



SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT
BOARD OF REVIEW

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room
July 8, 2015 1:00 p.m.
Meeting Minutes

JULY 8, 2015 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

HDRB Members Present: Keith Howington, Chair
Zena McClain, Esq., Parliamentarian
Debra Caldwell
Justin Gunther
Dr. Henry Nicholas
Andy McGarrity
Stephen Merriman, Jr.
Tess Scheer
Dr. Robin Williams

HDRB Members Not Present: Ebony Simpson, Vice- Chair
Marjorie Weibe-Reed

MPC Staff Present: Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation
Leah G. Michalak, Historic Preservation Planner
Sara Farr, Historic Preservation Planner
Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. [Call to Order and Welcome](#)

Mr. Howington called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He outlined the purpose and role of the Historic District Board of Review.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

2. [Petition of Steve Minish | 15-002687-COA | 518 East Gaston Street | After-the-Fact Fences](#)

- Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Images prior to fence installation.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the after-the-fact petition to install a fence along the lane of the property located at 518 East Gaston Street with the following condition:
- Ensure that the new fence sections are finished with the proposed “honey” colored stain within 60 days of the approval date within this Certificate of Appropriateness. - PASS
Because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.
Debra Caldwell - Not Present
Justin Gunther - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye
Andy McGarrity - Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Tess Scheer - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye

3. [Petition of Karen Matthews | 15-002946-COA | 230 West Bay Street | Sign](#)

- Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Updated Sign Size Information.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a sign at 230 West Bay Street, because it meets the standards and is visually compatible. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.
Debra Caldwell - Not Present
Justin Gunther - Aye

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

4. [Petition of Electric Bikes of Savannah | 15-003165-COA | 326 Bull Street | Signs](#)

Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal packet - 326 Bull Street 15-003165-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for two fascia signs to be located on the building at 326 Bull Street with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the preservation and sign standards.

- Ensure that the proposed screws are the gentlest physical means possible – that they are the smallest and fewest screws necessary to attach the signs securely to the façade of the building. The signs (and screws) are removable, and therefore, a reversible addition to the building.

- PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

5. [Petition of Doug Beans Signs Inc. | 15-003189-COA | 102 West Broughton Street | Sign](#)

Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a principal use projecting sign for the business located at 102 West Broughton Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the preservation and sign standards. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.
Debra Caldwell - Not Present
Justin Gunther - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye
Andy McGarrity - Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Tess Scheer - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye

6. [Petition of David Kelley | 15-003212-COA | 322-324 West Broughton Street | Signs](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for three new façade signs at 322-324 East Broughton Street, because they meet the standards and are visually compatible. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.
Debra Caldwell - Not Present
Justin Gunther - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye
Andy McGarrity - Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Tess Scheer - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye

7. [Petition of Neil Dawson | 15-003213-COA | 570 East York Street | Addition, Color Change, Awnings, Windows, Doors, Stucco Repair](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Package.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a ramp, reconfiguration of the courtyard and construction of a wall and fence at 570 East York Street with the - PASS condition that all colors and finishes be submitted for staff approval, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.
Debra Caldwell - Not Present
Justin Gunther - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye
Andy McGarrity - Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Tess Scheer - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

8. [Approval for Adoption of July 8, 2015 Agenda](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the adoption of July 8, 2015 - PASS Agenda.

Vote Results

Motion: Tess Scheer
Second: Nicholas Henry
Debra Caldwell - Not Present
Justin Gunther - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain

Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

9. [Approve Meeting Minutes of June 10, 2015](#)

Attachment: [06-10-2015 Minutes.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the Meeting Minutes of June 10, 2015. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq.

Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

10. [Petition of Gavin Macrae-Gibson | 14-003508-COA | 31 East Jones Street | Fence Alteration](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Nicholas Henry

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
----------------	-------

Justin Gunther	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

11. [Petition of Neil Dawson, Dawson Architects | 14-005106-COA | 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue | New Construction Hotel: Part II, Design Details](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Nicholas Henry

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

12. [Petition of Patrick Shay for Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | Demolition and New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Nicholas Henry

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
----------------	-------

Justin Gunther	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

13. [Petition of Clegg Ivey | 15-002129-COA | 514 MLK, Jr. Blvd. | Fence and Trellis](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Nicholas Henry

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

14. [Petition of Linda Ramsay | 15-002695-COA | 20 East Taylor Street | New Construction Carriage House: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Nicholas Henry

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

15. [Petition of Patrick Phelps for Hansen Architects | 15-002710-COA | 200 Block East McDonough Street | New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass \(North Building\)](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Nicholas Henry

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Justin Gunther - Aye

Nicholas Henry - Aye

Keith Howington - Abstain

Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye

Andy McGarrity - Aye

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye

Tess Scheer - Aye

Robin Williams - Aye

16. [Petition of Patrick Phelps for Hansen Architects | 15-002751-COA | 200 Block East Perry Street | New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass \(South Building\)](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Nicholas Henry

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Justin Gunther - Aye

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

17. [Petition of Christian Sottile for Sottile & Sottile | 14-005099-COA | 215 West Broughton Street | New Construction: Part 2 Design Details](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation 14-005099-COA.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Drawings and Specifications.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Supplemental Information.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Application.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Public Comment- Rosenwald.pdf](#)

Mr. Christian Sottile was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval of revisions to Part I: Height and Mass and Part II: Design Details of a new six-story mixed use building at 215 West Broughton Street. The building proposes to be a full basement, commercial/retail on floors one through three, and a residence on floors four through six. The first floor is designed with full glass facades on the north and south elevations so that one can see through the building to the lane beyond. The sixth floor is setback from Broughton Street and from Broughton Lane. A trellis is proposed along the lane. An elevator overrun extends an additional five feet above the sixth floor along the eastern edge of the building.

Ms. Harris stated that the Board of Review reviewed Part I: Height and Mass on November 12, 2014 and continued it at the request of the petitioner. The Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA) granted variances from the following standards on January 22, 2015:

- A one-story variance from the Height Map(the property is in a four story height zone). As the variance for the fifth floor was granted, the petitioner meets the criteria for a "bonus story" for large-scale development for a sixth story by providing ground floor interactive uses on 100% of the ground floor at the street;
- A one-foot variance from the minimum ground floor height of 14'6" (13'6" is proposed);
- A six inch variance from the minimum upper ground floor height of 10' (9'6" is proposed);
- A non-centered entrance on Broughton Street (a centered entrance is required).

Ms. Harris stated that the Review Board reviewed Part I: Height and Mass again on March 11, 2015 and approved it with the condition that the ground levels solids to voids be restudied to provide stronger solids so that the building is more "grounded" for visual

compatibility. She said that the Height and Mass of the project has been revised as follows:

- The sixth floor as increased in size from 37 feet deep to 55 feet deep.
- The increase in size alters the setbacks: the sixth floor was originally setback 30 feet from Broughton Street and 12 feet from Broughton Lane, and now is proposed to setback 15 feet from Broughton Street and 20 feet from Broughton Lane.

Ms. Harris said that additionally the Review Board had some discussion regarding the restoration of light wells in the sidewalk. The petitioner has stated that "the condition of the light wells is unknown until stabilization and excavation commences on the site. Excavation at this time is not possible due to the instability of the adjacent party walls."

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends a continuance of revisions to Part I Height and Mass and Part II Design Details for a new six story building at 215 West Broughton Street in order to restudy the following:

1. Restudy the size and placement of the sixth floor to increase the setback from Broughton Street to 30 feet as originally proposed;
2. Restudy the solid to void relationship in the front façade and incorporate additional solids such as mullions similar to the storefront on the lane, a taller base, and/or incorporation of a transom, as per the condition of Part I: Height and Mass approval;
3. Restudy the material and design of the sculptural metal canopy for visual compatibility;
4. Ensure that the height of the railing does not exceed 36 inches.

