try to modify the beautiful arched opening. Therefore, this led them to go to the garden wall and look for an alternative. The primary parking was always to be at the carriage house and the secondary parking would be the garden wall. He has two young children and they have always enjoyed the greenspace.

**Mr. Kulp** said they have some issues with the lane. He showed the Board his neighbor's

property to the south. It has a 20 feet opening and encroaches on the lane by 12 inches. This is an existing condition that they have to deal with. Additionally, a utility pole protrudes 43 inches into the lane. Trash cans are here and protrude 30 inches into the lane. Another impediment further down the lane is a gas meter that extends 36 inches into the lane. Therefore, they have an issue of accessibility. He explained that all the studies he has had done by Thomas and Hutton shows that only a mid-size sports utility vehicle could be used here as the lane is restricted to 21 inches and a turn could not be made into the eight feet opening. He showed the Board a house at 14 East Taylor Street that has two existing openings. This property was renovated in 2008.

**Mr. Kulp** stated that there is a dire need here for off-street parking. At Bull and Jones Streets there are three SCAD buildings and two SCAD restaurants, three of the four corners at Bull and Jones Streets are commercial and the fourth is a parking lot. Mr. Kulp said he is not against tourism nor SCAD. He wanted to remind the Board that in June, 2013 when SCAD approached the City about using Heymans Hall for classroom purposes, one of the issues that surfaced was the old residential parking permits where he could park one block in either direction, became a colorful zone. Now, instead of being able to park in at least four zones, he is able to park anywhere. Mr. Kulp said this might seem wonderful, but he believes that he has lost something. Someone who lives as far away as East Board Street, on Gwinnett Street or Oglethorpe Avenue is able to park in front of his home. This causes him to have to go somewhere else to park. He said he was not asking the Board to solve his parking problem, but allow him to resolve his parking issue.

**Mr. Kulp** said he does not believe the rectangular opening is original. The house has been modified at some point. A piece of wood is here that appears to have been cut. He pointed out that the louver on the left side shows a concrete sill that appears to be smooth, but he does not believe that it is original. The opening also has a concrete sill that is rough and shows a difference in the panel details.

**Mr. Kulp** said in 2008 this was not an issue. Now, they are dealing with the Secretary's Standards, but he has gone through the Standards and unless you are doing a tax credit project, these standards are advisory standards. This Board has the right to disregard the standards if they believe that is the appropriate reasons to do so. He said what he is trying to do is adapt a reuse of a carriage house that it was intended to be. They are only trying to take it back to what it originally was. They are asking for an alteration on a secondary elevation on a carriage house in the lane. Mr. Kulp said he is not asking for variances.

**Mr. Kulp** said in 2008 the entire project was approved. He did not want the Board to look at this as piecemeal. He said he met with staff and they were accommodating. He showed the staff a sketch that Jerry Lominack and he completed in 2008. Mr. Kulp respectfully asked the Board to approve the project as submitted with the condition that he and the architect come back to staff and work on a compatible door that will allow them to have a 12 foot door. They want to build a brick lintel to match the rest of the structure to break up the massing.

**Ms. Deacon** stated that originally when this petition was presented in 2008, the door opening as shown on the original drawings was approved, but was not completed. Did the COA expired before the Certificate of Occupancy was approved?

**Ms. Harris** answered correct.

**Mr. Howington** asked Mr. Kulp if he was opening up the gate to allow for parking space. This will only be eight feet as well. He asked Mr. Kulp wouldn't he be faced with the same problem?

**Mr. Kulp** said the only other option is to take out more of the wall. They want this to be secondary parking. Unfortunately, Bull and Jones is becoming more and more busier. He stated again that he was not asking the Board to resolve the parking problem for him, but to allow him to do so.

### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

None.

### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

**Mr. Gunther** reminded the Board that the parking availability is not the purview of the Review Board, just the design elements.

The Board discussed the existing eight-foot wide rectangular opening, removal of the adjacent window opening, and new wood surround with engaged columns. The arched opening is the character defining feature of the carriage house. They discussed that this was previously approved, but the current ordinance requires that conditions on historic buildings be addressed under the Secretary's of Interior Standards. These guidelines are clear and the staff has reviewed the project. The window needs to remain as presented. The rectangular openings could be made wider.

The Board discussed that the petitioner work with staff to develop a design that does not include removal of the adjacent window opening, and if a sloped apron is needed, that it not be erected on the public right-of-way.

### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition as follows:

1. Infill the arched opening with double wood panel carriage doors;
  2. Remove an eight-foot wide section of the garden wall and install sliding wood panel door;
  3. Replace existing wood door with new wood door;
  4. Enlarge the existing eight-foot wide rectangular and infill with a wood overhead door
- PASS

With the condition that the petitioner work with staff to develop a design that does not include

removing the adjacent window opening, and if a sloped apron is needed, it is not erected on the public right-of-way, because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Becky Lynch

Second: Keith Howington

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Abstain

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Andy McGarrity - Aye

Tess Scheer - Aye

18. [Petition of Hall Smith Office, Inc. | 16-005621-COA | 23 West Gordon Street | Demolition and New Construction: Part I, Carriage House](#)

Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Monterey Ward.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Context Photos.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Drawings.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Mass Model.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Site Photos.pdf](#)

**Mr. Joseph Smith** was present on behalf of the petition.

**Ms. Leah Michalak** gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for demolition of all lane buildings and Part 1: Height and Mass for new construction of a carriage house at 23 West Gordon Street.

1. Demolition of the non-contributing one and two-story buildings at the lane;
2. New construction of a two-story, three-bay carriage house at the lane with a continuous wall at the lane with another vehicular entrance.

Additionally, the petitioner has requested that the Board provide initial comments on alterations and additions to the main house that will be proposed during Part II: Design Details for the carriage house.

1. Alterations to the main house consist of replacing the asphalt shingle roof with a new standing seam metal roof, repair and repainting windows, shutters, and other woodwork; and virtual demolition and reconstruction of the two-story rear addition and side porch that wraps the east façade of the main building. The east half of this addition will be reconstructed at three-stories high.



2. Addition of a two-story hyphen, with a roof deck, between the main building's rear addition and the new carriage house. This addition also has an attached two-story porch structure extending into the east courtyard.

**Ms. Michalak** reported that staff recommends:

1. Approval for demolition of all lane buildings at 23 West Gordon Street as requested because staff does not believe they meet the criteria to be considered contributing.
2. Approval of Part I: Height and Mass for new construction of a carriage house at 23 West Gordon Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:
  - a. Reduce the height of the wall at the lane to a maximum of 11 feet.
  - b. Ensure that door frames and window sashes are inset a minimum of 3 inches from the face of the building.
  - c. Revise the ground floor carriage house windows along Whitaker Street to have a vertical to horizontal ratio of not less than 5:3.
  - d. Ensure that the sloped apron to the garage openings are not erected on the public right-of-way.
3. Staff provides the following comments for the petitioner's consideration about the proposed additions and alterations to the main building:
  - a. Staff recommends that the open space below the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor of the hyphen and above the brick wall be eliminated.
  - b. Staff recommends that the parapet wall proposed on top of the brick porch wall at the rear of the main building be changed to a railing or a different feature that is clearly differentiated from historic building and does not create a false sense of history.
  - c. Staff recommends that the hyphen be setback further from the Whitaker Street façade of the historic building; a 2-foot setback is currently proposed. Staff recommends that the hyphen be setback further distinguish it from the historic building and to be more in keeping with the historic development pattern of "main house, courtyard, and carriage house."
  - d. Staff believes that the design of the hyphen is too "high style" in comparison with the historic building; staff recommends that the design be simplified and modified to appear more contemporary in nature.
  - e. Staff recommends that the window be retained on site to allow for a future restoration.
  - f. Staff recommends that the new column on the side porch be changed from fiberglass to wood.
  - g. Samples, specifications, and colors have not yet been provided for the addition and the hyphen.
  - h. Ensure that door frames and window sashes are inset a minimum of 3 inches from the face of the building.
  - i. Wood siding is proposed on the 3-story portion of the addition and stucco on the 2-story portion of the addition; however, staff believes it is more compatible for the whole addition to be one material or the other.
  - j. Ensure that all railing standards are met.
  - k. Staff recommends that the pergola and deck be reduced in size, scale, and visibility

from the front elevation.

### **PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Mr. Smith** stated that his client prefers to have a solid garage. But, if the Board prefers that it be wood, he will amend the design to incorporate that look. As an alternate, they believe that the doors that are here now by reducing the height to 11 feet would require a railing across the top. They are not sure this would be preferable and visually compatible. He wanted to confirm that the door frames will be assessed three inches. A return will be on each window. No aprons will be at the garage doors.

### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF)** stated they believe the carriage house design is quite large and overwhelms the main house. The HSF believes it needs to be reduced. The style is too formal for the main house. The style is also a little different than the main house and they believe this could be simplified.

**Mr. Smith**, in response to the public comments, stated regarding the massing of the carriage house, there are other carriage houses on the lane that have similar massing and scale. The design is very simple. In terms of the language of the façade, the windows are simple. In the spirit of the differentiation of the double window design, this is not a historic building. The shutters will be operable.

### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board discussed the design of the carriage house. Regarding the lower gates on the right-hand side, if the parapet was lower and a railing was installed next to it, there would be less visual compatibility on the lane. The windows on the Whitaker Street side needs to be aligned and match the windows above. Several Board members agreed with the HSF that the carriage house is too large. The doors on the end of the bay should be raised to match the other doors. The Board agreed with the staff's recommendations.

With regards to the main building, the Board discussed the open space below the 2nd floor of the hyphen and above the existing brick wall; the new stucco parapet on top of the historic brick wall at the rear addition; and wood siding versus stucco on the rear addition. However, they did not provide a recommendation to the petitioner.

**NOTE:** Alterations, Additions, and New Construction: Part II Carriage House at 23 West Gordon Street will be presented at a later meeting.

### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

1. Approve demolition of all land buildings at 23 West Gordon Street as requested because staff does not believe they meet the criteria to be considered contributing.

2. Approve Part I: Height and Mass for new construction of a carriage house at 23 West Gordon Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:
  - a. Ensure that the "garage doors" within the 4th vehicular opening extend the full height of the door opening.
  - b. Ensure that the door frames and window sashes are inset a minimum of 3 inches from the face of the building.
  - c. Ensure that the sloped apron to the garage openings are not erected on public right-of-way.
  
3. Provide the following comments for the petitioner's consideration about the proposed additions and alterations to the main building:
  - a. Set the hyphen further back from the Whitaker Street façade of the historic building to further distinguish it from the historic building and to be more in keeping with the historic development pattern of the "main house, courtyard, and carriage house."
  - b. The design of the hyphen is too "high style" in comparison with the historic building; redesign to be simplified and modified to appear more contemporary in nature. - PASS
  - c. The window proposed to be removed be retained on site to allow for a future restoration.
  - d. The new column in the side porch be changed from fiberglass to wood.
  - e. Samples, specifications, and colors have not yet been provided for the addition and the hyphen.
  - f. Ensure that door frames and window sashes are inset a minimum of 3 inches from the face of the building.
  - g. Ensure that all railing standards are met.
  - h. Reduce the pergola and deck in size, scale, and visibility from the front elevation.
  - i. Lower the height of the hyphen to be more differentiated from the main house addition and the new carriage house.
  - j. Provide "before" and "after" exterior elevations on the same drawing sheet for better comprehension of the proposed project.

The following additional items were discussed by the Board, but a recommendation was not provided:

- The open space below the 2nd floor of the hyphen and above the existing brick wall.
- The new stucco parapet on top of the historic brick wall at the rear addition.
- Wood siding versus stucco on the rear addition.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Andy McGarrity

Second: Keith Howington

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Abstain
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye

**IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**

19. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 E. Bay St. | 12-month extension](#)

Attachment: [15-001384-COA 12-month extension.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic Board of Review does hereby approve a 12 month extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) issued on December 9, 2015 for New Construction Part I: Height and Mass of a six to eight story hotel on the property at 600 East Bay Street to expire on December 9, 2017. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Abstain
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye

Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye

## X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

20. [Petition of Paul Allen | 16-005266-COA | 137 Bull Street - Unit 1B | Staff Approved - Sign Face Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 137 Bull Street Unit 1B 16-005266-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 137 Bull Street Unit 1B 16-005266-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

21. [Petition of Eleanor Rhangos | 16-005518-COA | 24 West Harris Street | Staff Approved - Stucco Repair](#)

Attachment: [COA - 24 West Harris Street 16-005518-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 24 West Harris Street 16-005518-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

22. [Amended Petition of Luis Burgos for Hansen Architects | 16-005564-COA | 220 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 220 West Broughton Street 16-005564-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 220 West Broughton Street 16-005564-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

23. [Petition of Hemel Patel | 16-005622-COA | 215 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved - Repairs and In-Kind Replacements](#)

Attachment: [COA - 215 East Gordon Street 16-005622-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 215 East Gordon Street 16-005622-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

