

**CITY OF SAVANNAH
HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW
REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

PETITIONER: Tim Kinsey
421 East Bolton Street
Savannah, GA 31401

FILE NUMBER: H-120621-4699-2

ADDRESS: 544 East Harris Street

PIN: 2-0014-13-021

ZONING: RIP-A (residential, medium density)

DATE: August 8, 2012

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting approval for new construction, Part II Design Details, of a two-story carriage house at 544 East Harris Street. The accessory structure is proposed at the rear of the property and will provide two garage openings off of the lane. The existing wood fence on the east and west property lines will remain.

FINDINGS:

The two and one-half story detached residence at 544 East Harris Street was approved in April 2004 (File No. H-03-3141-2) and constructed the same year. It is not a rated structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District. Neighboring properties on either side are not historic, including the carriage houses along the lane. Part 1 Height and Mass was approved by the Historic District Board of Review on July 11, 2012.

The following Part II Design Standards from the Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of Savannah zoning ordinance apply:

Standard	Proposed	Comments
<p>Relationship of materials, texture and color. <i>The relationship of materials, texture and color of the façade of a structure shall be visually compatible with the predominate materials, textures, and colors used on contributing structures to which the structure is Visually Related.</i></p>	<p>Hardi-plank siding to match the main residence for style and detailing.</p> <p>Trim to match the main residence for style and detailing.</p>	<p>The standard is met.</p> <p>Staff recommends the use of wood or fiber cement trim. Proposed drawings do not indicate trim materials, sizes, or profiles. This must be provided to staff for review prior to final approval. See comments below for “Exterior walls” with regard to Hardi-plank finish.</p>

Standard	Proposed	Comments
<p>Design standards. <i>...the Board may approve alternative materials that are not listed as prohibited upon a showing by the applicant that the material or product is visually compatible with historic building materials and has performed satisfactorily in the local climate.</i></p>	<p>All paint colors and roof color are matched to the main residence. Siding: Sherwin Williams, Captivating Cream, SW 6659 Trim: Sherwin Williams, Pure White, SW 7005 Shutters: Sherwin Williams, Bohemian Black, SW 6988 Standing Seam Roof: McElroy Metals, Surrey Beige Doors and Windows: Factory white</p> <p>Three (3) light fixtures are proposed – one on each side of the courtyard entry doors and one to the side of the lane entry door. “Barn Light” Arlington wall sconce, 600 Bronze, Item Number: WH8-PC</p>	<p>The standard is met.</p> <p>The standard is met.</p>
<p>Materials. <i>Permitted: Doors shall be made of wood, clad wood, glass or steel.</i></p>	<p>The three foot wide by seven foot high (3’x7’) entry door at the lane entrance is to be steel.</p> <p>The six foot wide by seven foot high (6’x7’) French doors at the courtyard entrance are to be wood clad.</p> <p>The eight foot wide by seven foot tall (8’x7’) garage doors at the lane entrance are to be aluminum.</p>	<p>The standard is met.</p> <p>The standard is met. The drawing of the courtyard elevation does not reflect the design of the door shown the specification packet. The drawing must be revised for final approval.</p> <p>The standard is met. The drawing of the lane elevation does not reflect the design of the doors shown in the specification packet. A final drawing showing the number of panels and windows must be submitted for final approval.</p>