Should the Board approve the revisions to Part I: Height and Mass and Part II: Design Details, staff recommends that a Sample Panel installation be a condition of the approval.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Sottile, on behalf of the Argentinis Building, thanked the Board for hearing their petition. He said this is truly a rare opportunity to introduce a distinctly 21 century building to Broughton Street. They believe that Broughton Street needs a 21 century building and not a historical replica, but a true 21 century building to embrace civic art and ornament, strategic minimalism as well as modern tools to visual composition and fabrication. Mr. Sottile said that the Board of Review has been wonderfully engaging and embracing this challenging opportunity. The dialogue that has been created has been helpful and thought provoking for them as they developed the final details and materials for the building. The intent of the design as they went through the initial stages of design with the various inputs and reviews, evolved to the façade that the Board sees in their packets really became the gateway to getting to the level of details and designs. The project is classified as large-scale development.

Mr. Sottile said that his comments would focus on the staff's comments. An amendment was done to the Part I as staff has pointed out. As noted, the height of the building has not changed. With the adjustment, the conservatory is still set back 15 feet from the Broughton Street façade. He said that since reviewing the comments and some dialogue with staff, they felt the best way to study this is to look at site lines relating to the proposed footprint for the rooftop conservatory. Therefore, they looked at the façade's visibility

from Broughton Street and constructed a site line overlay to look at the site line from the far side of Broughton Street looking back to the building. The building was designed with a true expression of five stories on Broughton Street and the rooftop component even though it qualifies for a six story, needed to be setback and free of the façade significantly. They believe it is setback appropriately. They will not have a separate mechanical yard on the roof in addition to the conservatory. They will have a 16 foot mechanical yard incorporated within the boundaries of the footprint of the structure. Mr. Sottile said they also went back and considered the view from the lane. They took the site line from State Street. Consequently, the conservatory is still within a safe margin of the site line.

Mr. Sottile said the street level design was brought up as a concern. They spent a great deal of time during the height and mass process talking about transparency and the 55 requirement which the building meets in its core as it is 57 percent transparency. He said that there is no requirement in the ordinance for a transom. They looked very hard at the design and did not originally have a sill design within the structure, but during their Part I approval they as a project team committed to studying the condition and incorporating a sill into the design. Mr. Sottile said they believe that the design is compatible with the designs that are in the immediate vicinity. He said that staff recommends the sample panel markups in the field and they be willing to continue to study this with staff, but they felt that they brought forward something that corresponded with the Part I approval. Mr. Sottile said they have no objections with the staff's comments regarding the height of the railing. It is their understanding from the International Building Code that the guardrails for private residences located above the third floor would require to be 42 inches in height, but they are willing to make the adjustment if it is determined locally that this is not the case.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Harris reported that staff received an email from Mr. Robert B. Rosenwald who was aware that the ZBA approved the variance granting the six floor, but he is in opposition to six floors.

Mr. Roger Moss, Vice President of the Downtown Business Association, said they were present to endorse this project.

Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) said they recognize and appreciate the high quality materials that are being proposed for this project. They agree with all of the staff's comments. Ms. Meunier said they also agree that the 30 feet setback should be reinstated instead of the reduced setback. Based on the site lines provided, they share with staff the thought that as long as it is not visible and is not increasing any kind of perception about height of the building. They strongly agree that the solid to void relationship needs to be restudied on the ground floor of the front façade to provide stronger solids as was a condition of Part I.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board's discussion centered around the material and design of the sculptural metal canopy and the reduction of the railing to 36 inches if permitted by the City's Development Services Department.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for revisions to Part I Height and Mass and Part II Design Details for a new six story building at 215 West Broughton Street with the following conditions:

1. Restudy the material and design of the sculptural metal canopy for visual compatibility and bring back to the Board for review and approval; and - PASS
2. Reduce the height of the railing to 36 inches if permitted by the City's Development Services Department.

