



CITY OF SAVANNAH

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Petitioner: Roy Maynard
MPC File No.: 24-002649-COA
Address: 1104 Montgomery Street
PIN: 20052 17001
Zoning: TN-1
Staff Reviewer: Jonathan Mellon
Date: May 22, 2024

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting approval for the rehabilitation and alterations to the building located at 1104 Montgomery Street, including the replacement of the storefront windows and doors, and roof.

Per the applicant:

“Replace existing storefront entry doors and windows with new 1” glazed bronze aluminum storefront as per rendering.

Stucco over existing stucco masonry walls and cap with new aluminum flashing.

Remove existing pitched roof and restore existing flat roof pitched to rear of building.

Cover with new TPO roof system as necessary.

Install new gutter system and downspout on rear of building.

Relocate existing HVAC equipment to roof.

Raise parapet wall on front and side elevation to provide screening of HVAC equipment on roof.”

CONTEXT/SURROUNDING AREA:

1104 Montgomery Street is a one-story masonry (stucco) building which was constructed in 1940 on a corner lot on the east side of Montgomery Street with frontage on West Park Avenue

and is a non-contributing resource within the National Register Victorian Historic District and the local Victorian Historic District. The existing design consists of vertical punched openings in a blank stucco façade topped by a hipped roof with two projecting signs above the entrances.



Staff Site Visit Photos – Confirmation of Posting; views of front (Montgomery Street) and side (West Park Avenue) elevations

FINDINGS:

The following standards from the Sec 7.11 - Streetcar Historic District Ordinance apply:

Visual Compatibility Criteria. *To maintain the special character of the Streetcar Historic District as identified in the architectural survey and visual analysis, new construction and any material change in appearance shall be consistent with the standards, criteria and guidelines developed for the district. The applicable criteria below shall be used to assess new construction and material changes. These criteria shall not be the basis for appeal to any board, commission or administrator described in this Ordinance, or to the Mayor and Aldermen.*

Height. *The overall height and the height of individual components of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

Width. *The proportion of the overall width and the width of individual components of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible to the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The height and width of this building are short and wide; however, this is an existing condition of this one-story building. No change is proposed to the footprint, with the only change proposed to the height consisting of the addition of a 3-foot-high parapet wall at the roof which would enhance the visual compatibility of the building.

Scale. *The overall scale and the scale of individual components of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible to the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The scale of this building is short and wide; however, this is an existing condition of this one-story building. No changes are proposed to the footprint, with the only change proposed to the scale consisting of the addition of a 3-foot-high parapet wall at the roof which would enhance the visual compatibility of the building.

***Setbacks.** The setbacks of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with setbacks of contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

No change is proposed to the footprint of the building.

***Rhythm of Building or Structure.** The relationship of a building or structure to the open space between it and adjacent buildings or structures shall be visually compatible with the open spaces between contributing buildings or structures to which it is visually related.*

No change is proposed to the footprint of the building.

***Openings.** The rhythm and solid-to-void ratio of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The proposed scope of work would include the removal of the vertical punched openings and the installation of horizontal storefronts that would result in a more visually compatible solid-to-void ratio.

***Projections.** Entrances, porches, and other projections of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

No change is proposed to the footprint of the building, including any projections.

***Materials.** The relationship of materials and textures of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The proposed material palette, including the use of stucco as the primary façade material, the installation of metal storefronts and glass doors, and installation of a metal cap, are visually compatible with the varied context that the building is located on that consists of contributing and non-contributing buildings along the Montgomery Street corridor.

***Roof Shapes.** The roof shape of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The existing building's roof shape is hipped, and the proposed scope of work would include the change to a flat roof which would be historically appropriate for a 1940 building and visually compatible.

Streetcar Historic District Design Standards.

New Construction, Additions, and Alterations. *The intent of these standards is to ensure appropriate new construction, additions, and alterations within the Streetcar Historic District. They are not intended to promote copies of the architectural designs of the past, but to encourage contemporary designs that protect and complement existing contributing resources. They are further intended to protect the historic integrity of the contributing resources.*

The following design standards shall apply to new construction, additions, alterations to contributing and non-contributing buildings and structures, and site alterations, unless otherwise specified. Though certain building materials are prescribed herein, the Commission may approve alternative materials that are not listed as prohibited upon a showing by the applicant that the material or product is visually compatible with historic building materials and has performed satisfactorily in the local climate.