24. [Petition of Tim Riley for the Neher Group/THD at Home Services | 16-005632-COA | 301 East Huntingdon Street | Staff Approved - Roof](#)

Attachment: [COA - 301 East Huntingdon Street 16-005632-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 301 East Huntingdon Street 16-005632-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

25. [Amended Petition of Josh W. Bull for Homeline Architecture | 16-005653-COA | 110 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Staff Approved - Stucco and Brick Repair](#)

Attachment: [110 East Oglethorpe Avenue 16-005653-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 110 East Oglethorpe Avenue 16-005653-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet 2 - 110 East Oglethorpe Avenue 16-005653-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

26. [Petition of Mallory Teeple for Coastal Canvas Products | 16-005665-COA | 53 Montgomery Street | Staff Approved - Awnings](#)

Attachment: [COA - 53 Montgomery Street 16-005665-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 53 Montgomery Street 16-005665-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

27. [Petition of Jerry and Mary Rooney | 16-005695-COA | 212 Houston Street | Staff Approved - Vehicle Gate](#)

Attachment: [COA - 212 Houston Street 16-005695-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [212 Houston Street - Photos.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

28. [Petition of Doug Bean for Doug Bean Signs, Inc. | 16-005754-COA | 25 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Sign Face Changes](#)

Attachment: [COA - 25 East Broughton Street 16-005754-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 25 East Broughton Street 16-005754-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

29. [Petition of Michael Wolfe for Ace Construction & Remodeling | 16-005768-COA | 524 Price Street | Staff Approved - Brick Knee Wall and Chimney](#)

Attachment: [COA - 524 Price Street 16-005768-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 524 Price Street 16-005768-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

30. [Petition of James F. Reardon for Reardon Design, LLC | 16-005778-COA | 216 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 216 West Broughton Street 16-005778-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 216 West Broughton Street 16-005778-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

31. [Petition of Matthew Weiner | 16-005800-COA | 222 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved - Cur Cut, Gate](#)

Attachment: [COA - 222 East Gordon Street 16-005800-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 222 East Gordon Street 16-005800-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

32. [Petition of Paul Chechak | 16-005886-COA | 517 East Perry Street | Staff Approved - Storage Shed](#)

Attachment: [COA - 517 East Perry Street 16-005886-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

## XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

33. [Report on Work Performed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness](#)

Attachment: [HDBR Michalak Work Without a COA 11-9-16.pdf](#)

**Mr. Gunther** stated that staff has given the Board the report on work performed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

## XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

## XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

### Notices

34. [Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting - Thursday, November 17, 2016 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC, 110 East State Street](#)

35. [Next Regular Meeting - Wednesday, December 14, 2016 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 E. State Street](#)

## XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

### Unfinished Business

36. [Review Proposed Revisions to the Historic District Ordinance](#)

Attachment: [11-9-16 HDBR Version- for discussion.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Archaeology Policy - DRAFT 5-9-16.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Public Art Policy - DRAFT 5-9-16.pdf](#)

**Note: Ms. Jennifer Deacon left the meeting at 3:55 p.m.**

The Board discussed the proposed revisions to the Historic District Ordinance. Ms. Harris informed the Board that staff will email the revisions to them. Staff was directed by the Board that upon sending the revisions to them, staff could go ahead and schedule meetings for the appropriate entities, etc., to review the revisions.

**Mr. Robert Rosenwald of the Downtown Neighborhood Association (DNA)** stated they applaud the work that the Historic District Board of Review

is doing. Mr. Rosenwald asked if the building size footprint means the total of each building or the total of the building.

**Ms. Michalak** answered that the building size footprint means each building.

## **New Business**

### 37. [Appointment of the Nominating Committee](#)

**Mr. Gunther** informed the Board that Mr. Merriman appointed **Ms. Caldwell, Ms. Scheer and** him to serve as the nominating committee to nominate persons to serve as chair, vice-chair and parliamentarian for 2017.

### 38. [Discuss Annual Retreat](#)

The Board's Annual Retreat will be held in December, 2016. Ms. Harris requested that the Board send their topic suggestions to staff. Staff is anticipating having a representative from CEMA as well as the superintendent of Fort Pulaski make a presentation. The retreat will be held at City Hall.

## **XV. ADJOURNMENT**

### 39. [Adjournment](#)

There being no further business to come before the Historic District Board of Review, Mr. Gunther adjourned the meeting at 5:20 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen I. Harris  
Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

EIH:mem