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Justin Gunther

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Nay
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Nay
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

18. [Petition of Greenline Architecture | 15-003209-COA | 509 Tattnall Street | Addition](#)

Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)

Attachment: [CONTEXT.pdf](#)

Attachment: [1980s - 1990s Photographs.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Staff Site Photographs.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Renderings.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Drawings.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Colors, Materials, and Specifications.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Petitioner Response to Staff Report.pdf](#)

NOTE: Mr. Howington recused from participation in this petition. He is an employee of Greenline Architecture. Ms. McClain chaired the hearing.

Mr. Josh Bull and Mr. John Deering were present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for alterations to the historic building, an addition to the building, and a fence for the property located at 509 Tattnall Street. The existing lot coverage is 46 percent; with the reconfigured property lines and the proposed rear addition, the lot coverage will be 75 percent.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval of the alterations to the historic building, an addition to the building, and a fence for the for the property located at 509 Tattnall Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the preservation and design standards:

1. Provide a sample for the proposed stone steps;
2. Provide a detail of the steel lintel proposed over the double-hung window on the ground floor of the front façade of the historic building;
3. Revise the proposed new square window opening on the front façade of the historic building in order to be differentiated from the historic square opening;
4. Revise the replacement window type on the front façade square windows to be a type permitted by the ordinance; staff recommends the use of an awning window type;
5. Provide additional information, including samples, regarding the products that will be used for the brick infill and mortar composition where brick work on the historic building is proposed. Follow the guidance provided in the HDBR Repointing Policy and Preservation Brief 2: Repointing Mortar Joints in
Historic
Masonry Buildings;
6. Revise the balcony to be a maximum of 3 feet deep and support the balcony with brackets or other types of architectural support to meet the design standards;
7. Ensure that the sloped apron for the new garage is not located on the public-right-of-way.
8. Locate the HVAC and pool equipment on the site plan.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Josh Bull stated that since they forwarded the black and white renderings to staff, they now have them in color. He showed the color renderings on the screen to give the Board an indication of the existing brick versus the new brick. Mr. Bull stated the details over the windows on Tattnall Street will be provided to staff. They accept the staff's recommendation and provide the windows as awning windows. They will provide samples of the brick and mortar infill to staff. He said the balcony was proposed to be four feet, but they are willing to reduce it to three feet. Mr. Bull said the apron for the garage will not be on the public-right-of way. The HVAC will be located midway on the roof; they will provide screening. On the Tattnall Street elevation, they will revise the new square window openings on the front façade to be differentiated from the historic square opening by providing a steel lintel over the new window so that it acts as a new replacement. They will present this to staff.

Dr. Williams questioned the color of the new brick versus the color of the existing brick.

Mr. Deering said they studied the brick in great detail. When they looked at more orange/red samples, they looked the 1955 school board building. They want to avoid this color. They want the building to look like a quality modern addition to an historic mixed use building. This is why they chose a completely different color. They believe the colors blend well. They had four samples on site and all the orange/red samples gave them a school board look from the 1950s. They, therefore, could not find the right red/orange brick in a modern brick to use. Mr. Deering said with the color choices they selected along with paint and metal, they will have a successful building.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) said that they are not opposed to contemporary architecture. In many cases they support it and believe that the design of these elements are very successful. However, they believe that this requires further examination to ensure that the addition will not overwhelm the historic building both in its size and nature. HSF would like some clarity in how the footprint is being measured. It appears that the new addition is at least the same size if not larger than the footprint of just the historic building not including the existing non-historic addition.

Mr. Bull, in response to the public comments, explained that they studied the size of the existing building versus the new building and looked at it as the entire building row of townhouses as the historic structure. He explained that they are not removing the entire stucco addition from 1983, but they are not actually removing it but parts of it and they are encapsulating most of it. The proposed new construction is approximately 525 square feet. This puts them at a very low percentage of new construction based on the entire historic building proportion. Mr. Bull explained that the new window that they are putting in to replace the entry door, the hatched area shows the extent of the 1983 portion of both the existing door and the brick that was modified at that time.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed the square windows. They also discussed the color of the existing brick and the new brick. They concluded that additional information is needed, including samples, regarding the products that will be used for the brick infill and mortar composition where brick work on the historic building is proposed.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the alterations to the historic building, an addition to the building, and a fence for the property located at 509 Tattnall Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the preservation and design standards:

1. Provide a sample for the proposed stone steps.
2. Provide a detail of the steel lintel proposed over

the double-hung window on the ground floor of the front façade of the historic building.