Setbacks.

The front, rear, and side yard setbacks for the principal building shall be determined by the base zoning district.

The standard is met. No changes are proposed to the footprint of the building.

Height and Mass. *The intent of these standards is to ensure that the height and mass are in context with contributing buildings in the same or adjacent block faces.*

The height and mass shall be subdivided both horizontally and vertically to convey human scale and visual interest that reflects the traditional size of buildings.

The standard is met. The proposed scope of work would include the removal of the hipped roof and its replacement with a flat roof and three-foot-high parapet wall.

Foundation.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that foundations match the traditional pattern of construction in height and materials and complement the craftsmanship of contributing buildings.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Materials.

Slab-on-grade foundations shall be allowed where the slab has been built up to a minimum of 30 inches.

The standard is met. No changes are proposed to the foundation of the non-contributing building.

Exterior walls.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that exterior building walls reflect and complement the traditional materials and construction techniques of the district's architecture.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Permitted Materials: Brick, stone, wood, true stucco, concrete block, precast concrete panels, metal shingles and smooth fiber cement wood simulated horizontal lap siding.

Prohibited Materials: Vinyl siding, aluminum siding, rolled asphalt, EIFS, T-111, corrugated metal, and unpainted exposed CMU blocks.

The standards look to be met. The proposed scope of work includes the use of stucco and metal. Additional information should be provided on the proposed stucco to ensure that the definition of “true stucco” is met.

Windows and Storefronts.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that windows, shutters, and storefronts reinforce a sense of rhythm and continuity in architecture and enhance pedestrian activity at the street level.

Storefronts.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Materials.

Storefronts shall be constructed of wood, cast iron, Carrera glass, glass block, tile, aluminum, steel or copper as part of a glazed storefront system.

The standard is met. The storefront windows are proposed to be of metal.

Storefront bases shall consist of wood, bronze, glazed brick or tile.

Exterior burglar bars, fixed or roll-down security devices, or similar security devices shall not be permitted.

The standard does not look to be met. The proposed scope of work, as can be seen on the included rendering looks to include the use of stucco as the material for the storefront base. The applicant should revise the proposed material to meet the standard.

Configuration.

Storefront glazing shall be inset a minimum of four (4) inches from the face of the building; provided, however, that continuously glazed storefronts may be flush with the face of the building.

The standard looks to be met. The applicant should provide additional information on the proposed storefront configuration to ensure that the standard is met.

Storefront glazing shall be transparent; provided, however, opaque glass may be used in the storefront window transoms.

The standard is met.

Doors/Entrances.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that the placement of doors and entrances provides a sense of rhythm and continuity in architecture.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Materials.

Doors shall be made of glass, wood, clad wood or steel (without wood grain simulation).

Doors shall not have a decorative diamond or half-moon inset.

The standard is met. The proposed scope of work would include the installation of glass doors.

Roof.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that roof forms are designed to provide visual interest and coherence in a manner that is consistent with contributing resources.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Materials.

Roof coverings shall be standing seam metal, v-crimp, slate or equivalent synthetic, clay or concrete tile, or architectural asphalt or similar shingles.

Metal roofs shall have a metal drip edge covering all edges.

The standard is met. The proposed scope of work would include the removal of the existing hipped roof and its replacement with a flat membrane roof.

Configuration.

Where historically appropriate, flat roofs may be utilized.

The standard is met. The existing building's roof shape is hipped, and the proposed scope of work would change it to a flat roof which would be historically appropriate for a 1940 building.

Awnings. *The intent of these standards is to ensure that awnings provide cover for pedestrians and reinforce the rhythm of bays and primary entrances within facades.*

Awnings, Materials. *Awnings shall be constructed of canvas, cloth or equivalent, metal (though not corrugated), or glass.*

Awnings, Configuration.

