

Historic Preservation Commission

Virtual Meeting March 19, 2020 10:00 A.M. Meeting Minutes

MARCH 19, 2020 HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Members Present: Karen Jarett, Interim Chair

Travis Coles
Dwayne Stephens

Staff Present: Leah G. Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation

Ryan Jarles, Cultural Resources Planner

Sandy Michel, Historic Preservation and Development Services Planner

Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner Sally Helm, Administrative Assistant Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. call to order and welcome

Ms. Jarrett called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. She outlined the role of the Historic Preservation Commission and explained that this is our first HPC Meeting and first Virtual Meeting. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will then present his/her comments. The public will make comments. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments. Then the HPC will make its decision.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

- 2. Petition of Shah Architecture | 20-000974-COA | 2207-2209 Barnard Street | Rehabilitation / Alterations & Additions
 - Staff Recommendation .pdf
 - Sanborn Maps.pdf
 - Drawings.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition for rehabilitation at 2207-2209 Barnard Street with the following conditions:

1. Omit the proposed new window at the second story at the north elevation of 2207.

- 2. Preserve the existing historic primary door at 2207.
- 3. Staff requests clarification regarding the condition and location intent of four windows existing at the rear as the documentation notes are insufficient to review the request for the alteration of the openings.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Second:

Travis Coles - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Abstain
Dwayne Stephens - Aye

- 3. Petition of Shah Architecture | 20-000977-COA | 1727 Whitaker Street | Alterations
 - @20-000977-COA Application.pdf
 - @ 20-000977-COA Checklist.pdf
 - @20-000977-COA Drawings.pdf
 - @20-000977-COA Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition for non-contributing demolition, alterations, and a new fence for the property located at 1727 Whitaker Street with the following condition because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that the wood porch materials are painted or stained.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion:

Second:

Travis Coles - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Abstain
Dwayne Stephens - Aye

- 4. Petition of Shah Architecture | 20-000980-COA | 1701 Whitaker Street | Alterations
 - @ 20-000980-COA Drawings

 - @ 20-000980-COA Checklist.pdf
 - @ 20-000980-COA Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition for the alterations to the 4-unit building located at 1701 Whitaker Street with the following condition because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that the proposed floor plans are revised to match the proposed elevation drawings prior to submitting drawings to staff to be stamped for permitting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion:

Second:

Travis Coles - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Abstain
Dwayne Stephens - Aye

- 5. Petition of Eco Friendly Contracting | 20-000988-COA | 311 W 39th Street | Alterations and Additions
 - @20-000988-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
 - Drawings.pdf
 - Photos of Existing Conditions.pdf
 - Sanborn Maps.pdf
 - Specifications.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition for rehabilitation of an addition to the duplex property located at 311 West 39th Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval with the permit drawings because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. For the addition stair: Balusters shall be placed between upper and lower rails, and the distances between balusters shall not exceed four (4) inches on center. The height of the railing shall not exceed 36 inches.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion:

Second:

Travis Coles - Aye

Karen Jarrett	- Abstain	
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye	

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

6. Adopt the March 19, 2020 Agenda

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve to adopt the March 19, 2020 Agenda.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Second:

Travis Coles - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Abstain
Dwayne Stephens - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

7. Approve the Orientation Meeting Minutes of February 24, 2020

Orientation Meeting Minutes February 24, 2020.docx

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the Orientation Meeting Minutes of February 24, 2020.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Travis Coles

Travis Coles - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Abstain
Dwayne Stephens - Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

8. Petition of Sawyer Design | 20-000491-COA | 551 and 553 East Gwinnett Street | New Construction Duplex with Variance Request

Ms. Leah Michalak, presented the petitioner's request,

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Travis Coles

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Travis Coles - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Abstain
Dwayne Stephens - Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

VICTORIAN DISTRICT

- 9. Petition of Shah Architecture | 20-000982-COA | 116 East Henry Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) with Variance Request
 - @ 20-000982-COA Drawings.pdf