Standard	Proposed	Comments
<p>Exterior walls. <i>Wood siding is permitted on row houses only in wards where wood-sided row houses already exist.</i></p> <p><i>Where wood siding has been determined to be appropriate, smooth finish fiber cement siding may be used on new residential construction.</i></p>	<p>Select Cedar Mill finish seven and one-quarter inch (7¼”) hardi-plank siding with six inch (6”) exposure.</p>	<p>Smooth finish hardi-plank siding instead of the specified Select Cedar Mill finish must be used and must match the main residence’s plank siding exposure dimension.</p>
<p>Windows. <i>Windows facing a street shall be double or triple hung, awning, casement of Palladian.</i></p> <p><i>Double glazed (simulated divided light) windows are permitted on non-historic facades and on new construction, provided that the muntin is no wider than 7/8 inch, the muntin profile simulates traditional putty glazing, the lower sash is wider than the meeting and top rails and extrusions are covered with appropriate molding.</i></p> <p><i>The centerline of window and door openings shall align vertically on the primary façade.</i></p> <p><i>All windows facing a street...shall be rectangular and shall have a vertical to horizontal ratio of not less than 5:3.</i></p> <p><i>In new construction, windows shall be constructed of wood, wood clad, or metal. Solid vinyl windows shall be prohibited.</i></p>	<p>New windows facing both the lane and the courtyard are to be six-over-six double-hung wood PVC clad with permanent exterior and interior muntins with spacer bar to be made by Andersen – 400 Series.</p>	<p>The standard is met.</p> <p>Windows must maintain 7/8 inch or less simulated putty muntins. Submit a window section detail to Staff.</p> <p>The standard is met.</p> <p>The standard is met.</p> <p>The standard is met.</p>

Standard	Proposed	Comments
<p>Shutters. <i>Shutters shall be hinged and operable and sized to fit the window opening. The placement of the horizontal rail shall correspond to the location of the meeting rail of the window.</i></p> <p><i>Shutters shall be constructed of durable wood.</i></p>	<p>Louvered custom wood shutters are proposed at the windows on the courtyard elevation.</p> <p>All shutters are to be painted wood with “DOGS” iron hardware, painted black, hinged, and sized to fit the opening.</p> <p>One false window with wood casing trim and fixed shutters in the closed position is proposed for the elevation facing the courtyard.</p>	<p>Staff recommends that all shutters be removed, including the entire false window. Although the false window was a recommendation from the Part 1 approval to satisfy the solids and voids standard, now that design details have been provided, staff believes that it will be more compatible with the other visually related structures if shutters were not present. None of the visually related structures have shutters.</p>
<p>Roofs. <i>Gable roof pitches shall be between 4:12 and 8:12.</i></p> <p><i>Roofs shall be covered with standing seam metal, slate, tile or asphalt shingles.</i></p>	<p>The proposed side gable roof features a 6:12 pitch and will be surfaced with a “McElroy Metals” metal standing seam roof.</p>	<p>The standards are met. Provide a cut sheet showing the panel width and seam profile / height.</p>
<p>Parking Areas. <i>Access to parking shall be from lanes or north-south service streets.</i></p> <p>Lanes and carriage houses. <i>Sloped aprons to garages and carriage houses shall not be erected on the public right-of-way.</i></p>	<p>Two (2) garage door lane entrances are proposed with a three foot deep by 18 foot wide (3’x18’) concrete pad sloping to the lane.</p>	<p>The standards are met. The concrete apron will not be within the public right-of-way because of the three foot (3’) setback.</p>
<p>Service Areas, Utilities and Mechanical Systems. <i>Electrical vaults, meter boxes, and communications devices shall be located on secondary and rear facades and shall be minimally visible from view.</i></p> <p><i>HVAC units shall be screened from the public right-of-way.</i></p> <p><i>Refuse storage areas shall be located within a building or shall be screened from the public right-of-way.</i></p>	<p>The electrical meter box is located on the lane elevation of the proposed carriage house between the entry door and a garage door.</p> <p>The HVAC units are located in the north corner of the interior courtyard, on the ground and will be screened by existing wood privacy fences bordering both sides of the property.</p>	<p>The standard is met.</p> <p>The standard is met.</p> <p>There is not a refuse storage area indicated on the drawings.</p>

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approval for Part II Design Details of the proposed carriage house because it meets the applicable standards and visual compatibility factors with the following conditions submitted to Staff for final approval:

- 1. Exterior walls to be smooth finish hardi-plank siding instead of the specified Select Cedar Mill finish and match the main residence's plank siding exposure dimension.**
- 2. Revise drawings and specifications to include trim materials, sizes, and profiles. Also include French door design, garage door design (number and size of panels and windows), and metal roof detail.**
- 3. Windows must maintain 7/8 inch or less simulated putty muntins. Submit a window section detail to Staff.**
- 4. Revise drawings and specifications to remove all shutters and the false window.**
- 5. Confirm location of the intended storage area for refuse.**

SPW: lgm