3. Revise the proposed new square window opening on the front façade of the historic building in order to be differentiated from the historic square opening.

4. Revise the replacement window type on the front façade square windows to be a type permitted by the ordinance; staff recommends the use of an awning window type.

- PASS

5. Acknowledge the door infill location on the front façade with a joint or another technique to differentiate the former opening from the new brick infill.

6. Provide additional information, including samples, regarding the products that will be used for the brick infill and mortar composition where brick work on the historic building is proposed.

Follow the guidance provided in the HDBR Repointing Policy and Preservation Brief 2: Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Masonry Buildings.

7. Revise the balcony to be a maximum of 3 feet deep.

8. Ensure that the sloped apron for the new garage is not located on the public right-of-way.

9. Locate the HVAC equipment and provide any screening as necessary. Submit screening details to staff for review and approval.

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell

- Aye

Justin Gunther

- Aye

Nicholas Henry

- Aye

Keith Howington

- Abstain

Zena McClain, Esq.

- Abstain

Andy McGarrity

- Aye

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

- Aye

Tess Scheer

- Aye

Robin Williams

- Aye

[19. Petition of Andy Lynch, Lynch Associates Architects, PC | 15-003214-COA | 32 MLK Jr. Blvd. | Demolition of a Contributing Building](#)

Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Application.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Supplemental Information.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Appendix A Ward Map.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Appendix B Real Estate Listing.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Appendix C Property Record Card.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Appendix D Structural Report.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Staff Recommendation 15-003214-COA.pdf](#)

Mr. Andrew Lynch was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval to demolish 32 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard, a contributing building within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District. The building is a two-story stuccoed brick building, currently oriented to West Congress Street, and with limited openings. This building has undergone substantial alterations. In 2012, staff approved the removal and replacement of the entire roof system which had collapsed, and rebuilding the east and south facades and covering with stucco. Despite extensive efforts by both the petitioner and staff, no historic photographs were located.

Ms. Harris explained that for demolition of a contributing building, the COA application requires a significant amount of information to be submitted. The petitioner has provided the information. The petitioner intends to submit for new construction on the site, assuming the demolition is approved. The approval for the demolition would be contingent on approval and permitting of the new construction, before the demolition could begin.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval of the demolition of 32 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard with the following conditions:

1. Conduct an archeological assessment of the property after demolition;
2. Document the existing conditions through photographs and measured drawings and provide to City's Municipal Library and Archives; and
3. Reuse or recycle the historic bricks.

Because the building has lost historic fabric to the extent that staff believes it should no longer be considered contributing. The approval of the demolition is contingent on approval and permitting of the new construction.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Lynch said they agree with the staff's assessment. He explained that they did not take it lightly in asking for a demolition. They went through the building extensively with their engineers and staff before coming to the conclusion of applying for demolition. Mr. Lynch said the only thing he would add to the staff report is that they have shown the percentages of the existing walls and talked about the existing areas that have been reconstructed and/or altered at some time. He wanted to reiterate that none of the finishes on this building are original; almost 100 percent has been replaced at some point. The windows are not original and the roof has been replaced. The only thing that is original to the building is the hardwood floors on the second level. The first floor has been recovered with tile and at some point a concrete slab has been poured. The upper floors are in terrible condition.

Mr. McGarrity said that one of the staff's recommendation is to reuse or recycle the historic bricks. He asked Mr. Lynch if this is his plan.