 - @ 20-000982-COA Sanborn.pdf
 - 20-000982-COA Recommendation.pdf
 - Ms. Charlene Galley and Mr. Bryan Lehnen were present on behalf of the petition.
 - **Mr. Ryan Jarles** gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for New Construction Parts I and II for a 2-story carriage house at the rear of 116 East Henry Street. In addition, the applicant is requesting variances for the reduction to the required side yard setbacks and rear yard setback; the west side yard setback is proposed to be reduced from 5'-0" to 3'-11", the east side yard setback is proposed to be reduced from 5'-0" to 3'-4 ½", and the rear yard setback is proposed to be reduced from 3'-0" to a zero-foot setback.
 - **Mr. Jarles** stated that on November 4, 2019 staff became aware of the demolition of the existing lane building at 116 East Henry Street as well as becoming aware that a stop work order had been issued to the property owner. On December 20, 2019 staff received an application for alterations to the existing lane dwelling. The existing lane dwelling that was partially demolished is a non-conforming structure that does not adhere to the current setback standards. Staff requested that the applicant take the project to first be reviewed by the City of Savannah's Building Plan Review to determine whether the project would be required to be reviewed as New Construction and would therefore be required to meet all current standards for setbacks.
 - **Mr. Jarles** said that on February 20, 2020 the project was reviewed by The City of Savannah's Building Plan Review where the determination was made that the project would be required to be reviewed as New Construction.
 - **Mr. Jarles** reported that staff recommends approval for New Construction Parts I and II for a 2-story carriage house at the rear of 116 East Henry Street with the following conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:
 - 1. Revise the drawings to include windows over a minimum of 30 percent of the ground floor façade.
 - 2. Ensure that the faux shutters remaining in the design include a center rail.
 - **Mr. Jarles** additionally reported that staff recommends approval for the variances as requested because the proposed variances meet the variance criteria. He entertained questions from the Board. Board did not have questions.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Galley stated that they were in agreement with staff recommendations. They are prepared to make the changes as recommended by staff.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was in agreement with the staff recommendation. They also were in agreement for approval of the variances.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition for New Construction Parts I and II for a 2-story carriage house at the rear of 116 East Henry Street with the following conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the drawings to include windows over a minimum of 30 percent of the ground floor facade.
- 2. Ensure that the faux shutters remaining in the design include a center rail.

Approval for the variances as requested because the variance criteria are met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion:

Second:

Travis Coles - Aye

Karen Jarrett - Abstain

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

STREETCAR DISTRICT

10. Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 20-000985-COA | 208 West 40th Street | Rehabilitation/Alterations, New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) Garage with Variance Request

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Description.pdf
- Material Specifications.pdf
- Drawings.pdf
- Mr. Josh Ward was present on behalf of the petition.
- **Ms. Alyson Smith** gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval to restore the contributing residential building at 208 West 40th Street and to construct a new garage. The site does not have access to a lane. The applicant is also requesting a variance for a 4-foot reduction of the 5-foot side and rear yard setbacks for the new garage. A brick ribbon strip driveway is proposed from the street to the garage.
- **Ms. Smith** explained that the Historic Savannah Foundation holds an easement on the property. The property was one of HSF's revolving fund sites. The rehabilitation is a tax credit project.
- **Ms. Smith** reported that staff recommends to continue the petition for 208 West 40th Street so that the following items can be addressed and redesigned:
 - 1. Relocate the garage to meet setback standards.
 - 2. Omit the porch on the garage to create a more visually compatible design or relocate the porch so that it's not visible from the street.
 - 3. Redesign the pitch of the front facing gable at the garage to meet the roof pitch standards.
 - 4. Provide a specification for the mortar repair.
- **Ms. Smith** additionally reported that staff recommends denial of the variance request from the side and rear yard setback to allow 1-foot setbacks because the variance criteria have not been met. She entertained questions from the Board.
- Mr. Coles asked staff that if the variance was not done and the garage shifted inward, would this satisfy the view

issue? If the five foot setback was observed, would this move the porch out of view from the street?

Ms. Smith answered that possibly this would resolve the issue.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Ward said based on staff's recommendation, they are willing to work with staff to resolve the garage component. However, they want to see, though, if it is possible today to get approval for the renovations to be made to the main house and continue the garage issue.

Ms. Jarrett asked staff if the application is tied together with the two requests.

Ms. Smith answered that the petitioner and she talked about this after the recommendation was made. Staff does not have a problem with just approving the rehabilitation work of the main structure as they did not have concerns with that part. She stated, therefore, Staff feels comfortable with recommending that the rehabilitation of the main building be approved with the condition that a mortar specification be submitted. Ms. Smith stated additionally staff would recommend that the garage be continued with the other conditions as outlined in staff's report.