A minimum of eight (8) feet vertical clearance shall be maintained above the public right-of-way.

Awnings shall be structurally and architecturally integrated into the façade and shall not obscure character-defining features.

Back-lit (internally lit) awnings shall be prohibited.

Awnings shall not connect two (2) facades.

The standards look to be met. The proposed scope of work does not include the installation of any awnings, but the included rendering shows two awnings located above the storefronts on the front (Montgomery Street) elevation. Additional information should be provided on the proposed awnings in order to ensure that the standards are met.

Mechanical Equipment and Refuse.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that mechanical equipment and refuse is appropriately sited to provide the least negative visual impact. In addition to the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.5, Screening and Buffers, mechanical equipment and refuse shall comply with the following:

Electrical vaults, meter boxes, communications devices, and satellite dishes shall be located on the secondary or rear façade and shall be minimally visible.

The standard is met. The existing meters are proposed to be retained on the rear (east) elevation.

Roof mounted equipment and HVAC units shall be screened from view from the street.

The standard is met. The mechanical equipment is proposed to be located on the flat roof and screened from view by the 3-foot-high parapet wall.

Refuse storage areas for dumpsters and compactors shall be located within a building or to the side of rear of the building and screened from the public right-of-way.

The standard is met. The refuse storage area is proposed to be located on the side (south) elevation and screened from view by the existing fence and gate.

Lighting.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that light fixtures have appropriate scale, are sited appropriately, are made of appropriate materials and complement the building on which they are located. In addition to the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.8, Lighting, lighting shall comply with the following:

Materials: Light fixtures shall be constructed of metal and/or glass.

Configuration: Light fixtures shall be compatible with the scale of the subject property and with the character of the district.

Source Type: White light source only.

The standard looks to be met. The proposed scope of work does not include the installation of any exterior lighting, but the included rendering shows two wall mounted fixtures located above

the storefronts on the front (Montgomery Street) elevation. Additional information should be provided on the proposed lighting in order to ensure that the standard is met.

Parking and Paving.

The intent of these standards is to create and protect contiguous, active pedestrian street fronts. In addition to the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.3, Off-Street Parking and Loading, parking and paving shall comply with the following:

New construction shall include a private sidewalk that connects the main entrance of the principal structure to the public sidewalk. Private sidewalks shall be constructed of brick, concrete, stone, or other materials as approved by the Planning Director.

Parking areas shall be located in the rear yard except for single- and two-family dwelling units which may also provide parking in the side yard behind the face of the front façade of the dwelling.

The standards are met. No changes are proposed to the site which presently does not have any off-street parking.

Fences and Walls.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that fences and walls define outdoor spaces appropriately, separate private and public realms and add architectural interest to a building's façade. In addition to compliance with the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.6, Fences and Walls, fences and walls shall also comply with the following standards:

Materials.

Permitted: Wood, iron, brick, stucco over concrete block, smooth fiber cement, or extruded aluminum.

Chain link may be permitted in the rear yard but not along any street. Plastic or metal slats used in chain link shall not be permitted.

Prohibited: Vinyl, PVC, and corrugated metal.

The standards are met. No new fencing or walls are proposed as part of the scope of the work.

Configuration.

Fences or walls no more than three (3) feet in height may be installed within the front yard.

The standard is not met. No new fencing or walls are proposed as part of the scope of the work.

Fences or walls no more than eight (8) feet in height may be installed within the side or rear yards behind the front façade of the building.

A minimum of five (5) feet must be provided between a fence and a building where they are parallel.

The standards are met. No new fencing or walls are proposed as part of the scope of the work.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the request for alterations to the property located at 1104 Montgomery Street with the following conditions because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Provide additional information on the proposed stucco to meet the definition of “true stucco”.**
- 2. Revise the proposed material for the storefront base to meet the standard.**
- 3. Provide additional information on the proposed size, design, and material of the proposed lighting.**
- 4. Provide additional information on the proposed size, design, and material of the proposed awnings.**
- 5. No signage is shown as being proposed as part of the scope of work. Any proposed signage should be submitted under a separate application.**

MW: JM

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic District Board of Review meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic District Board of Review at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.