Mr. Lynch answered yes; they plan to reuse or recycle the historic bricks.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) thanked Mr. Lynch for reaching out to the HSF and affording them the opportunity to see the building. Mr. Carey said their walk-through revealed that this building has been abused over the decades. However, the HSF is never in favor of demolition of a contributing building. There is no guarantee of the highest and best use of a piece of property. He does not believe that they can guarantee a return on investment. The burden of proof on the economic hardship claim is on the applicant. To claim it is one thing and to rely on reasonable speculation as to what the property is worth based on assessment. However, he was always under the impression that "hardship" related more to the applicant's capacity to do something with the building, not if it going to get the return they want. The economic hardship claim is really important because in his opinion this is the flood gate. If they lift the flood gate or open it wide, then everybody will start claiming this. The Board needs to be careful about what they are relying on. The other aspect would be whether the building is contributing or not.

Mr. Carey said he believes he heard the staff say that this building is no longer contributing and he respects that opinion. His question, though, should it be determined formally or officially no longer contributing for the Review Board to allow for it to be demolished. He did not believe the Board would have to do this, but if they are convinced that it is not contributing, he guesses he would like a formal or official opinion that it is not contributing and then the Review Board could make their decision. This would be a lot easier to justify and make their decision about demolishing a contributing building. Buildings on the National Register can get delisted when they have lost enough integrity.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussion centered around getting the building delisted from the Historic Building Map. Ms. Harris explained that this would require a text amendment to the Historic District Ordinance. The petitioner or staff could initiate a text amendment that would go to the Metropolitan Planning Commission who would make a recommendation to City Council.

Mr. Howington explained that economic hardship is not a purview of the Review Board.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the demolition of 32 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd., with the following conditions:

1. Conduct an archeological assessment of the property after demolition;
2. Document the existing conditions through photographs and measured drawings and provide to the City's Municipal Library and Archives;
3. Reuse or recycle the historic bricks; and
4. Apply for the removal of the building from the Historic Building Map; - PASS

Because the building has lost historic fabric to the extent it should no longer be considered contributing. This approval is based on the lack of historic integrity of the building and not on economic hardship. The approval of the demolition is contingent on approval and permitting of the new construction.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Robin Williams

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

20. [Petition of Dan Sweeney | 15-003243-COA | 125 East Broughton Street | Color Change, Stucco Repair, Signs](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Package.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Historic Photograph.pdf](#)

NOTE: Ms. McClain and Mr. McGarrity left the meeting at 4:4:30 P.M.

Mr. Dan Sweeney was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting an approval for the installation of new lights, a principal use sign, stucco repair and repainting, storefront replacement, a menu sign and infill of existing openings with windows. The Broughton Street elevation will include stucco repair to match existing and be repainted Benjamin Moore Navajo White (OC-95). New LED lights will be installed. The edges of the lighted

areas will be Nifty Turquoise (SW 6941) and the recesses will be Navajo White (OC-95). Above the marquee clear anodized fixed storefront glass will be installed in existing openings. Below the marquee 4x4 glazed ceramic tile in glossy white will be installed and 6x6 ceramic tile color to match Nifty Turquoise will be installed. A new storefront system will be installed in the existing opening, with the exception of the windows, which will be extended to the ground in clear anodized silver. Ms. Farr said a menu board is also proposed. It will be behind a custom anodized door and surrounded by decorative tile. It will be recessed 6 inches. The opening is sized 3 feet 4 inches by 4 feet 8 inches. A variance is being requested for the size.

Ms. Farr reported that staff recommends approval for the alterations, rehabilitation, and a principal use sign at 125 Broughton Street with the following conditions:

1. Redesign the storefront to include a recessed entrance and a sill or base of a contrasting material a minimum of 18 inches tall to be submitted for stall; approval;
2. The storefront and storefront windows are inset a minimum of four inches;
3. The announcement sign is reduced to four square feet;
4. Ensure the stucco repairs are completed following Preservation Brief 22;