Ms. Jarrett wanted to know if the HPC approved the petition with the conditions that were listed including the denial of the variance, could this be worked out without having to bring this back before the Board?

Ms. Smith answered that she believes the HPC would still need to see the design of the garage. Therefore, she feels the garage would need to be continued so that the HPC would be able to review the garage aspect.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Ryan Arvay of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] thanked the HPC for separating the two items so that they will be able to get started on the rehabilitation portion of the project. Mr. Arvay stated that as staff has indicated, the HSF has an easement on this property. The owner has a timeline that has to be adhered to. He explained that the HSF's Architectural Review Committee approved the application as a whole, although some members did share some of the concerns as the MPC staff regarding the garage. Therefore, the HSF is happy to continue working with the petitioner and the owner on refining the design of the garage.

Mr. Stephens asked the petitioner to clarify whether his request for the garage was solely for the petitioner to be able to drive into the garage.

Mr. Ward answered yes, but also they want to be able to maximize the rest of the property in the back. He and the owner did not feel that it was necessary to have the five feet setback around the building as far as the circulation and backing up. They were trying to get the garage pushed back as far as they could. He said in looking at the neighbors' backyards, the five foot setback is being met by all the other properties. Mr. Ward believes they can accommodate the driveway concern by moving it over, but they will work this out with staff.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was in agreement with approving the rehabilitation of the main house as recommended by staff for the petitioner to provide a specification for the mortar repair. They discussed that the portion of the petition for the new construction of the garage be continued so that the requested items by staff can be addressed and redefined by the petitioner.

The Board discussed the variances. Ms. Smith believes that because of the items requested for the garage, the variances are no longer needed.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the rehabilitation work to the single-family building at 208 West 40th Street with the following condition:

1. Provide a specification for the mortar repair.

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby continue the petition for the new construction of the garage at 208 West 40th Street so that the following items can be addressed and redesigned:

- 1. Relocate the garage to meet setback standards.
- 2. Omit the porch on the garage to create a more visually compatible design or relocate the porch so that it's not visible from the street.
- 3. Redesign the pitch of the front facing gable at the garage to meet the roof pitch standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Second:

Travis Coles - Aye

Karen Jarrett - Abstain

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

- 11. Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 20-000970-COA | 217 West 33rd Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)
 - Application PACKET, 217 West 33rd St, 20-000970-COA.pdf
 - Historic Map-Savannah, Ga. 1916, Volume 2, Sheet 125.png
 - 20-000970-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
 - Mr. Josh Ward was present on behalf of the petition.
 - **Ms. Sandy Michel** gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for a New Construction (Small) Parts I and II for the property located at 217 West 33rd Street.
 - **Ms. Michel** reported that staff recommends approval, for a New Construction (Small), Parts I and II for the property located at 217 West 33rd Street with the following conditions because the project is otherwise visually compatible, and the standards are met:
 - 1. Increase the building height to be visually compatible with adjacent contributing buildings;
 - 2. Revise the stoop on the east facade to meet the setback requirements or reapply to the Historic Preservation Commission for a setback variance;
 - 3. Apply for a parking variance to the Zoning Boards of Appeals;
 - 4. Indicate the location of the mechanical equipment, electrical meter, and refuse storage on the drawings;
 - 5. Clarify which windows will be used (Ply Gem or Marvin);
 - 6. Revise the shake siding within the peak to horizontal lap siding.
 - 7. Add a private sidewalk from the main building to the public sidewalk.
 - Ms. Michel entertained questions from the Board.
 - Mr. Stephens asked if a context elevation was submitted.
 - Ms. Michel answered yes. She showed the context elevation to the Board.
 - **Mr. Stephens** commented that he was curious about the shake siding detail within the gable. He believes where the gable is located might create an awkward condition of carrying it on with some more siding. Perhaps, the Board could ask that the petitioner address this concern by bringing this condition back to staff.
 - Ms. Michel stated that the shake siding concern could be addressed to the petitioner.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Ward stated that they agree with staff recommendations. They are prepared to work with staff and provide necessary data and clarify the items that need clarification. He explained that regarding the shake in the gable, they feel they could make this work with possibly another lap siding and a different exposure variation.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ryan Arvay of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] stated that he shares Mr. Stephens concern on the gable ends. He believes the shake material provides some texture. He believes further that continuing the siding in this area might not look the best, therefore, he encourages the Board to reconsider this relative to the staff's recommendation. If it was going to be treated with a wood stain, he might not feel this way, but if it was painted the same color as the house, it could work as there is a historic precedent for that type of treatment, maybe not on this street, but certainly in this adjacent neighborhood.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Stephens explained that relative to Mr. Arvay's point, he agrees that the shake adds some visual differentiation and character. However, in the immediate context he does not believe that the shake is the right approach. Therefore, he still holds firmly on his position of continuing the lap siding and Mr. Ward has already said he is willing to address this and come up with some type of resolution for this space. Mr. Stephens stated that he is confident that staff can come to a conclusion with this.