Because the application otherwise meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Ms. Farr reported also that staff recommends approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA) of the request for a variance for the principal use sign size, because the variance criteria are met. She reported additionally that staff recommends denial to ZBA of the request for a variance for the menu board size because the variance criteria are not met.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Sweeney stated that he agrees with the staff's recommendation on all points with the exception of the entrance being recessed. He believes that staff is saying that the entrance door be recessed and that an 18 inch sill be along the bottom of the windows. Mr. Sweeney said the building currently has 18 inch sills. They have no problem making the side windows 18 inches. The door is in the center. Their entrance is off center. The difficulty with the recessed entrance is solely with the existing conditions of the building. The storefront is flush with the front façade. A significantly raised slope is behind the front door. A 1970's photograph shows the door was recessed about 15 feet. They had a demolition team here and it was found that approximately three floors were at one time terrazzo. They want to bring the terrazzo back. The terrazzo is across the full width of the façade. They have an access stairway to the side that goes to the 2nd floor. It is in the front window, but they have pushed it back two feet as they are dealing with a structural beam that is approximately 15 feet deep. He does not really know how they will be able to recessed the door.

Mr. Howington asked staff how much footage should the door be recessed.

Ms. Harris answered that it is on a case-by-case basis.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board Discussion centered around the announcement sign being reduced to four square feet and redesigned to better fit the streamline Art Deco style of the building. The title texture be shiny and smooth as appropriate to the aesthetic of the building and that the principal use sign be redesigned to better replicate the historic Avon Theatre sign.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations and rehabilitation at 125 East Broughton Street with the following conditions:

1. Redesign the storefront to include an entrance recessed 12 inches and maintaining the current sill;
2. Center the entrance below the marquee, preferably by expanding the storefront glass;
3. The storefront and storefront windows are inset a minimum of four inches;
4. The announcement sign is reduced to four square feet and redesigned to better fit the streamline Art Deco style of the building;
5. Ensure the stucco repairs are completed following Preservation Brief 22; - PASS
6. Ensure that the tile texture and shine are shiny and smooth as appropriate to the aesthetic of the building and approved by staff;

Because the application otherwise meets the standards and is visually compatible.

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for the principal use sign at 125 East Broughton Street in order for the petitioner to redesign a sign that better replicates the historic Avon Theatre sign.

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Justin Gunther - Aye

Nicholas Henry - Aye

Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Andy McGarrity	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

21. [Petition of David Gardner for Whitlow Construction Co., Inc. | 15-003117-COA | 7 East Macon Street | Staff Approved - Chimney Cap](#)

Attachment: [COA - 7 East Macon Street 15-003117-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 7 East Macon Street 15-003117-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

22. [Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 15-003122-COA | 210 East State Street | Staff Approved - Awnings](#)

Attachment: [COA - 210 East State Street 15-003122-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [PERMITS \(4\) Submittal Packet 210 East State Street 15-003122-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet Fabric \(2\) 210 East State Street 15-003122-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

23. [Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 15-003123-COA | 211 West River Street | Staff Approved - Awnings](#)

Attachment: [COA - 211 West River Street 15-003123-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 211 West River street 15-003123-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet 2 Fabric - 211 West River Street 15-003123-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

24. [Petition of Randall Walker | 15-003124-COA | 424 East Jones Street | Staff Approved - Shutters](#)

Attachment: [COA - 424 East Jones Street 15-003124-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

25. [Petition of Harley Krinsky | 15-003154-COA | 116 West Congress Street | Staff Approved - Lighting](#)

Attachment: [COA - 116 West Congress Street 15-003154-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 116 West Congress Street 15-003154-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

26. [Petition of S. Bart Redmond | 15-003175-COA | 105 Whitaker Street | Staff Approved - Stucco Repair](#)

Attachment: [COA - 105 Whitaker Street 15-003175-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 105 Whitaker Street 15-003175-COA.pdf](#)

27. [Petition of Steve Bowen for Signs of the South, Inc. | 15-003208-COA | 111 West Congress Street | Staff Approved - Signage](#)

Attachment: [COA - 111 West Congress Street 15-003208-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [doc00112420150624115950.pdf](#)

Attachment: [doc00112520150624120008.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

28. [Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 15-003218-COA | 224 West Boundary Street | Staff Approved - Awnings](#)

Attachment: [COA - 224 West Boundary Street 15-003218-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 224 West Boundary Street 15-003218-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