The Board agreed with the staff recommendations. Pertaining to the shake siding, the Board approved that a solution be agreed upon by staff and petitioner.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Commission does hereby approve the petition for a New Construction [small], Parts I and II for the property located at 217 West 33rd Street with the following conditions because the project is otherwise visually compatible, and the standards are met:

- 1. Increase the building height to be visually compatible with adjacent contributing buildings;
- 2. Revise the stoop on the east facade to meet the setback requirements or reapply to the Historic Preservation Commission for a setback variance;
- 3. Apply for a parking variance to the Zoning Board of Appeals;
- 4. Indicate the location of the mechanical equipment, electrical meter, and refuse storage on the drawings;
- 5. Clarify which window will be used (Ply Gem or Marvin);
- 6. Revise the shake siding within the peak;
- 7. Add a private sidewalk from the main building to the public sidewalk.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion:

Second:

Travis Coles - Aye

Karen Jarrett - Abstain

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

12. Petition of Rayfield Reeves | 19-007197-COA | 1903 & 1905 Whitaker Street | Staff Approved - New Construction

COA - 1903 & 1905 Whitaker Street 19-007197-COA.pdf

photos, 1903 & 1905 & 1907 Whitaker St, 19-007199-COA.pdf

Staff approved. No action required.

13. Petition of Rayfield Reeves | 19-007199-COA | 1907 Whitaker Street | Staff Approved - New Construction

Staff approved. No action required.

- 14. Petition of Kevin Rose | 20-000002-COA | 9 West 43rd Street [11 W. 43rd Street] | Staff Approved Alterations and Additions
 - COA 9 West 43rd Street 20-000002-COA.pdf
 - Checklist, Photos, Drawings, 11 W. 43rd St. 20-000002-COA.pdf

Staff approved. No action required.

- 15. Petition of Ryan Hagan | 20-000343-COA | 309 East 37th Street | Staff Approved Historic Metal Roof
 - @COA-20-000343-309 East 37th Street.pdf

Staff approved. No action required.

- 16. Amended Petition of Kate Williams | 20-000346-COA | 415 East Waldburg Street | Staff Approved Amendment to the fence and gate
 - COA-20-00346 415 East Waldburg Street.pdf
 - **SUMMARY REQUEST.docx**

Staff approved. No action required.

- 17. Petition of Michael Johnson | 20-000430-COA | 2211 Barnard Street | Staff Approved Rehabilitation
 - @COA 20-000430 402 W 41st.pdf

Staff approved. No action required.

- 18. Petition of Ray Hoover for Your Exterior Pros | 20-000453-COA | 811 Lincoln Street | Staff Approved Roof Repair/Replace
 - COA 811 Lincoln Street 20-000453-COA.pdf

Staff approved. No action required.

- 19. Petition of LaJuana Hendrix | 20-000561-COA | 638 Wet 40th Street | Staff Approved Replace Existing Fence
 - COA 638 West 40th Street 20-000561-COA.pdf

Staff approved. No action required.

- 20. Petition of Parker Morgan | 20-000567-COA | 111 East 34th Street | Staff Approved Awnings
 - @COA 111 East 34th Street 20-000567-COA.pdf
 - Photos, drawings, 111 E. 34th St 20-000567-COA.pdf

Staff approved. No action required.

- 21. Amended Petition of Lat Purser and Associates | 20-000740-COA | 17 East 31st Street and 1512 Bull Street | Staff Approved Amendment to New Construction
 - Ø 20-000740-COA Staff Decision.doc

Staff approved. No action required.

- XI. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
- XII. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

22. Next Regular Meeting - Tuesday, April 7, 2020 at 10:00 a.m. Virtual Meeting

23. Adjourned

There being no further business to come before the HPC, Ms. Jarrett adjourned the meeting at 10:55 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Leah G. Michalak, Director Historic Preservation

LGM:mem

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.