29. [Petition of Nic Pollock for Achemy Restoration | 15-003230-COA | 113 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 113 East Gordon Street 15-003230-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 113 East Gordon Street 15-003230-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

30. [Petition of Brian Sherman | 15-003264-COA | 304 East Hall Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 304 East Hall Street 15-003264-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 304 East Hall Street - 15-003264-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

31. [Petition of Alexandra Trujillo de Taylor | 15-003265-COA | 323 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 323 West Broughton Street 15-003265-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [6a. 323 W. Broughton Street.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

32. [Petition of Brian Robin for Robin Restoration | 15-003296-COA | 107 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Windows, Doors](#)

Attachment: [COA - 107 West Broughton Street 15-003296-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [1931 photo before changed to Deco in 1938.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

33. [Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 15-003300-COA | 605 West Oglethorpe Avenue | Staff Approved - Awning](#)

Attachment: [COA - 605 West Oglethorpe Avenue 15-003300-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 605 West Oglethorpe Avenue 15-003300-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

34. [Petition of Jackie Tallon for Hannah Solar | 15-003386-COA | 222 East Gwinnett Street | Staff Approved - Solar Panels](#)

Attachment: [COA - 222 East Gwinnett Street 15-003386-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 222 East Gwinnett Street 15-003386-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

35. [Petition of Jackie Tallon for Hannah Solar | 15-003388-COA | 533 East Congress Street | Staff Approved - Solar Panels](#)

Attachment: [COA - 533 East Congress Street 15-003388-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet 533 East Congress Street 15-003388-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

36. [Petition of Jackie Tallon for Hannah Solar | 15-003389-COA | 15 West Perry Street | Staff Approved - Solar Panels](#)

Attachment: [COA - 15 West Perry Street 15-003389-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 15 West Perry Street 15-003389-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

37. [Amended Petition of Barry Moore for Zeno Moore Construction Co., Inc. | 15-003392-COA | 301 West River Street \(East Facade\) | Staff Approved - Brick Repointing](#)

Attachment: [COA - 301 West River Street 15-003392-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 301 West River Street 15-003392-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

38. [Petition of Neil Dawson for Dawson Architects | 15-003450-COA | 130 Habersham Street | Staff](#)

Approved - Gas Lanterns

Attachment: [COA - 130 Habersham Street 15-003450-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 130 Habersham Street 15-003450-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

39. Petition of Jimmy Sommers and Pat Canady | 15-003529-COA | 441 Montgomery Street | Staff Approved - Shutters

Attachment: [COA - 441 Montgomery Street 15-003529-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 441 Montgomery Street 15-003529-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

40. Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 15-003595-COA | 14 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Awning Recover

Attachment: [COA - 14 East Broughton Street 15-003595-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 14 East Broughton Street 15-003595-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Supplementary information.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

41. Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 15-003596-COA | 536 East Liberty Street | Staff Approved - Awnings

Attachment: [COA - 536 East Liberty Street 15-003596-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 536 East Liberty Street 15-003596-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

42. Petition of Scott Cook for Dawson Architects| 15-003615-COA |135 MLK Jr. Blvd | Staff Denied - Windows

Attachment: [COA - 135 MLK Jr. Blv. 15-003615-COA Denied.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 135 MLK Jr. Blvd 15-003615-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

43. Report on Work Performed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness

Attachment: [HDBR Michalak Work Without a COA 7-8-15.pdf](#)

Mr. Howington said the staff has given the Board a written report on the work performed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Notices

44. [HDBR Special Called Meeting | July 22, 2015 | 1:00 PM | 112 East State Street](#)
45. [Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting - Thursday, July 16, 2015 at 3:30 p.m. in the West Conference Room, MPC, 110 East State Street](#)
46. [Next Regular Meeting - Wednesday, August 12, 2015 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 E. State Street](#)

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

47. [Adjournment](#)

There being no further business to come before the Review Board, Mr. Howington adjourned the meeting at approximately 5:15 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen Harris
Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

EIH:mem